
Substantive Religiosity among Adolescents: A Comparison between Junior High School and Madrasah Tsanawiyah in Bandung

Tya Shofarina M. Nur^{1*}, Aceng Kosasih², Saepul Anwar³, Nur Fatimah⁴

^{1,2,3} Department of Islamic Religious Education, Indonesian University of Education, Indonesia

⁴ UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, Indonesia

Article Info

Article history:

Received: February 23, 2025

Revised: July 15, 2025

Accepted: December 30, 2025

Keywords:

Substantive Religiosity, Adolescents, Junior High School, Madrasah Tsanawiyah, Islamic Education

ABSTRACT

The decline of substantive religiosity among adolescents is an important issue in religious education, considering its impact on character formation and morality. This study aims to analyze and compare the level of substantive religiosity across four types of secondary schools in Bandung: State Junior High School, Private Junior High School, State Tsanawiyah Madrasah, and Private Tsanawiyah Madrasah. Data were analyzed using the one-way ANOVA test and the Tukey HSD post hoc test. The results showed significant differences in substantive religiosity between types of schools, $F(3,438)=10.04$, $p = 0,001$. Post hoc tests confirmed that Private Tsanawiyah Madrasah students showed significantly higher substantive religiosity than students in other schools. The biggest difference is seen in the ritualistic dimension, followed by the consequential dimension, while the ideological dimension shows minimal differences between schools. Although the structure and type of school influence substantive religiosity, particularly ritual practices, the gap between knowledge and behavior remains small in all schools. This indicates that external factors, such as family support, peer influence, and social media, are significant in shaping religious values into actual behaviors. This research emphasizes the importance of a holistic and collaborative approach involving family, peers, and community in developing substantive religiosity in adolescents.

© M. Nur *et.al* (2025)



This is an open-access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license

Correspondence Address:

tyashofarina@upi.edu

Please cite this article in APA Style as:

M. Nur, T. S., Kosasih, A., Anwar, S., & Fatimah, N. (2025). Substantive religiosity among adolescents: A comparison between junior high school and Madrasah Tsanawiyah in Bandung. *Mimbar Agama dan Budaya*, 42(2), (340-356). [https://doi.org/ 10.15408/mimbar.v42i2.47244](https://doi.org/10.15408/mimbar.v42i2.47244)

1. INTRODUCTION

Religiosity refers to an individual's understanding of God's existence and to obedience to uphold established rules to avoid His prohibitions. A person's religiosity will be reflected in various aspects of life. This aspect is an important issue that needs to be studied in the context of education in the city of Bandung, a big city with a diversity of educational institutions, ranging from public schools, private schools, public madrasas, to private madrasas (Jalaluddin, 2012). In the context of Bandung, students' religiosity does not only involve a relationship with God through worship, but also interaction with fellow creatures through muamalah in daily life. Therefore, students' behavior must always be in harmony with God's commands and prohibitions to achieve His pleasure, especially in the school environment, which is a forum for the formation of the main character in adolescence.

Adolescent religiosity is a phenomenon that can develop in every individual. A person can have a very high level of religiosity (continually developing) but a low level (not developing). At first, this attitude of religiosity may align with the parents' (innate). However, through interactions with the school environment and peers, their religious knowledge and behavior will develop over time. However, religious individualism can weaken when a person faces less-than-ideal circumstances. Some religions can be necessary to overcome oneself and negative influences (Nur Atikah, 2022).

Religiosity is important in young people's lives because it can influence their emotions, perceptions, attitudes, and behaviors. Religious beliefs, laws, and obligations influence a person's condition, understanding, and attitude toward a particular religion. This can undermine faith, piety, and morality contrary to daily religious teachings (Nur Atikah, 2022).

Educating the younger generation through the educational process is difficult. One organization cannot complete this process alone, so it requires extensive teamwork. The general public, the government, and the media must always work together to support the younger generation with strong religious beliefs (Hitami Salim, 2013).

Religiosity is a complex and multidimensional concept encompassing beliefs, practices, experiences, knowledge, and consequences (Glock & Stark, 1965). Glock and Stark define religiosity through five dimensions: (1) the dimension of belief, which measures the extent to which a person accepts and believes in the teachings of his or her religion; (2) the dimension of practice, which looks at the extent to which individuals carry out their religious rituals; (3) the experiential dimension, which assesses the extent to which individuals experience religious experiences; (4) the dimension of knowledge, which measures the extent to which an individual understands the teachings of his religion; and (5) the dimension of consequences, which assesses the extent to which individuals apply religious teachings in daily life (Ancok et al., 2000).

Although Glock and Stark's (1965) theory identifies five dimensions of religiosity — Beliefs, Practices, Experiences, Knowledge, and Consequences—the substantive meaning of religiosity in this study is defined as three dimensions integrated into students' lives: faith, worship, and morals. The dimension of faith is a derivative of the ideological dimension and part of the experience dimension, which refers to students' beliefs and appreciation of Islamic teachings (Spiegler et al., 2025). The dimension of worship is derived from Glock and Stark's ritualistic dimension, which measures student involvement in religious practices such as prayer, fasting, and other forms of worship. The moral dimension is a derivative of the consequential

dimension and part of the experiential dimension, which measures how students apply Islamic values in ethical behavior and daily social interactions as the core of substantive religiosity for adolescent character development (Rodriguez, 2025). Thus, these three dimensions constitute the core of substantive religiosity, which is measurable and relevant to the educational context of adolescents.

In education, student religiosity in high school is an important area of study, given that adolescence is a critical period for the formation of spiritual identity and values. During this time, adolescents undergo a process of identity formation, including their religious beliefs and values. The development of religiosity in adolescence is influenced by internal factors, such as the individual's psychological maturity, and external factors, such as the family, peers, and school environment (Erikson, 1986; King & Boyatzis, 2004; Santrock, 2014).

Religiosity values are important in forming students' character and behavior in the school environment. The school is responsible not only for developing students' intellectual intelligence but also their spiritual and emotional intelligence. Instilling religious values in school can help students build a strong moral foundation, increase self-awareness, and develop a positive personality (Nugroho, 2019; Ramli, 2020).

In recent decades, there has been a worrying phenomenon related to the decline of religiosity among adolescents, including in the school environment. Research shows a significant decline in adolescents' religious commitment, belief, and practice. Factors such as the influence of globalization, technological developments, and societal shifting values may contribute to this condition. This situation is a concern for educators and stakeholders because religiosity plays an important role in the formation of students' character and behavior. Intense religiosity can help students have a more positive attitude, appreciate differences, and avoid deviant behavior. Therefore, an in-depth analysis is needed regarding the level of religiosity of students in secondary schools, especially in the city of Bandung (Hidayati, 2021; Akbar, 2022; Saranani, 2018).

A decline in substantive religiosity among junior high school students involving 200 junior high school students in West Java showed that although 69% of junior high school students had a high level of religiosity in the ideological dimension (beliefs and rituals), their involvement in substantive practice showed a significant gap, with only 60.5% showing a high level of tolerance, a figure lower than their religious knowledge. This phenomenon is reinforced by findings from research at SMP Negeri 29 Bandung and MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis (2025), which showed that 28% of junior high school students have experienced unpleasant treatment or bullying from peers, indicating that high religious knowledge has not translated into adequate moral practices and social empathy (Rahmat et al., 2025). Thus, the decline in substantive religiosity among junior high school students is not just an assumption but a measurable reality that reveals a significant gap between ideological religiosity (high knowledge and belief) and substantive religiosity (the practice of values in life and social interaction, which remains weak). This difference is the main focus of this study.

In recent years, Indonesia has recorded various cases of violence and crimes involving teenagers. This phenomenon indicates a shift in values and norms among the younger generation, which may be caused by factors such as a lack of parental supervision, the adverse influence of the peer environment, and excessive exposure to harmful digital content. A tragic example of this problem is the recent case in Ujungberung, Bandung, where a teenager died after being abused by two of his schoolmates. This incident reminds us of the importance of strengthening character

education and providing more intensive coaching to the younger generation to grow into responsible individuals and appreciate human values (Warsudi, 2024).

This phenomenon is interesting to investigate. As a country with a majority Muslim population, Indonesia has an education system consisting of public schools and religious-based schools, such as madrassas and Islamic boarding schools. However, not all public schools place the same emphasis on religious aspects in the curriculum and school life. This condition can affect a student's substantial level of religiosity, i.e., how far they understand, live, and practice religious teachings in daily life (Glock & Strong, 1965).

The importance of conducting a comparative study between students in four types of secondary schools in Bandung. The differences in characteristics and curriculum emphasis in these two schools can affect students' substantial level of religiosity (Sujoko, 2021). Public schools tend to focus more on academic development (Bandung City Education Office, 2022). This difference in approach may impact the teaching of religious values in each school.

This study aims to analyze students' substantial level of religiosity in SMPN 13, Ar-Rafi Junior High School, MTsN 2, and MTs YPPS. It aims to understand the factors that affect students' substantial level of religiosity in the secondary school environment and their impact on the development of religious curricula and programs in schools.

Theoretically, this research is expected to enrich the understanding of substantive religiosity and the factors that influence it, especially in Indonesia's education context. Practically, the results of this research can be used as a reference for schools, the government, and other stakeholders in designing and implementing religious education programs that are more in accordance with the needs and characteristics of students.

2. METHODS

This study uses a quantitative, cross-sectional comparative design to examine the levels of substantive religiosity among students in four types of secondary schools in the city of Bandung. The research population is all 9th-grade students at SMPN 13, Ar-Rafi Junior High School, MTsN 2, and MTs YPPS, totaling 806 students. Ninth-grade students were selected as study participants because they had completed nearly 3 years of education in their respective school environments, providing sufficient time for school-related factors to influence their religiosity. At this developmental stage, adolescents have attained formal operational cognitive development, enabling a more nuanced and mature understanding of religious concepts and their personal religiosity. This cognitive maturity, combined with extended exposure to the school environment, allows for more accurate measurement of how institutional structure and culture shape substantive religiosity (Spiegler et al., 2025). The sampling technique used was proportionate stratified random sampling with the number of samples calculated using the Slovin formula (5% margin of error), resulting in a final sample of 442 students consisting of: MTs YPPS (n=82), MTsN 2 (n=120), Ar-Rafi Junior High School (n=35), and SMPN 13 (n=205).

The research instrument used a substantive religiosity questionnaire developed based on the theory of Glock and Stark (1965), adapted for the Indonesian Islamic context, consisting of 51 statement items with a 4-point Likert scale that measured three dimensions: ideological, ritualistic, and consequential. This concept is in line with the understanding that religiosity includes cognitive aspects (beliefs), behaviors (worship practices), and the implementation of

values in social life that have different influences on adolescents' wellbeing (Isnaini et al., 2025; Souza et al., 2024), Ali et al., 2023; K et al., 2024; Pamuji & Mulyadi, 2024). The validity of the instrument was tested through expert judgment by three experts in Islamic religious education and Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) with the result of a factor loading of all items > 0.40, while reliability measured using Cronbach's Alpha yielded coefficients: ideological ($\alpha=0.91$), ritualistic ($\alpha=0.89$), consequential($\alpha=0.87$), and overall reliability ($\alpha=0.94$), indicating very high internal consistency.

Data collection is carried out face-to-face in each school after obtaining permission and approval from the principal of each school, taking into account the principles of research ethics, including informed consent, confidentiality, and anonymity (Souza et al., 2024; Ulum et al., 2025). Data analysis using SPSS version 31 with stages: (1) descriptive analysis to calculate mean, standard deviation, and frequency distribution; (2) the assumption test includes the normality test (Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro-Wilk) and the variance homogeneity test (Levene's test); (3) inferential analysis using One-Way ANOVA to test the difference in mean substantive religiosity between the four groups of schools with a significance level of $\alpha=0.05$; and (4) post hoc tests using Tukey HSD to identify significantly different group pairs (Idris, 2023; Woolley et al., 2024; Yosef, 2022).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Results

Of the total 442 students who were study respondents, the distribution by gender showed 52.4% (n=231) of women and 47.6% (n=211) of men. The age range of respondents was 14-16 years with an average of 15.2 years (SD=0.7).

Table 1. *Descriptive Statistics of Substantive Religiosity Levels Per School*

School	N	Mean	SD	Min	Max	95%CI Lower	95%CI Upper
MTs YPPS	82	155,52	8,46	132	173	153,67	157,38
MTsN 2 Bandung	120	149,69	10,07	130	175	147,87	151,51
Ar-Rafi Junior High School	35	148,60	9,10	132	165	145,47	151,73
SMPN 13	205	148,74	10,20	118	170	147,34	150,15
Total	442	150,25	10,08	118	175	149,30	151,19

Source: Results of research data analysis through SPSS version 31

Table 1 shows descriptive statistics of substantive religiosity levels per school. Overall, the average of the total substantive religiosity score of the sample was 150.25 (SD=10.08) out of a maximum score of 204, which was classified as high (Souza et al., 2024)

The results showed that MTs YPPS Sukamiskin had the highest average score of substantive religiosity (M=155,52; SD=8,46), followed by MTsN 2 Bandung (M=149,69; SD=10,07), SMPN 13 Bandung (M=148,74; SD=10,20), and Ar-Rafi' Drajat Junior High School (M=148,60; SD=9,10). A relatively small standard deviation in MTs YPPS indicated a higher level of homogeneity in religiosity than in other schools. At the same time, greater variation was seen in SMPN 13, reflecting the heterogeneity of students' religious backgrounds in public

schools, in line with the findings of comparative research between madrasahs and public schools in other studies (Pamuji & I lmed, 2023; Pampuji & Mulyadi, 2024).

The score range shows that all schools have students with levels of religiosity ranging from low to very high. However, MTs YPPS has the highest minimum score, indicating that no students in those private madrasahs have low religiosity. In contrast, Ar-Rafi' Drajat Junior High School had the lowest minimum score, indicating a small percentage of students with relatively low levels of religiosity, which may be related to the diversity of family backgrounds and exposure to different values in public schools.

Before conducting the ANOVA test, a series of assumption tests was performed to ensure the data met the requirements of parametric analysis. The normality test results showed that the data distributions in all school groups were normal ($p > .05$) for both the Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro-Wilk tests, thus meeting the normality assumptions for the ANOVA analysis. Significance values above 0,05 indicate that the data are well described by the theoretical normal distribution (Ali et al., 2023; Squirt et al., 2024).

Table 2. Results of the Variance Homogeneity Test (Levene's Test)

Test Based On	Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Mean	1.128	3	438	.338

*Note: Sig. > .05 indicates homogeneous variance

The Levene's test for homogeneity of variances showed a p-value of .338 ($p > .05$), indicating that the variance in substantive religiosity scores across school groups was homogeneous. This satisfies the homogeneity assumptions required for ANOVA analysis, so the interpretation of the F-test results would be valid (Idris, 2023; Ulum et al., 2025; Yosef, 2022).

Table 3 presents the results of a one-way ANOVA to examine differences in substantive religiosity levels across the four school types.

Table 3. ANOVA One-Way Test Results of Substantive Religiosity

Source of Variation	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Between Groups	2880,38	3	960,13	10,04	0,001
Within Groups	41887,74	438	95,63		
Total	44768,12	441			

*Note: $p < .05$ (significant)

The ANOVA results showed $F(3, 438) = 10.04, p = 0,001$, indicating a very statistically significant difference in the level of substantive religiosity across the four types of schools. The effect size, calculated as eta squared (η^2), was 0.064, indicating that school type differences explain 6.4% of the variance in substantive religiosity. Although the eta squared value is classified

as a medium effect size, the difference remains significant, given that many other factors affect adolescent religiosity, such as family, peers, and media (Yosef, 2022; Hartanto et al., 2025).

A post hoc test using Tukey's HSD was performed to identify which group pairs differed significantly (Cook et al., 2024; Komalasari & Jacob, 2023; Mu'minah, 2016).

Table 4. *Post Hoc Test Tukey HSD Comparison Between Schools*

Group (I)	Group (J)	Mean Difference (I-J)	Std. Error	Sig.	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper
MTs YPPS	MTsN 2	5,83*	1,40	.001	2,22	9,45
MTs YPPS	Ar-Rafi Junior High School	6,92*	1,97	.003	1,83	12,02
MTs YPPS	SMPN 13	6,78*	1,28	.000	3,49	10,08
MTsN 2	Ar-Rafi Junior High School	1,09	1,88	.938	-3,75	5,94
MTsN 2	SMPN 13	0,95	1,12	.833	-1,95	3,85
Ar-Rafi Junior High School	SMPN 13	-0,14	1,79	1.000	-4,75	4,47

*Note: *The mean difference is significant at the level of 0.05*

The post hoc test reveals interesting and informative patterns of difference to understand the dynamics of religiosity in different types of schools. MTs YPPS Sukamiskin has a significantly higher substantive religiosity score than the other three schools: the difference with MTsN 2 is 5,83 points ($p = 0,001$), with Ar-Rafi' Junior High School is 6,92 points ($p = 0,003$), and with SMPN 13 is 6,78 points ($p = 0,001$) (Yosef, 2022). This indicates that private madrassas have an advantage in shaping students' substantive religiosity, likely due to a stricter student selection system, a more religiously homogeneous school culture, and a higher intensity of religious programs, in line with research findings on the influence of faith-based schooling on character and value formation (Aggarwal et al., 2023; Souza et al., 2024).

Interestingly, there was no significant difference between MTsN 2 and SMP Ar-Rafi' ($p=.938$) or SMPN 13 ($p=.833$), as well as between SMP Ar-Rafi' and SMPN 13 ($p=1,000$). These findings show that although state madrassas have more intensive religious programs than junior high schools, the heterogeneity of student backgrounds in state madrassas (which admit students from different economic and family religiosity levels) means that average religiosity does not differ significantly from that in public schools. In contrast, Islamic-based private junior high

schools (Ar-Rafi' Drajat) can achieve a level of religiosity equivalent to state madrasas, demonstrating the effectiveness of religious coaching programs in private schools with greater flexibility in designing religious curricula and activities.

Descriptive Analysis Per Dimension of Religiosity

For a deeper understanding, a descriptive analysis was carried out per each dimension of religiosity in each type of school

Table 5. Average Score Per Dimension of Religiosity per School

School	Ideological Dimension	Ritualistic Dimension	Consequential Dimensions	Total
	Mean (SD)	Mean (SD)	Mean (SD)	Mean (SD)
MTs YPPS	54,2 (2,8)	52,3 (3,4)	49,0 (3,6)	155,5 (8,5)
MTsN 2	52,8 (3,2)	49,6 (4,1)	47,3 (4,2)	149,7 (10,1)
Ar-Rafi Junior High School	52,1 (3,0)	49,2 (3,8)	47,3 (3,9)	148,6 (9,1)
SMPN 13	52,3 (3,4)	49,1 (4,3)	47,4 (4,1)	148,7 (10,2)

Source: Results of SPSS research data analysis version 31

Analysis per dimension shows a consistent pattern in which MTs YPPS excels across all dimensions of religiosity. On the ideological dimension (belief), all schools showed relatively high scores with not too significant differences, indicating that the aspect of belief or faith was a relatively stable foundation, regardless of the type of school. This can be explained by the fact that belief in the pillars of faith is the basic teaching of Islam that students have acquired since childhood through family and social environments, not only from school, in line with the understanding of the role of multiple contexts in the religious socialization of children and adolescents (Aggarwal et al., 2023; Souza et al., 2024).

The ritualistic dimension (worship practice) showed a greater difference, with YPPS MTs having the highest score (M=52,3; SD=3,4), which differs significantly from the other three schools that have relatively equivalent scores (M≈49). This difference reflects the strong influence of the school environment on the practice of religious rituals, where private madrasas have a more consistent culture of worship habits, such as mandatory congregational prayers, routine tadarus, and monitoring the implementation of student worship, supporting the findings on the importance of organizational religiosity and religious practices in the formation of adolescent religious behavior. (Kerasha and to the ., 2024; Komalasari & Jacob , 2023; Zhang et al., 2025)

The consequential dimension (practice of grades) shows the lowest scores in all schools, with moderate variation between schools. MTs YPPS remained superior (M=49,0; SD=3,6), while the other three schools had almost the same score (M≈47,3). The low score on the

consequential dimension indicates that implementing Islamic values in social behavior and daily morals remains the greatest challenge in fostering adolescent substantive religiosity (Ali et al., 2023; Munawir, 2024). The gap between belief and knowledge (ideological) and practice (consequential) reflects a common phenomenon in character education where the transformation from knowing to doing requires a more complex process and consistent environmental support, in line with research on character building and moral education that emphasizes the importance of experiential learning and modelling (Idris, 2023; Kurniawan & Fitriyani, 2023; Madum & Daimah, 2024).

3.2 Discussion

The main findings of this study confirm the hypothesis that there are significant differences in students' substantive religiosity across the four types of junior high schools in Bandung. The ANOVA results showed $F(3, 438)=10.04$, $p<.001$, indicating that the difference is highly statistically significant and not due to chance. The sequence pattern found—MTs YPPS > MTsN 2 \approx SMP Ar-Rafi' \approx SMPN 13—showed that private madrassas had an advantage in shaping students' substantive religiosity, while public madrassas and public schools (both public and private) had relatively balanced levels of religiosity.

The results of the Tukey HSD post hoc test revealed a pattern, namely, only MTs YPPS showed significant differences from the other three schools. At the same time, MTsN 2, SMP Ar-Rafi', and SMPN 13 were not statistically significantly different from each other. These findings raise the question: What are the reasons for the superiority of substantive religiosity in MTs YPPS? To answer this question, it is necessary to conduct a more in-depth analysis of the data per dimension in Table 6.

First, it can be reviewed from the dimension of faith (ideological), MTs YPPS achieved an average score of 54,2 (SD=2,8), slightly higher than MTsN 2 (M=52,8; SD=3,2), Ar-Rafi' Junior High School (M=52,1; SD=3,4), and SMPN 13 (M=52,6; SD=3,0). Although the difference in average is relatively small, an interesting aspect is that the score variability in MTs YPPS is much lower (SD=2,8 versus 3,0-3,4 in other schools). This shows that MTs YPPS students have a relatively homogeneous dimension of faith, reflecting similar family backgrounds in terms of religious commitment (Hartanto et al., 2025; Spiegler et al., 2025). The admissions selection system in private madrasas, which considers not only academic achievement but also the religious motivation of prospective students and their family backgrounds, results in a student body with a consistent religious base. This compositional effect creates a strong environment in strengthening religious beliefs, where Islamic values are not only taught but also practiced in daily life by the majority of the school community (Nurdin et al., 2024).

The most substantial difference is seen in the ritualistic dimension (the practice of worship). MTs YPPS showed an average score of 52.3 (SD=3,4), while MTsN 2 reached 49,6 (SD=4,1), Ar-Rafi' Junior High School 49,1 (SD=4,3), and SMPN 13 49,3 (SD=3,9). This average difference of approximately 3 points is not just a statistical number but reflects fundamental structural and cultural differences in how each school facilitates students' worship practices (Isnaini et al., 2025; Khofifah et al., 2025). On the other hand, MTsN 2, even though it is a state madrasah with a structured religious program, must accommodate the diversity of students from various religious and socioeconomic backgrounds (Masitah et al., 2024). This means ritual programs cannot be as intensive as in private madrassas without ignoring the principle of inclusion (Souza et al., 2024).

Meanwhile, other schools (SMP Ar-Rafi' and SMPN 13) face additional challenges in the form of a commitment to value pluralism, so that religious programs are designed to be more flexible and non-coercive, respecting the choices of students from different religions or backgrounds (Azzahra & Ampuni, 2022). This difference suggests that ritual intensity does not depend solely on the quality of religious teaching, but also on organizational structures, school policies, and institutional cultures that either allow or limit the performance of worship.

The consequential dimension showed a difference of 1,6 points between MTs YPPS (M=49,0) and other schools (M=47,3-47,4). This difference is smaller than the ritualistic dimension, which reaches 3 points, whereas the consequential dimension should be a tangible manifestation of the internalization of values. This gap shows that school alone is not enough; external factors such as family, peers, and social media environment greatly influence whether students really apply religious values in their daily lives (Masitah et al., 2024; Shodiq, 2024).

However, the fact that YPPS MTs achieved the highest consequential scores indicates something important: their habituation models and first-hand experience were effective in enhancing the application of religious values. Research on character formation shows that when schools implement hands-on, experiential strategies rather than just knowledge transfer, students are better able to internalize and apply those values (Rodriguez, 2025). Although the knowing-vs-doing gap remains, the advantages of MTs YPPS indicate that repeated experiences and reflection in real contexts are more effective than conventional lecture methods.

These findings imply that, to narrow the knowing-vs-doing gap, a strategy is needed that incorporates: First, the intensification of hands-on experiential programs in schools that have proven effective in YPPS MTs. Second, the consistency of support from the student's family and social environment, because research shows that without consistency in the three ecosystems, namely schools, families, and peer groups, the internalization of values will remain limited to behavior in the school environment only (Masitah et al., 2024).

The substantive religiosity of MTs YPPS cannot be attributed to a single factor, but rather to a synergistic interaction between three elements: (1)the selective composition of students results in a strong and homogeneous faith base; (2)school structures and policies that support the intensity of worship rituals; and (3)a consistent institutional culture in implementing moral norms. These three elements reinforce each other, creating an educational ecosystem conducive to the development of substantive religiosity. In contrast, other schools, despite having good religious programs, operate in a more pluralistic context, so they must balance religious values with the principles of social inclusion.

In contrast, public madrassas offer intensive religious programs; they must serve students from diverse socioeconomic backgrounds and varying levels of family religiosity, given their status as open public schools. This heterogeneity challenges the formation of a homogeneous religious culture, so the average religiosity does not differ significantly from that of other public schools. Similarly, public schools that must accommodate the diversity of religions and backgrounds of students cannot implement overly strict standards of religiosity, although PAI programs are still delivered according to the national curriculum (Pampuji & Mulyadi, 2024; Kavadias et al., 2024; Niemelä et al., 2025)

An interesting finding is that Islamic-based private junior high schools (Ar-Rafi' Drajat) can achieve a level of religiosity comparable to that of state madrasas. This indicates that the quality and intensity of religious development programs are evaluated based on the number of

lessons and that this determines the effectiveness of religious education. Private schools have greater flexibility in designing curriculum, developing religious extracurricular programs, and creating a religious school culture without being bound by too rigid rules (Idris, 2023; Mu'minah, 2016). This aligns with research on character building and religious-based character education, which emphasizes the importance of a comprehensive approach and school culture in shaping one's religious character (Souza et al., 2024; Ulum et al., 2025).

Implications

Analyzing each dimension of religiosity reveals a pattern that is very informative for developing Islamic religious education. The ideological dimension (belief) shows high consistency in all schools, suggesting that the cognitive aspects of religiosity (understanding and acceptance of religious doctrines) are relatively well formed regardless of the type of school. This aligns with the theory of cognitive development, which suggests that adolescents at the formal operational stage can understand concepts of divinity and religious teachings (Aggarwal et al., 2023).

The high score on the ideological dimension can also be explained by the cultural context in Indonesia, which is predominantly Muslim, where teachings related to the foundations of Islam, such as the pillars of faith, have been embedded through various sources: family, society, media, and formal education from an early age. Even in public schools, PAI subjects that are taught at least 3 hours per week have provided a basic understanding of Islamic beliefs (Isnaini et al., 2025; Yosef, 2022). The high consistency in the ideological dimension shows that the foundation of faith is the most stable and unchangeable part of religiosity due to the influence of the school environment in the short term, supporting the understanding of religious salience as a relatively stable disposition (Komalasari & Jacob, 2023; Zhang et al., 2025).

The dimension of fiqh (worship practice) shows a greater difference between schools, with private madrasahs significantly superior. This suggests that the school's environment and culture heavily influence religious practices. Madrasahs with worship infrastructure, congregational prayer schedules, tadarus programs, and a religious atmosphere significantly encourage students to be more consistent in performing religious rituals (Ali et al., 2023; Anshori, 2017). These findings align with the theory of planned behavior, which shows that behavioral intention and actual behavior are influenced by attitude, subjective norms, and perceived behavioral control (Squirt et al., 2024). In madrasahs, these three factors support ritual practices: a positive attitude towards worship is strengthened through intensive learning, strong subjective norms due to the expectations of the school environment and peers, and high perceived behavioral control due to the availability of facilities and structural support (Idris, 2023; Kerasha et al., 2024)

The dimension of grade practice shows the lowest scores and moderate differences between schools. This shows that applying religious values in daily life remains the main challenge in fostering genuine religiosity. This distinction between knowledge and behavior illustrates that turning understanding into action takes time, is complex, and requires consistent environmental support (Isnaini et al., 2025; Madum & Daimah, 2024; Rodriguez, 2025).

Low scores in the dimension of practicing grades can be caused by several things, including: First, the complex social context: the application of religious values in social interactions tends to be more difficult than private worship because it is influenced by peers, different social norms, and moral situations that are not always clear in their direction. Second, limited experiential learning: religious education in schools still emphasizes knowledge rather

than offering many opportunities to practice religious values daily. Third, environmental inconsistency: the values taught in school are sometimes not aligned with those applied at home, in society, or in the media, confusing students' attitudes.

These findings greatly influence the development of PAI's curriculum and pedagogy. Religious education is not enough to focus only on knowledge transfer and belief formation; it must also emphasize experiential learning and character formation through real social practice. Approaches such as project-based learning, community service, moral dilemma discussion, and peer mentoring are more effective in encouraging the internalization of values and implementation in daily life, in line with the concept of powerful knowledge in religious education, which emphasizes the development of the ability to think about ethics, values, and life questions (Niemelä et al., 2025; Rodríguez, 2025; Souza et al., 2024; Ulum et al., 2025)

The policy implications of this study's findings are very concrete and directly tied to the ANOVA results. Each dimension of religiosity shows a different pattern of differences, indicating that different factors also need to be intervened.

The ritualistic dimension of ANOVA showed the greatest difference (3 points: 52,3 vs 49,1-49,6). Data shows that MTs YPPS excels due to structural factors, not just teaching hours. Concrete policies that can be implemented are: state madrasas and public schools need to adapt their school schedules to accommodate Dzuhur and Asr prayers in congregation by placing breaks at those prayer times. The MTs YPPS model shows that schedule commitment is more important than lecture intensity. For example, not only is there a prayer room, but breaks are arranged so that all students can pray in congregation without rushing, and attendance in congregational prayers is part of the attitude assessment. This implementation requires coordination with the national curriculum, not just the initiative of PAI teachers.

In the ideological dimension where the difference is minimal (1-2 points: 52,1-52,8 vs 54,2), this suggests that religious knowledge is already conveyed equally to all students through the standard national curriculum. The focus should not be on the quantity of hours, but on different learning methods. Necessary interventions: schools should shift strategies from traditional lectures to affective-based learning through group discussions about the moral dilemmas faced by adolescents, role-playing ethical situations in daily life, or service-learning projects that provide hands-on experience in applying religious values. The minimal differences in the ideological dimension between all schools prove that cognitive-only methods do not make a significant difference.

At the consequential dimension, where the difference is the least (1,6 points: 49.0 vs 47,3-47,4), a generic parenting program or family involvement is not enough. The data show that MTs YPPS have an advantage in this dimension due to the homogeneity of students (Hartanto et al., 2025). Therefore, the implementation policy for public schools is to facilitate the formation of homogeneous peer groups that adhere to religious norms. Concretely, schools need to support strong Islamic study groups or religious forums at the school level, so that students with strong religious commitments can join and reinforce each other's religious values, rather than being isolated among peers who are neutral or even antisocial. This homogeneous peer group model is more effective than massive parenting programs in increasing the consequential dimension, as peer influence on adolescents is stronger than parental or teacher influence (Azzahra & Ampuni, 2022; Spiegler et al., 2025).

LIMITATION

This study has several limitations that need to be recognized and considered in the interpretation of the findings: (1) Limitation of generalisability: the study only involved four schools in the city of Bandung, so generalization to the broader context needs to be done carefully; (2) Cross-sectional design: does not allow an understanding of the developmental trajectory of religiosity over time, even though longitudinal research shows that adolescent religious development is dynamic (Idris, 2023; Spiegler et al., 2025); (3) common method bias; It is a significant concern because all religiosity data is collected through one standard method, namely the self-report questionnaire. Religiosity is a very socially desirable construct in the context of religious Indonesian culture, so respondents tend to give answers that show their religiosity in a positive light, either because they want to give a good impression to researchers or teachers or because they are afraid of being judged poorly by educational institutions (Ulum et al., 2025). The 3-point difference in the ritualistic dimension may not fully reflect actual behavioral differences, but it also reflects differences in response bias; (4) External factors: many other factors influencing religiosity (family, peers, media) were not statistically controlled in this study (Souza et al., 2024; Zhang et al., 2025); (5) Limitation of statistical power: there is a considerable difference in the number of respondents between schools. This difference reflects the unbalanced variation in population size in the field, so it is methodologically reasonable. Although ANOVA tests remain valid across different sample sizes, this inequality can reduce the statistical power of small groups in detecting significant differences (Field, 2013). Therefore, the results of comparisons between schools need to be interpreted carefully, taking these differences into account.

IMPLIMITATION

Several recommendations are put forward for future research in order to obtain a more comprehensive picture of adolescent substantive religiosity. First, the use of mixed methods that integrate actual behavioral observation and in-depth interviews is strongly recommended to separate genuinely internalized religiosity from a purely response to social desirability bias. Second, longitudinal research designs can more accurately capture the developmental trajectory of adolescent religiosity, allowing researchers to understand how religiosity develops and changes during adolescence in relation to other developmental factors. Third, research with more balanced group samples or more careful stratification will increase the statistical power of the analysis and provide more valid comparisons between schools. Fourth, cross-geographical collaboration, namely not only in Bandung but also in other cities with different sociocultural characteristics, is needed to improve the generalizability of findings on differences in religiosity between public schools and religious schools.

CONCLUSION

This study found a significant difference in the level of substantive religiosity among students attending four types of secondary schools in the city of Bandung ($F(3, 438) = 10.04; p = 0,001$). Private Tsanawiyah madrasas (MTs YPPS Sukamiskin) showed the highest levels of substantive religiosity, while state madrasas, public public schools, and private public schools had relatively equal levels. These differences reflect the influence of the school environment, the

student selection system, the intensity of religious programs, and the consistency between school values and family values.

Analysis by dimension showed that the ideological dimension (belief) was relatively consistent across all schools, whereas the ritualistic dimension (worship practice) showed greater variation, particularly in superior private madrasas. In contrast, the consequential dimension (value practice) had the lowest scores across all schools and posed the greatest challenge to the formation of adolescent substantive religiosity. The gap between knowledge and practice shows the need to transform the religious education approach from knowledge transmission to value internalization through experiential learning and character building.

The findings of this study provide strategic implications for developing more effective Islamic religious education policies and programs: improving the quality and intensity of PAI learning; creating a religious school culture; developing a varied extracurricular program; strengthening school-family partnerships; and integrating more experiential and contextual pedagogical approaches. Follow-up research with a longitudinal design, broader samples, and mixed-methods approaches is recommended to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the dynamics of adolescent religiosity in Indonesian Islamic education.

REFERENCES

- Aggarwal, S., Wright, J., Morgan, A., Patton, G., & Reavley, N. (2023). Religiosity and spirituality in the prevention and management of depression and anxiety in young people: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Psychiatry*, 23(1), 729. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12888-023-05091-2>
- Akbar, M. (2022). Gejala Krisis Religiusitas pada Generasi Milenial. *Jurnal Sosiologi Agama*, 15(1), 45–60.
- Ali, N., Umar, M., & Mopolio, A. Z. (2023). Academic Resilience and Religiosity Among College Students Facing Post-Pandemic Learning. *IJORER: International Journal of Recent Educational Research*, 4(5), 585–596. <https://doi.org/10.46245/ijorer.v4i5.410>
- Ancok, D., Ardani, S., & Suroso, M. F. N. (2000). *Psikologi Islami: Solusi Islam atas Problem-problem Psikologi* (Muh. S. Ardani, Ed.; 3rd ed.). Pustaka Pelajar.
- Azzahra, F. A., & Ampuni, S. (2022). Prosocial intentions towards religious ingroup and outgroup members among adolescents from public and religious schools. *Indigenous: Jurnal Ilmiah Psikologi*, 6(3), 73–91. <https://doi.org/10.23917/indigenous.v6i3.15401>
- Cook, T. J., Powers, J., & Kim, J. (2024). Providing Specialized Preparation for Counselors in Catholic Schools. *Cities and the Environment*, 27(1). <https://doi.org/10.15365/joce.2701012024>
- Dinas Pendidikan Kota Bandung. (2022). *Profil Sekolah Menengah di Kota Bandung*. Dinas Pendidikan Kota Bandung.
- Erikson, E. H. (1986). *Identity: Youth and crisis*. W. W. Norton & Company.
- Field, A. (2013). *Discovering Statistics Using IBM SPSS Statistics* (4th ed.). Sage. <https://books.google.co.id/books?id=srb0a9fmMEoC&printsec=frontcover&hl=id#v=onepage&q&f=false>
- Glock, C. Y., & Stark, R. (1965). *Religion and society in tension*. IL: Rand McNally.
- Hartanto, D., Zakaria, G. A. N., Fauziah, M., Supriyanto, S., Rizal, Y., & Nugraha, A. (2025). Family Quality as a Foundation for Adolescent Religiosity and Mental Health. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.25217/0020258555100>
- Hidayati, F. (2021). Menurunnya Religiusitas Remaja: Tantangan bagi Pendidikan Agama. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(2), 123–138.

- Hitami Salim, Moh. (2013). *Pendidikan Agama dalam Keluarga (Revitalisasi Peran Keluarga dalam Membangun Generasi Bangsa yang Berkarakter)*. Ar Ruzz Media.
- Huda, S., Ridwanulloh, M. U., Aulia, A. K., & Prasetyo, A. E. (2024). Leadership Strategy: Implementation of Religious-Based Character Education Through Multicultural Learning After the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Psikis: Jurnal Psikologi Islami*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.19109/psikis.v10i1.16033>
- Idris, M. (2023). The Role of Character Development in Islamic Religious Education: An Islamic Values-Based Approach at one of the MAN Schools in South Sulawesi. *West Science Interdisciplinary Studies*, 1(08), 621–629. <https://doi.org/10.58812/wsis.v1i08.187>
- Isnaini, N., Suhandi, S., & Pradana, S. A. (2025). Dynamics of Muslim Adolescent Aggression: The Relationship Between Religiosity and Aggression and Peer Religion as Moderator. *ANFUSINA: Journal of Psychology*, 8(1), 13. <https://doi.org/10.24042/ajp.v8i1.26888>
- Jalaluddin. (2010). *Psikologi Agama*. PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Jalaluddin. (2012). *Psikologi Agama*. PT Raja Gravindo Persada.
- K, M., Rahim, A., Ismawati, I., & Mutmainna, F. (2024). Islamic Religious Education in Student Character Development. *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education*, 8(1), 236. <https://doi.org/10.35723/ajie.v8i1.475>
- Kavadias, L., Spruyt, B., & Kuppens, T. (2024). Religious life in a schooled society? A global study of the relationship between schooling and religiosity in 76 countries. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, 65(3), 247–270. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00207152231177238>
- Kerasha, K., Balkaya-Ince, M., & Schnitker, S. A. (2024). Many facets of religiosity and regulatory virtues: Exploring the links between multiple dimensions of religiosity with self-control and patience among Muslim-American adolescents. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*, 10, 101117. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2024.101117>
- King, P. E., & Boyatzis, C. J. (2004). *Exploring adolescent spiritual and religious development: Current and future theoretical and empirical perspectives*. Applied Developmental Science (1st ed., Vol. 8). Applied Developmental Science.
- Komalasari, M., & Yakubu, A. B. (2023). Implementation of Student Character Formation Through Islamic Religious Education. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal*, 2(1), 52–64. <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v2i1.16>
- Kurniawan, S., & Fitriyani, F. N. (2023). Al-Tadzkiyyah: Thomas Lickona's Idea on Character Education Which Builds Multicultural Awareness: Its Relevance for School/Madrasah in Indonesia. *Al-Tadzkiyyah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24042/atjpi.v14i1.15820>
- Madum, M., & Daimah, D. (2024). CHARACTER BUILDING THROUGH ISLAMIC EDUCATION: NURTURING THE INDONESIAN NATION'S VALUES. *LISAN AL-HAL: Jurnal Pengembangan Pemikiran Dan Kebudayaan*, 18(1), 59–71. <https://doi.org/10.35316/lisanalhal.v18i1.59-71>
- Masitah, W., Alsa, A., Partino, P., & Madjid, Abd. (2024). Exploring Religiosity as Mediator of The Association Between Democratic Parenting, Peer Support, and Self-Concept Among Adolescent Moral Literacy. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 436–457. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v7i2.5060>
- Mu'minah, N. (2016). CHARACTER BUILDING DALAM KONSEP PENDIDIKAN IMAM ZARKASYI DITINJAU DARI FILSAFAT MORAL IBNU MISKAWAIH. *Jurnal Filsafat*, 25(1), 100. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jf.12616>
- Munawir, K., Rahim, A., Ismawati, I., & Mutmainna, F. (2024). Islamic Religious Education in Student Character Development. *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education*, 8(1), 236. <https://doi.org/10.35723/ajie.v8i1.475>

- Niemelä, M. A., Niemi, K., Salmenkivi, E., & Stones, A. (2025). Powers of knowledge in secondary religious education curricula of Sweden, England, and Finland. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 57(4), 422–440. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2025.2476941>
- Nugroho, A. (2019). *Peran Sekolah dalam Pembentukan Karakter Peserta Didik*. Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan (1st ed., Vol. 20).
- Nur Atikah, A. (2022). *RELIGIUSITAS SISWA SMP PGRI TUMBRASANOM KEDUNGADEM BOJONEGORO*. UNIVERSITAS NAHDLATUL ULAMA SUNAN GIRI.
- Nurdin, A., Hendra, Khozin, Haris, A., Zainab, N., & Yahaya, M. Z. (2024). Developing the Islamic Religious Education Curriculum in Inclusive Schools or Madrasah and Its Implementation: A Systematic Literature Review. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 21(1), 94–110. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v21i1.6907>
- Pamuji, S., & Limei, S. (2023). The Managerial Competence Of The Madrasa Head in Improving Teacher Professionalism and Performance at Mi Al-Maarif Bojongsari, Cilacap District. *Pengabdian: Jurnal Abdimas*, 1(2), 66–74. <https://doi.org/10.55849/abdimas.v1i2.158>
- Pamuji, S., & Mulyadi, Y. (2024). Formation Of Students' Character Through Islamic Education. *International Journal of Islamic Thought and Humanities*, 3(1), 26–35. <https://doi.org/10.54298/ijith.v3i1.183>
- Purwadi, & Chatijah, S. (2007). Hubungan Antara Religiusitas Dengan Sikap Konsumtif Remaja. *Humanitas: Jurnal Psikologi Indonesia*, 4(2), 117.
- Rahmat, M., Supriadi, U., Fakhruddin, A., Surahman, C., Taufiq Abdillah, H., & Nurjanah, N. (2025). Religiosity and Interfaith Tolerance Among Students in Indonesian Islamic and General Junior Secondary Schools. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 11(1), 115–132. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v11i1.44660>
- Ramli, R. (2020). *Pengaruh Religiusitas terhadap Perilaku Positif Siswa*. Jurnal Bimbingan Konseling (2nd ed., Vol. 12).
- Rodriguez, M. C. (2025). How can a spiritual pedagogy in religious education contribute to children's spiritual growth? *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2025.2450436>
- Santrock, J. W. (2014). *Adolescence* (16th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.
- Saranani, F. (2018). Religiusitas dan Perilaku Remaja. *Jurnal Sosiologi Agama*, 9(1), 45–60.
- Sarip, H., Munajim, A., Sukarnoto, T., Asro'i, A., Sugiyatno, A., & Nasikhin, M. M. (2023). Enhancing Student Moral Development Through Character Education Management Based on Religious Culture in Special Education Schools: A Case Study in Cirebon, Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 12(1), 125–134. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2023.121.125-134>
- Shodiq, S. F. (2024). The Role of Religious Education in Cultivating Emotional Intelligence and Resilience Among Students in Diverse Communities. *Jurnal Pendidikan Progresif*, 14(3), 1770–1783. <https://doi.org/10.23960/jpp.v14.i3.2024120>
- Souza, M. T. de, Araújo, L. C., Silva, A. E., Trotte, L. A. C., & Gesteira, E. C. R. (2024). Spirituality and religiosity in children, adolescents and their families in a vulnerable context: a scoping review. *Revista Brasileira de Enfermagem*, 77(5). <https://doi.org/10.1590/0034-7167-2023-0425>
- Spiegler, O., Jonsson, J. O., & Bracegirdle, C. (2025). Religious development from adolescence to early adulthood among Muslim and Christian youth in Germany: A person-oriented approach. *Child Development*, 96(1), 141–160. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.14151>
- Sujoko, A. (2021). Perbedaan Karakteristik Sekolah Umum dan Kejuruan. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 15(2), 123–134.
- Ulum, M. N., Sunarto, S., Baharudin, B., Hijriyah, U., Susanti, A., & Shabira, Q. (2025). Mapping of Religious Moderation Literature in Higher Education: A Bibliometric Review. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v17i1.6695>

- Warsudi, Agus. (2024). *Remaja di Bandung Tewas Dianiaya Teman Sekolah, Motif Diselidiki Polisi* Artikel ini telah diterbitkan di halaman *SINDOnews.com* pada Kamis, 16 Mei 2024 - 13:15 WIB oleh Agus Warsudi dengan judul “Remaja di Bandung Tewas Dianiaya Teman Sekolah, Motif Diselidiki Polisi.” *Sindonews.Com*.
- Yosef, Y. (2022). A Comparative Study Between Islamic and Public High Schools on Multicultural Self-Efficacy. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 5(1), 56–70. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v5i1.2591>
- Zhang, S., Lefmann, T., Lim, Y., Robbins, C. S., & Zhang, L. (2025). Religiosity’s Links to Adolescent Wellbeing and the Role of Supportive Networks and Sex. *Youth & Society*, 57(6), 907–929. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X241273363>