E-ISSN: 2962 - 8199 P-ISSN: 2961 - 7502



# MUSLIM **ENGLISH** LITERATURE

Vol 3, Number 1

2024

Published by English Literature Department Faculty of Adab and Humanities Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta Indonesia



Jl. Tarumanegara, Pisangan, Ciputat, Tangerang Selatan, Banten 15419







Vol 3, Number 1, 2024

E-ISSN: 2962 - 8199 P-ISSN: 2961 - 7502

# EDITORIAL TEAM OF MUSLIM ENGLISH LITERATURE

Vol 3, Number 1, 2024

**Editor-in-Chief** 

Hasnul Insani Djohar

## **Managing Editor**

Fauziyyah Imma R.

### **Editors**

Tuty Handayani Elve Oktafiyani Alfi Syahriyani Nina Farlina Akhmad Zakky

### **International Editorial Board**

Peter Morey
Danielle Haque
Doaa Omran
Önder Çakirtaş
Carimo Mohamed

## Design Graphic and Layouter

Nafisanda Reno Naufal Zakiya Ramadian Hamzah Muslim English Literature is a double-blind peer-reviewed open access journal published by the English Literature Department, Faculty of Adab and Humanities, Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta. It specializes in Muslim World Literature including US-Muslim, British-Muslim, Asian-Muslim, and other Muslim cultures and literature; and is intended to communicate original research and current issues on the subject. This journal warmly welcomes contributions from scholars of related disciplines, including Linguistics and Cultural Studies related to the Muslim world.

### Editorial Office:

Muslim English Literature, English Literature Department, Faculty of Adab and Humanities, Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University of Jakarta. Jl. Tarumanegara, Pisangan, Ciputat, Tangerang Selatan, Banten 15419.

E-mail: journal.mel@uinjkt.ac.id

Website: https://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/mel/index

E-ISSN: 2962 - 8199 P-ISSN: 2961 - 7502

# MUSLIM ENGLISH LITERATURE VOL. 3, Number 1, 2024

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

01	Re-identifying Muslimah Identity in Sabeeha Rehman's Threading My Prayer Rug Diksha Bhagat, Anupama Vohra (University of Jammu, India)
15	The Influence of Cultural Pluralism on Women's Leadership Discourse: A Socio-Cognitive Analysis: Selected Models Asmaa Muhammad Othman Elzieny (Al-Azhar University, Egypt)
29	Combating the War on Terror in Kamila Shamsie's Home Fire (2017)  Hasnul Insani Djohar, Iin Dwi Jayanti (UIN Syarif Hidayatullah, Indonesia)  Nada Tayem (Indiana University of Pennsylvania, USA)
46	The Imagined Community in Bankim Chatterjee's The Abbey of Bliss  Md. Nuruddin Pier Shihab (R. P. Shaha University, Bangladesh)
62	Muslimah Indonesian's Hybridity in John Michaelson's Annisa Edla Salsabilla, Tuty Handayani (UIN Syarif Hidayatullah, Indonesia) Nancy Al-Doghmi (Yarmouk University, Jordan)
82	Deconstruction of the Main Protagonists in Ausma Zehanat Khan's the Unquiet Dead Luthfialdi Nouval (UIN Syarif Hidayatullah, Indonesia) Mira Utami (Institut Seni Indonesia Padangpanjang, Indonesia)

P-ISSN: 2961-7502 E-ISSN: 2962-8199



DOI: https://10.15408/mel.v3i1.39130

## Muslimah Indonesian's Hybridity in John Michaelson's Annisa

<sup>1</sup>Edla Salsabilla, <sup>1</sup>Tuty Handayani<sup>\*</sup>, <sup>2</sup>Nancy Al-Doghmi

<sup>1</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia. <sup>2</sup>Yarmouk University, Jordan. Email: edla.salsabilla18@mhs.uinjkt.ac.id, tuty@uinjkt.ac.id, nancy.d@vu.edu.jo.

\*Corresponding Author: Tuty Handayani

### Abstract

This research aims to analyze how John Michaelson (Muslim British) explores Muslimah Indonesian's hybridity and mimicry in his novel Annisa (2015). This paper uses close textual analysis by engaging with the postcolonial concepts of Homi K. Bhaba's hybridity (1994). The analysis focuses on the narrative aspects in Annisa which portrait the hybridity and mimicry of Muslimah Indonesian protagonist, Annisa. The results indicate that; 1) Hybridity is portrayed through the protagonist's fashion style, education, and language. Mimicry is described through Annisa's imitating the ideology, romantic relationship, and lifestyle of Western society; 2) Annisa negotiates hybridity and mimicry through her fearlessness to voice injustice against the reductionist views of Indonesia and Islam in orientalist debates. In conclusion, the portrayal of hybridity and mimicry is negotiated when Annisa rejects the power of Western cultural influence to weaken the original culture of Indonesian society by providing lightening assessments of her culture and religion.

Keywords: Annisa Novel, Hybridity and Mimicry, Indonesian Muslim Literature, Postcolonialism Studies.

### Introduction

Culture is a way of social life to identify cultural identity through values, beliefs, knowledge and traditions that are transmitted from generation to generation. Culture is concerned with the exchange and production of meaning between groups or people who have the same interpretation of objects (Hammad 2018). According to Edward Said in Orientalism (Said 1978), the world is divided into two conflicting zones. 'West' is considered stronger than 'East.' There is a binary relationship between west and east because of western imperialism against the east. The greatness of the west to the east is a profitable colony for the west. Therefore, post-colonialism exists as an act of colonized people defending or resisting colonial domination.

Post-colonialism is a literary narrative discussing colonial criticism of the influence of colonialism (Clayton and Putri 2020). The significance of post-colonialism reflected the dominant way western societies represent their power to eastern societies and see their imperial power (Albrecht 2019). Thus, post-colonialism is concerned with constructing the independence and defence of colonized countries from the western imperial rule colonizers and explores the influence of colonialism on

culture and society from the beginning to the present (Gholipour and Sanahmadi 2013).

The complexity of post-colonialism issues focused on the binary system and the different cultural reconstructions between the west and east, thus building an ambivalence in which cultural power is superior to the east (Ukaegbu 2018). Thus, post-colonialism often occurred in colonial countries, such as Indonesia, Pakistan and India. According to Bhaba (1994), post-colonialism has three concepts: hybridity, mimicry, and ambivalence. However, this research focuses specifically on the concepts of hybridity and mimicry.

Hybridity and mimicry systems have been around for an extended time. This concept raised issues related to the practice of western power in various layers of society. The complexity of post-colonialism issues focused on the binary system and the different cultural reconstructions between the west and east, thus building an ambivalence in which cultural power is superior to the east (Ukaegbu 2018). Hybridity is a condition formed by cultural differences, the possibility of transcendence, and the organization of humans in socio-culture. The concept of hybridity included the practice of self-reflection and how subjective and cultural meanings are constantly changing and being revised (Naser 2022). Hybridity creates a state of " in between, " a condition where a person is in two cultures. The position of 'in between' required someone to be able to negotiate in presenting the original culture and the culture of the colonial countries. Hybridity is closely related to mimicry, i.e. imitating other cultures with their own (Chusna 2016).

Mimicry is a process that causes cultural similarities, and hybridity has existed for a long time (Anantama, Widodo, and Setiawan 2021). According to Loomba (2005), mimicry is a process of imitation that can create space for orients to subvert their original culture. As long as a western culture still exists as the dominant culture, there are always changes in direction to imitate the dominant culture, and mimicry is always present in this modern era. Mimicry significantly impacts colonized culture, starting from how they think about their original culture, that world civilization is more substantial, and their culture is sustainable for this era (Clayton & Putri, 2020). The repeated messages about hybridity and mimicry that readers receive from a novel significantly impact how people perceive and see the dominance of western culture in real life (Abdulqadir and Dizayi 2015). Therefore, it is necessary to analyze a novel that focused on hybridity and mimicry to oppose how they negotiate the adverse effects of western culture.

Annisa novel explores the complexities of culture and family issues from the perspective of a young Indonesian Muslim woman who is interested in adapting and imitating western culture (Micahaelson 2015). The novel focuses on Annisa's life journey as an Indonesian Muslim woman who was hesitant about her cultural identity. She is in a situation where she adopts two different cultures, the east as her original

culture and the west as her favourite culture. This situation occurred because Annisa tried to match the tastes of Peter, a non-Muslim lecturer from England. Peter is a smart and mysterious figure who is the only person who understands and helps Annisa solve her life problems. The encouragement to generalize Peter's tastes as a western society made Annisa learn more about western culture. Thus, she supposed that western culture could give her freedom of expression and opinion.

However, after Annisa discovered the lies about Peter's marital status with his wife and Peter's words that discriminated against Indonesian culture, Annisa evolved mad and realized that Peter was not as fair and wise, presumably man as she imagined. Annisa considers western culture not as good as described by Peter. They are just trying to think weak eastern society by making the parable of the west as superior and the east as inferior. Therefore, Annisa expressed her dread to Peter thus, she would be unrestricted from the influence of western influences, which caused suspicions about maintaining eastern culture and disclaiming the intimidation of western culture's perspective towards eastern culture.

Scholars around the world often discussed the issue of the post-colonialism concept. For instance, a journal article entitled Mimicry, Hybridity, and Ambivalence in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's Americanah and Purple Hibiscus was written by Asmarawati and Kurnia (Asmarawati, Kurnia, and Darma 2017). This research focused their analysis on the cultural identity of two novels Americanah and Purple Hibiscus by using a post-colonialism approach. The results of this research are the main characters in both novels, Americanah and Purple Hibiscus, showed hybridity and mimicry through their manners and actions. Then, ambivalence is portrayed as a way for the main character to tug the war against and accept the western culture. Another research discussed hybridity entitled Muslimah Hybrid Identity in Amulya Malladi's The Sound of Language conducted by Seshu (2023). This research examines how a Muslim subject develops their identity in a postcolonial European setting and analyses the problems raised by how the writer presents the character in the book. The study reveals that Muslim characters in occidental societies, like Raihana develops hybrid indentity when she moves to Denmark. It incorporates both her Muslim background and the contemporary free-thinking society of the West. In addition, the research entitled Fatima's Mimicry in Aliya Husain's Neither This Nor That by Aisyah (2022) also discussed Fatima's mimicry as the prominent figure in the diaspora novel. This study reveals that the characters imitate the majority's behavior subconsciously to maintain and save their identity.

The previous studies above mainly discuss how Muslim diaspora change and or maintain their identity and culture when they engage with western society. The studies also deploy Homi K. Bhabha's postcolonialism study. The present study also deeply explores how a Muslim woman engages with western culture in Anissa Novel. It aims to show the existence of hybridity and mimicry in society. However, if these two related terms still take part in our lives, more of society will run into a cultural identity

Copyright © 2024 Muslim English Literature Vol.3 No. 1, June 2024 DOI: https://10.15408/mel.v3i1.39130 crisis. Thus, the authors did this study to present that hybridity and mimicry are serious issues that we should discuss further and to give awareness to society that we need to conserve our original culture, as well as a cultural identity.

One of the reasons for analyzing this issue in this modern era is to depict the phenomenon of hybridity and mimicry still existing among societies. The domination of western culture will bring up the assumption of the contemporary era that they will command the world. The relationship between Annisa as an eastern society and Peter as a western society shows the existence of western and eastern power relations, giving rise to western cultural dominance over the east, the west as superior and the east as inferior. In this condition, eastern society actually tries to resist their cultural identity within themselves. *Annisa* is a novel set off in this contemporary era with modern elements such as characters' jobs, transportation, and others. This novel is not only telling about the life of the main character, Annisa but also a reflection of people in 21th had to deal with issues relating to culture and the way they face the bias of western and eastern cultures.

### Method

The writer used a qualitative method by describing and analyzing data from the novel. The qualitative method focuses on an idealistic and humanistic approach that analyzed people's beliefs, lived experiences, behavior, attitude, and communication (Pathak, Jena, and Kalra 2013). This method is used by describing the hybridity and mimicry that is depicted in this novel and how the novel negotiated hybridity and mimicry itself. The data are conducted from the narrative aspects of the novel Anissa. Any related narrative and dialogue portraying hybridity and mimicry are analyzed by using Homi K Bhaba (1994). The reason for using post-colonialism studies is because the issue going to be discussed in this study is about the cultural relationship that occurred in this novel, which is about hybridity and mimicry as the concept of post-colonialism. Other than using the concept of post-colonialism by Homi K Bhaba (1994), the writer also uses characterization theory in order to explore the characteristics of the main character, Annisa.

## Result and Discussion The depiction of hybridity Clothing

Annisa's hybridity is reflected in her courage to take off her hijab and use beauty products to increase her confidence. According to Mulford (1998), women will be more confident if they have an ideal body posture and attractive appearance because

these two things have become the beauty norm created by society. Physical attractiveness portrays the culture of beauty that is urged by the mass media to surround us with figures of flawless beauty, particularly females (Yan and Bissell 2014). The body is also related to beauty, the way the body's presentation might have become section of the authorized of beauty when there is social value in its cultural desires, and dreams to be beautiful.

However, western beauty norms are inversely different from eastern, where the appearance of western women is not involved in the clothing model used. Women in west countries are concerned with showing off their appearance through beauty face and body with beauty products following the beauty standards they have created. While in the eastern tradition, women are concerned about their skin health because of the climate of eastern countries, which tends to be tropical. Hence they need to cover up their bodies without attending to reveal their skin color and body shape. Moreover, Islam's doctrines influence women's clothes as the major religion in the eastern nation, requiring Muslims to envelop their entire body except for the face and hands.

Before heading to the upper floor, she veered left and went into the toilets to check up her makeup. There was nothing amazing about her. She was an ordinary girl, tall, and shapeless, an unremarkable face peering out of a light grey headscarf. Staring at the mirror she smiled an empty smile. And then, on a sudden impulse, she removed the headscarf's outer and inner layers, pushed them into her bag, and shook her hair free. (p.93)

The evidence above shows Annisa's action because she is not confident with her appearance. She decides to take off her hijab and applies makeup on her face to build up the attractiveness that requires western beauty standards. On the contrary, as a Muslim, Annisa must cover all body parts except her face and hands. At the same time, she begins to be influenced by western stereotypes regarding western beauty standards, and she experiences insecurities in her body shape and how she dresses up, which looks boring. However, she tries to look perfect when she meets Peter. As the hybridity figure, Annisa has to combine her desire with her original culture. It can be seen in the monologue below.

For now, at least, Annisa would only be doing this when she was with Peter. She could put her headscarf back on before she went home, and her parents needn't be any the wiser. And as for telling them about these unofficial meetings, the thought of their reaction was just too much for her to process. (p.98)

Even though Annisa has decided to take off her hijab, she still puts off her hijab when she does not meet Peter, like her family and friends. Annisa's actions can be identified as a part of the hybridity because she does not only decide to change her

appearance to western beauty standards but also puts off her hijab when she goes home and college, as well as to maintain eastern cultural values. Unconsciously Annisa has combined two cultural values between the west and east. We can see another piece of evidence showing how Annisa conserves her original culture below.

Eva : "My God" Eva nodded up the escalator, "you can practically see her

underwear"

Annisa : "..."

Eva : "There should be allow against it"

Annisa found her friend strange in this respect. She tried her best to be modern, but when it came to something like this, she was judgmental. Of course, it was disrespectful for people to dress like that in public. (p.58)

The quote above is created after Annisa's friend, Eva, criticizes the appearance of a woman wearing sheer clothes. It disturbs her view, and she hopes that the government would regulate how to dress because thin clothes are considered impolite to wear in public. When Annisa hears the comment, she is surprised that some Indonesians still think old-fashioned, that a woman's clothes must be dressed modestly, loose, not thin, and neat. However, Annisa realizes that the way of dressing in Indonesia is an eastern culture in respecting women through their clothes.

#### Education

Education is an essential aspect of the continuity of life in society as the product of colonial heritage. A person's educational background affects society's perspective on treating an individual's education determines social status in social life (Beissenova, Duisenova, and Muslimova 2013). The concept of hybridity by Homi K Bhaba involves colonized minorities and the power of western culture to balance social position in society (Bhaba, 1994). Annisa, just like other hybridity figures, wants to get a good position in social life and deserves a high salary through her educational background.

Ria : "London or Sydney yeah?"

Annisa : "My Master's mom, remember?"

Ria : "Yes I remember" Ria cast her eyes around the room before letting them fall

upon her daughter again, "very expensive those courses."

Annisa : "I can see where this is going"

"Was this what mother had come in me for? to tell me to start being a good little girl again or I wouldn't be getting her education paid for? kiss my father's hand and forgive him, or I would spend my days in some joyless civil service job until one of my colleagues proposed to me, and I could see his hand instead? How weak my parents' position was as if they had to resort to threatening me." (p.132)

The evidence above happens after Annisa is mad with her mother, what her mother says if Annisa studied abroad, her mother would not have had enough money to pay for it. The monologue above describes Annisa's inferiority as an ancient who feels she has a low social status as an eastern person without a higher education background. Moreover, she considers that university graduates in Indonesia could not compete with Western universities. Annisa believes university graduates in Indonesia cannot support her careers in the future. Thus, education background is considered how people reached their social status and the hybridity aspect involved. Another reason Annisa wants to study abroad is that she is really mad at her father when he decides to polygamy, which makes Annisa eschew her father.

For Muslims, religious education is essential to increase their faith. Faith keeps Muslims close to God and their boundaries away from God's prohibitions and carries out Islamic religious orders. In this novel, Annisa is born as the daughter of a well-known ustadz in Indonesia, thus her parents desire that Annisa becomes a devout Muslim woman. However, western culture has dominated Annisa's mindset, where she considers that religious education is less attractive than getting to know a new culture. This mindset shows that there is a combination of western and eastern cultures, where Annisa is more interested in learning western culture than knowing more about the existence of God.

Ghazali: "Just go to your room."

Annisa: "Alright"

Ghazali: "I need time to think about this. Maybe we should send you down to Solo." "Annisa blanched and went inside the house. As far as being pious went, her father paled in comparison to Uncle Jaffar and his family. She would be on a curfew for sure, not to mention having to pray at the mosque every morning and recite the Quran every night. How she wished she was in Peter's apartment now, rather than in this big dark house with a small inhabitant who seemed to be sucking the life right out of her."

The conversation above occurs when Ghazali is mad with Annisa after encountering her in an apartment, where he sees Annisa not wearing a hijab and dressing in tight clothes. Annisa realizes this horrible incident would happen; what her father's reaction would be when he sees that his daughter's behavior violated religious rules. However, Annisa does not regret her manners which is disregarded as a Muslim, because she compares her father's mistakes to being worse than hers. Unfortunately, after this incident, Ghazali wants to send Annisa to an Islamic boarding school in Solo owned by her uncle, where Annisa has to learn more about Islam and carry out routines following religious rules. Annisa assumes that the activities inside the Islamic boarding school could be more boring. She would only pray anytime, read the Quran, and study religion daily. Thus, Annisa thinks her family still thinks ancient and needs to be open.

Based on the quote above shows that there is camouflage toward another culture which is western culture, where Annisa begins to feel that eastern culture is not more attractive than western culture. Annisa finds significant cultural differences between the east and west, the west is more modern than the east. This condition becomes more apparent when Annisa internalizes her mindset that western education's aspects are more advanced than eastern ones. Thus, this mindset shows a process of hybridity, where Annisa considers the importance of education to be better if it follows western cultural standards.

### Language

Being a student, Annisa is definitely willing to learn more new knowledge, such as language. Not only is she interested to know more about her college study, but she also wants to know more about other cultures, including western, when she has to face the western culture that Peter unconsciously brings up to her. Language consists of several ideas and concepts which others can understand. Thus cultural differences would be introduced by language. Consequently, a new cultural identity will be created because identity is related to language. Moreover, language was forming new senses or reflecting historical truth as the function of visual language (Hammad 2018). According to Bhaba (1994), the primary method of learning the English language is learning phrases, sentences, or even terms with a translation and meaning to memorize them.

She went inside and took one from a large display table and weighed it in her hand. Would the translation be any good? Often, she found oddities in books that had been translated into Indonesian. Grammar and spelling errors, phrasing that made no sense. She wondered how the original authors would feel if there ever found out. (p.71)

The quotation above occurred when Annisa is looking for a book entitled The Golden Journey, written by a Muslim woman who is also a guest speaker at a seminar attended by Annisa and Peter. In this case, Annisa does not know that the book is written only in Indonesian; she thinks there was an English version. Hence Annisa mutters that if there are an English version of the book, she would buy it instead of reading the Indonesian version. Annisa feels that when she reads the Indonesian version of the book, she often finds irregularities in the meaning and grammatical error of the Indonesian language. Thus, it is considered detrimental to the purpose of the book's author. As we can see, Annisa's assessment of the poor quality of translations in Indonesian was the beginning of Annisa experiencing language hybridity, where Annisa prefers books in the English version rather than Indonesian.

Moreover, since Peter becomes Annisa's advisor lecturer, she receives a book entitled 'Fallacy,' which contains an assessment of arguments based on logical

weaknesses or errors in reasoning. Peter gives the book to Annisa to strengthen the arguments in her thesis. However, from those books, Annisa learns many logical fallacy terms. Logical fallacies originated in Ancient Greece; we now refer to them by their Latin and English names. A logical fallacy is a weakness or lack of logic that the sophists introduced.

Peter: "But enough about me, how are you getting on with your dissertation?"

Annisa: "Argumentum ad verecundiam"

Peter: "The appeal to authority"

Annisa: "Yes" (p.93)

The dialogue above happens when Annisa hesitates with the arguments in her dissertation and uses the term logical fallacy to answer the question. Annisa says 'Argumentum ad verecundiam' means she is skeptical that the "true or not" of her dissertation is determined by the skill or authority with which she declares it, not by the existence of the truth itself. Based on the dialogue above, we can see that Annisa practices using the term fallacy in her daily conversation. According to Hall (1997), the first step of circuit culture is production. Language is the essential process of producing meaning thus language builds the meaning of different objects. It can be classified that Annisa is a hybridity figure through the language aspect, which is used to maintain her existence as a student who can adapt western culture.

### The depiction of mimicry

Ideology is a reflection of a person's thinking, which at the same time shapes that person or society towards its ideals (Martin 2015). Indonesian ideology is based on Pancasila, where the vision of Pancasila is to uphold the values of divinity, human values, the value of unity, the value of justice, and democratic values (Supratikno 2022). Thus, the Pancasila ideology is considered to create people who behave appropriately and are more respected and trusted, and more responsibility is given to people who prove trustworthy and reliable. On the contrary, in the western world has been dominantly defined liberalism as an influential ideology. According to Kevin Harrison in Understanding Political Ideas and Movements (2003), Western powers toward world evolution encourage the practice of liberal ideology that seems universally acceptable. Liberalism is an ideology toward human nature and individual progress united in the very high value established on freedom. This freedom becomes a license to freedom from restraint on individuals and nations, freedom of economic activity, and freedom of thought and expression. Thus, liberals generally assumed that restraint should be lighter than freedom, but they have no logical limit to define how light it is. Eventually, it might shift the value of Pancasila ideology in Indonesia.

Annisa : "How about this one?" Annisa moved her finger down the page.

## 71 | The Indonesian Muslim Woman's Hybridity and Mimicry Depicted in The Novel Annisa

Peter : "Petitio principi, begging the question"

Peter took another sip of his coffee and smiled, glad she had accepted his invitation. He thought might have been angry with him and might not have realized he was only trying to help. Annisa had found out a cruel truth in an even cruller fashion, and he of all people should know what that was like. (p.56)

The first evidence occurred when Annisa and Peter discusses logical fallacy. Annisa is interested in discussing the topic more deeply to determine whether an argument is weak or strong. However, Annisa's way of assessing an argument's strength based on its weaknesses is oriented toward liberal ideology, where the freedom of every human group to express their opinions to others without restrictions and consider human values. Thus, Annisa's action illustrates that Annisa begins to eliminate Indonesian ideology, where she finds the truth cruelly without considering human values. In Indonesian ideology, the truth of the facts can be found by not demeaning others and respecting the feelings of others (Supratikno 2022). The term mimicry can be illustrated that the ancient desire to equal other culture is unconsciously built by the domination of superiority. The ancient build a new mindset, behavior, and spirit, which itself would create a new cultural identity (Buell, Heise, and Thornber 2011).

Annisa had been so inspired by the speaker, and for the first time in a long time she was feeling truly enthusiastic about her studies. not only were they giving her an excuse to meet with Peter, they were also giving her the weapons she needed to fight her father. he could play on her emotion as much as she liked, argumentum ad passiones but she would parry his blows with the sword of hard logic. (p.92)

The second piece of evidence occurred when Annisa is about to meet with Peter after arguing with her mother about the discussion of material in a seminar related to Islam and polygamy delivered by a speaker of western Muslim academics. Annisa's mother, Ria, considers that the presence of westerners only provides a doctrine to internalize culture, including in Indonesia. Besides, accepting and forgiving her husband's weaknesses is part of a woman's obligation, and no one can change that reality. However, Annisa feels that the speaker and Peter can provide the power of cold and complex logic to fight her father's attitude with the emotions she wants. Thus, Annisa's action refers to being a mimicry figure with liberal practice because she puts her freedom of thinking and expression on a high level. The expressing words "as much as she likes" show that Annisa would like to express her emotion and thoughts addressed to Ghazalie, her father, without any limitation. Thus, Annisa's act is considered to be imitating the way liberals think about freedom with minimal limitations where everyone is responsible for happiness in the rational pursuit of their own interests. Liberalism provides space for freedom to achieve human rights and goals at the

Vol.3 No. 1, June 2024 DOI: https://10.15408/mel.v3i1.39130

highest prime. Liberals assumed that a stable society where freedom can develop and be fully recognized (El Amine 2020).

Being a Muslim woman, Annisa learns the values of the Islamic religion through the social environment, religious seminars, and religious books. However, Annisa considers polygamy a form of oppression of women's rights if they can act pretty and have reasons for human values, such as helping the lives of old widows. Meanwhile, polygamy by Annisa's father is considered not following the provisions of Islamic rules, where he married only to fulfil his sexuality. Thus, the words 'she needed to fight her father.' refers to a feminist ideology where she thinks polygamy can be a tool to demean women's self-esteem and wants to voice her rejection of the injustice of her mother's rights to her father. Feminist ideology is an ideology dominated in western society that emphasizes the equality of women's rights and obligations, including the right to vote against men's decisions.

Ghozalie had no idea what was wrong with this girl. Yes, she had always been stubborn, but as far as he knew, she had never strayed from the path before. She was a good daughter, a dutiful daughter, and he didn't recognize this creature sitting beside him now with a mouth full of disrespect and a head full of warped ideas. (p.158)

The evidence above happened when Annisa meets her father in Peter's apartment without wearing a hijab. Hence, Annisa's father is getting mad at her and brings her home. However, Ghozalie is surprised to hear that Annisa dares to challenge her argument with harsh and impolite logic. Since Ghozalie's second marriage, Annisa does not approve of the marriage. Eventually, Annisa is ambitious to learn more about the logical fallacy. She would be able to make substantial, rational, and factual arguments against her father's second marriage. Moreover, Annisa also attends a seminar from a western Muslim speaker who discusses polygamy or second marriage. Therefore, Annisa's knowledge of polygamy is enhanced. According to the speaker, polygamy is still considered a taboo religious practice, especially in the western world, because no human being can be fair if they have more than one partner. polygamy can damage a woman's mental health if restraint and intimidation develop. Eventually, Annisa believes that her opinion is a logical and strong idea. Although Islam permits polygamy, the detriment to women is more significant than a second marriage.

Based on the evidence above, Annisa, as a mimicry figure through ideology implication, is described in the novel's narrative to convey the feelings of Annisa's father about the change in Annisa's attitude, which looks cold and stubborn. On the other hand, Annisa feels that the strength of her argument can paralyze the weakness of her father's argument regarding polygamy. Unconsciously, Annisa has internalized liberal ideology where she feels free to convey ideas and voice disapproval of polygamy without engaging in politeness and decency values. According to Bhaba

(1994), mimicry has a goal that is not only to be accepted but also absorbed and adopted. Colonized deny their authenticity in their quest to be much better than what they imitated. Hence, mimicry makes them different from their original culture and immerses them in a foreign culture (Anantama et al., 2021).

### **Romantic Relationship**

The mimicry of Annisa's character is reflected in engaging romantic relationship with a man named Peter. Based on the research revealed that teenagers tend to want a romantic relationship. Contextually, the development of adolescent romantic relationships is influenced by the relationship with parents and contextual factors such as extended family, peers, community, and cultural values that provide information about dating practices and gender roles (Dhariwal & Connolly, 2013). According to Jennifer Connolly in Cross-Cultural Perspectives on Dating and Marriage journal (2020), across western cultures, falling in love is a common element in relationships that strengthens the free will and autonomy to choose a partner during adolescence. However, in eastern culture, especially in majority Muslim countries, romantic love is seen as a secondary need for family, and romantic relationships have high social norms and restrictions. Parents in eastern cultures play a role in mixed-gender activities and place romantic relationships on parental approval. Therefore, consistent romantic interactions align with even though they admit wanting to be involved in romance. However, it appears that once teens enter a romantic relationship, they follow a sequence of stages similar to that of teenagers from western settings.

Annisa felt light and heavy all at once. Light when she thought about the things her classmates were saying about him. And, of course, the fact she was circling the drain of fornication. All right, so kissing and holding wasn't fornication in the strictest sense, but according to the majority of scholars, she was already wallowing in sin. (p.151)

As a Muslim, Annisa realizes that her behavior has violated eastern religious and cultural norms, where a man and woman are not allowed to have close relationships without being based on marriage. Moreover, Annisa and Peter have kissed, touched, and even lived together in Peter's apartment. On the other hand, Annisa feels that her behavior is commonplace in the West and is not the most despicable act in Islam. It can be seen that Annisa prefers the western courtship style without thinking about their eastern religious and cultural background. Annisa's decision to date western men and allow herself to imitate western courtship fashion proves that Annisa is doing a mimicry process because she imitates western courtship fashion. Bhaba said that mimicry refers not only to imitation or assimilation in the predominant culture but also

an over-imitation in which repetition with differences imitates the dominant culture's ideas, behavior, and language (Bhaba, 1994).

### Lifestyle

Annisa, as an Indonesian Muslim, has an obligation to comply with all regulations and prohibitions in Islam, especially in choosing food and drinks for consumption. for instance, alcohol is a drink that is forbidden to be consumed by Muslims because it can cause drunkenness and unconsciousness. Alcohol is depicted as a cause of enmities and hatred and a factor preventing remembering god and prayer. Although AL-Quran also examines the acknowledgment of Alcohol's benefits, the sin of consuming alcohol outweighs the benefit (Al-Ansari et al. 2015). In addition, the high alcohol content can damage the human body's metabolism and cause dependence. However, the influence of western domination over the east, especially in Indonesia, makes people imitate western habits, including the habit of drinking alcohol. it is included in the category of mimicry. According to Bhaba (1994), mimicry is seen as a challenging behavioral pattern of people imitating the dominant, because they hope they have access to the same force.

She reminded him of someone who had gone too long without water drinking with a friend site reckless thirst.

Annisa : "Mmm, wait" Peter : "Are you okay?"

Annisa : "I need to pee" she laughed. "just a moment"

Peter : "No problems"

Peter : "Careful" he watched as she bounced of the edge of her bed and tottered

towards the bathroom. "Don't want you breaking your neck"

Annisa : "So this is how it feels to be drunk"

Peter : "Mmmm mmm"

Annisa: "I think I like it" (p.198)

The dialogue above happens when Annisa tries to drink alcohol for the first time. The words "I think I like it" showed that Annisa started to like consuming alcohol because it is considered capable of making her think more positively and fresh. The dialogue above can be classified that Annisa as a mimicry figure for imitating the habit of drinking alcoholic beverages. However, drinking alcohol is prohibited in Islam because it can make people lose consciousness and have an addictive effect. The domination of superiority managed to make Annisa a "Blurred copy" where she does not realize that she is worried about losing her cultural identity.

She didn't know if it was the spirit in Peter's world or the effects of the wine but Anissa had to admit she was starting to feel more positive or maybe positive wasn't the proper way to describe it. she still understood that her future was looking extremely Bleak but somehow she didn't seem to care as much. (p.197)

## 75 | The Indonesian Muslim Woman's Hybridity and Mimicry Depicted in The Novel Annisa

The narration above shows that Annisa is addicted alcohol. Relating to the previous conversation, Annisa starts to like the after effects of drinking alcohol where she felt that alcohol can calm her mind and make her more enthusiastic in positive thinking. This effect means that Annisa finds a new comfort to feel free that she could not discovered in her original culture. Although, Annisa realizes that she is in fear of being trapped in the darkness of the world. The words 'she didn't seem to care as much" refers that Annisa feels that she doesn't care about herself and starts eliminating her original culture.

Peter: "Are you okay my dear?"

Annisa: "not really"

Peter: "hope you don't mind me drinking so early in the day"

Annisa: "I should probably have one too" Peter: "might make you sick" (p.193)

The Dialogue above shows Annisa that she drinks to relieve her stress. This happened when Annisa sees her father and his second wife in Singapore. It makes her very angry and embarrassed of her father. Moreover, Ghazali has never yet gone to Singapore with Ria, while Annisa knew that Ria had dreamed to take time in Singapore together. Therefore, Annisa feels depressed by the situation and decides to drink alcohol as medicine to calm her mind and soul. Annisa's action shows that she camouflages to the western lifestyle that consuming alcohol could be relieved human stress. Indeed, she does not care about her health.

### Negotiating the hybridity and mimicry

After showing how hybridity and mimicry happened to Annisa, this novel not only shows elements that are considered to support hybridity and mimicry but also depicts the resistance to hybridity and mimicry. According to Bhaba (1994), negotiating the influence of western cultural forces occurs by resisting the appeal to reconsider their benefits and rethink that truth and virtue are acceptable to God. In this novel, Annisa realizes that all the western theology that Peter always discussed, considered the most influential and powerful analogies, only shows the stupidity of someone who tries to cover it with famous and careless proverbs. Some of Annisa's actions and dialogues that negotiate hybridity and mimicry are described further below.

...you are only interested in yourself, Peter, you talk about these big ideas like you are a smart person, but really you are just a loser. All these arguments, all these theories, don't make you a better, more honest person. You are miserable and you are evil and you just attacked a woman because you can't face the truth. (p.211).

The first evidence against the ideas of hybridity and mimicry can be seen in the dialogue above. Annisa said, "you only care about yourself," after she realizes that the arguments about the weakness of Eastern countries and the logical fallacy theory that Peter discusses are just weak and non-logical ideas created by western society to raise their own rational goals. These ideas are a form of western power against eastern countries to influence all aspects of life by intimidating and oppressing intellectuals from non-western countries. We can see that Annisa's attitude shows her experience of being in a colonized society where western thought has succeeded in mastering her mindset; the east is weaker than the west. Eventually, Annisa realizes this thought is a form of arm-twisting against Indonesia as an eastern country.

Being a teenager in this modern era is not easy where a teenager has to live side by side with the influential culture of the western paradigm. Therefore, the dialogue above reflects Annisa's resistance because the assumption that the east is considered less intellectual than the west is only a weak argument to dominate the east with its culture. Moreover, this resistance shows the calculation or testimony of the westerner as stupidity or temporary madness. Colonized people seem to be obedient to be proud and maintain their culture as their identity (1994).

Technically, Peter was right. He never actually said this, but he implied it almost every day. Indonesian people's writing and research skills are not maximized, their way of thinking is illogical, corrupt and lazy, habits of breaking the law. And how did he come to this conclusion? By breaking its own rules and making weak analogies and hasty generalizations. Two months living in the little bubble and he thinks he knows all there is to know about his people. It was so sad, it made me want to throw up. (p.210)

Another criticism of the dominant west in this novel can be seen in the monologue above. Annisa voiced her thoughts by saying all of Peter's assumptions about Indonesia had made her miserable and nauseous. Based on Annisa's monologue above, we can see that superiority still exists among the people in this era, where they discriminate against Indonesia as an emerging country by making weak analogies. In line with what the Chusna (2016) argued, the west makes the east go to another world with the opposite image, which will not be better with the west. In this case, Annisa tries to show that the worst assumptions about her people only show their ignorance about Indonesia.

Peter : "Reminds me of home" Annisa : "Do you miss it?"

Peter : "yes and no. I suppose I miss the orderliness more than anything."

Annisa: "you must hate Jakarta then."
Peter: "hate's a powerful word"
Annisa: "but you don't like it."

Peter : "does anyone? So much chaos, so much corruption, so many malls. You know

I sometimes get the impression people blame the west for that. The truth is,

## 77 | The Indonesian Muslim Woman's Hybridity and Mimicry Depicted in The Novel Annisa

your leaders are making so much money awarding contracts, they'll cover every inch of the place in glass and concrete."

Annisa : "it isn't fair."
Peter : "life rarely is."

Based on the conversation above showed Annisa's annoyance with Peter for comparing his country with Indonesia, especially in Jakarta. Peter thought that Jakarta had too much chaos in one area, such as bad people's habits, traffic jams, corruption, Etc. therefore, he does not find any comfort or respite there. This assumption makes Annisa annoyed with Peter and proved resistant to her culture and country. Therefore, the sentence 'it is not fair.' refers to Annisa's assumption that Peter has criticized the country and the life of the people in it.

According to Bhaba (1994), the colonized demand for narrative raises the question of why westerners live in their country. This question reveals the other side of narcissistic authorities facing the process of cultural differences, which makes them fix the problem of the colonized. In this novel, the main character, Annisa, as the orient, asks Peter why he lives in Indonesia, while he always underestimates and thinks Indonesia is considered illogical and has bad habits. It can be shown in the dialogues below.

Annisa : "My question is, if you hate my country so much, why don't you just leave?

Peter : "Wish you wouldn't say that, but I guess in the back of my mind I half hope it's 'go home bule' every racist sad rehash from here on Kathmandu."

(p.210)

The dialogue above shows how Annisa negotiates western superiority in this novel. Annisa voices her skepticism by asking why Peter is in a place he hated living in. Based on the dialogue between Peter and Annisa, we know that Annisa's way of defending the dominant western culture over her original culture can be classified as an act of resistance to western culture. Annisa to maintain her cultural identity. The phrase 'my country' shows a sense of belonging for her country, where Annisa feels that Indonesia is not only a country in the east, but Indonesia is a country where she lives and is recognized as a society.

After showering and dressing, she headed downstairs, taking in her surroundings through a wiser pair of eyes. Much as it pained her to admit it, maybe Peter was right when he had compared her to a ship at anchor, not allowing the wind to take her somewhere new. After all, how could she be grateful for the blessings god had given her if she had never taken this trip across dangerous waters? (p.214)

The evidence above describes Annisa's regret after realizing she had been trapped in the influence of western culture. She states that she had camouflaged herself as a woman who has almost eliminated her cultural identity as a Muslim woman in Indonesia by internalizing western culture. This incident occurs after the relationship between Peter and Annisa has ended up, where she already knows Peter's lies against her and realizes Peter is just a western man who tries to degrade the culture and social life in Indonesia. Thus, it can be said that "no more relationship, no more power relation.", where their relationship determines the course of post-colonialism practice between west and east. As we can see, Peter's presence is a benchmark for shifting Annisa's attitude, mindset, and lifestyle from an Indonesian Muslim woman in camouflage to a western woman who follows western society standardization.

Muslims dominated the eastern world. However, as part of a colonized country, Indonesia also has various religions. Hence, it is in line with the first Pancasila, which reads "God Almighty." These words mean that every religious community must respect and appreciate each other according to their beliefs. Moreover, every Indonesian citizen is obliged to have religion as their identity. Unlike England, which is also a colonizing country, they have no obligation to have a religion. They are unrestricted to choose not to believe in god. Merely like Peter, in a western society with no religion, he often does not understand the religious norms that involve every religion. Peter's action made Annisa suppose that Peter was belittling her religion. It can be seen in a few quotations below.

...and when he had made that joke about women covering their hair. she hadn't reacted very well at all. What was it about this part of her religion that drew so many comments from outsider? (p.84)

Annisa : "you're saying religion is like a profession?"

Peter : "make sense to me."
Annisa : "weak analogy"

Peter : "you're learning fast" (p.144)

Annisa : "how can you talk about Him (God) so easily?"

Peter : "I wasn't aware it was a crime"

of course, it wasn't. Annisa understood this well enough. But Peter was far too casual in the way he approached such matters, as tough God was just theory to be discussed without any sense of fear or reverence. (p.175)

The quotations above depict Peter's ignorance of the prevalent religious norms. Thus, Annisa often handles that discussing religion is a sensitive topic with Peter. Annisa thinks Peter is too arrogant and opens up to discuss religion, while he is an atheist. However, Peter's attitude did not necessarily lead Annisa to change her beliefs about Islam. Annisa remains firm in maintaining her Muslim identity by questioning 'why do they pretend to understand religion when they are atheists?' this question strengthens Annisa's faith to continue embracing Islam. Annisa's decision to steadfastly maintain her Muslim identity is classified as Annisa created powerful resistance as an eastern

Copyright © 2024 Muslim English Literature
Vol.3 No. 1, June 2024 DOI: https://10.15408/mel.v3i1.39130

society with a vital religion that is not influenced by western influences related to religion.

The evidence above depicts the results of Annisa's negotiations on merging the two cultures that happened to her. Although Annisa does not realize that she is in a crisis of being influenced by western culture, Annisa cannot distinguish the harmful risks that would happen to her cultural identity. Eventually, Annisa admits that she has committed deviant behavior from eastern religion and culture and regretted all her bad behavior. The ending of the relationship between Annisa and Peter is also the main spearhead of the return of Annisa's cultural identity. In conclusion, Annisa has succeeded in going through the process of hybridity and mimicry by creating resistance to her cultural identity. Therefore, Annisa remains an Indonesian Muslim woman.

### Conclusion

Annisa is a novel that portrays how Annisa faces the power of western influences and its products that brings her toward losing her cultural identity. The existence of Peter as her lecturer from England became her most considerable influence to lose her original culture as Muslim Indonesia. Annisa is seen as a hybridity and mimicry figure when she adopted and imitated western culture and its products. Furthermore, Annisa depicts how she negotiates the western influences to maintain her original culture as a Muslim Indonesian.

The results of this research show that Annisa, the main character in the novel, is seen as a hybridity figure because she combines western and eastern cultures. It is depicted in how she thinks that western education quality is more excellent than eastern, especially in Indonesia, assumes the western beauty standard as the perfect beauty standard, and uses Yunani terms to facilitate daily communication with Peter. Furthermore, Annisa is also depicted as a mimicry figure because she imitates western culture in her action, such as ideological shifts, romantic relationship, and lifestyle modifications, which align with the concept of post-colonialism theory by Homi K Bhaba. Moreover, Annisa is portrayed as unconfident, impulsive, and curious. These characteristics can be seen through her actions and opinion of another character. Through Annisa's characteristics, it can be other elements that encouraged Annisa toward hybridity and mimicry figure. However, after Annisa learns about the lying of Peter, this encouraged her fight against the influential western culture.

From this novel, the writers conclude that hybridity and mimicry as the product of the power of western culture to eastern countries, especially Indonesia is the one cause toward losing the original culture of colonized society. Therefore, the West's power might change all of Indonesian society's life elements. Moreover, Annisa's novel has succeeded in describing how the power of western culture influences eastern culture, especially in colonized countries, but also giving awareness about what

hybridity and mimicry can cause to society. Annisa novel also has succeeded in making fiction novels and issues covered in the novel as the reflection of people today. The portrayal of the influence of western power issues in the novel is worth reading because it can make us realize that issues like hybridity and mimicry are still relevant to be discussed until this era.

### **Work Cited**

- Asiyah, Nur. "Fatima's Mimicry in Aliya Husain's Neither This Nor That." *Muslim English Literature*, vol. 1 no. 2, 2022, pp. 121-133. https://doi.org/10.15408/mel.v1i2.27444
- A Dizayi, Saman Abdulqadir Hussein. "The crisis of identity in postcolonial novel." *INTCESS15—2nd International Conference on Education and Social Sciences, Istanbul, Turkey*, 2015, pp. 999—1007.
- Al-Ansari, Basma, et al. "Extent of alcohol prohibition in civil policy in Muslim majority countries: the impact of globalization." *Addiction*, vol. 111, no. 10, 2016, pp. 1703–1713. https://doi.org/10.1111/add.13159.
- Albrecht, Monika. *Postcolonialism Cross-Examined: Multidirectional Perspectives on Imperial and Colonial Pasts and the Neocolonial Present. Routledge.* New York: Routledge, 2019. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780367222543.
- Amine, Loubna El. "Political Liberalism, Western History, and The Conjectural Non-West." *Political Theory* vol. 49, no. 2, 2020, pp. 190–214. https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591720927802.
- Anantama, Muharsyam Dwi, Sahid Teguh Widodo, and Budhi Setiawan. "Hybridity and Mimicry in the Novel Pangeran Dari Timur Iksaka Banu's Work." *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, vol. 8 no. 1, 2021, pp. 32. https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v8i1.2211.
- Asmarawati, Cindera, Fabiola D. Kurnia, and Budi Darma. "Mimicry, Hibridity and Ambivalence in Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's Americanah and Purple Hibiscus." *International Conference on Education and Science*, no. Icons, 2017, pp. 170–82.
- Beissenova, Duisenova, and Muslimova. "Influence of Education on Social Structure of Society (on Materials of Focus Group Research and in-Depth Interviews)." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* vol. 82, 2013, pp. 813–17. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.06.354.
- Bhabha, Homi. "The location of culture Routledge." New York. 1994.
- Buell, Lawrence, Ursula K. Heise, and Karen Thornber. "Literature and Environment." *Annual Review of Environment and Resources* vol. 36, 2011, pp. 417–40. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-environ-111109-144855.
- Chusna, Inayatul, 2016. "Stereotip Dunia Ketiga Dalam Film Bride and Prejudice." Buletin Al-Turas vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 65–87. https://doi.org/10.15408/bat.v22i1.3013.
- Clayton, Catherine, and Liza Amalia Putri. "The Identity Issue of the Colonized and the Colonizer in Cloud Nine by Caryl Churchill." *International Journal of Culture and Art Studies* vol. 4, no. 1, 2020, pp. 1–8. https://doi.org/10.32734/ijcas.v4i1.3620.

- Gholipour, Mojtaba, and Mina Sanahmadi. "A Postcolonial Perspective on the Short Stories of Jhumpa Lahiri." *International Journal of Humanities and Management Sciences* vol. 1, no. 1, 2013, pp. 54–56.
- Hammad, Alshammari Sultan. "The Relationship Between Language, Identity and Cultural Differences: A Critical Review." *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, vol. 8, no. 4, 2018, pp. 98–101.
- Harrison, Nicholas. "Postcolonial Criticism: History, Theory and the Work of Fiction." In *Polity Press*, iv, 221. Cambridge, 2003. https://doi.org/10.1093/fs/knl065.
- Loomba, Ania. *Colonialism/Postcolonialism. World Literature Today*. Second. Vol. 73, 2005. New York: Routledge. https://doi.org/10.2307/40154856.
- Martin, John Levi. "What Is Ideology?" *Sociologia, Problemas e Praticas* vol. 77, 2015, pp. 9–32. https://doi.org/10.7458/SPP2015776220.
- Micahaelson, John. Annisa, a Novella. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama. 2015.
- Mulford, Matthew, John Orbell, Catherine Shatto, and Jean Stockard. "Physical Attractiveness, Opportunity, and Success in Everyday Exchange." *American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 103 no. 6, 1998, pp. 1565–92. https://doi.org/10.1086/231401.
- Naser, Azhar Waheed. "A Comparative Study of Oriental Literature from a Western View of Joseph Conrad." *International Journal Papier Public Review*, vol. 3 no. 2, 2022. pp. 26–34. https://doi.org/10.47667/ijppr.v3i2.155.
- Pathak, Vibha, Bijayini Jena, and Sanjay Kalra. "Qualitative Research." *Perpective in Clinical Research* 4, 2013. https://doi.org/10.4103/2229-3485.115387.
- Said, Edward. Orientalism. Pantheon. 1978. https://doi.org/10.1201/9780203736678.
- Seshu, Bandaru S.S.S.S.K. "Muslimah Hybrid Identity in Amulya Malladi's The Sound of Language." *Muslim English Literature vol.* 2, no. 2, 2023, pp. 12-18. https://doi.org/10.15408/mel.v2i2.35315
- Supratikno, Agus. "Reinforcing Indonesian National Identity Based on Inclusiveness of Pancasila as a Way to Deal with the Identity Politics in Indonesia." *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding* vol. 9, no. 6, 2022, pp. 407–17.
- Ukaegbu, Victor. "Post-Colonialism and Performance: Political, Cutural and Pedagogic Legacies and Constraints." *Repertório*, no. 29, 2018, pp. 12. https://doi.org/10.9771/r.v0i29.25455.
- Yan, Yan, and Kim Bissell. "The Globalization of Beauty: How Is Ideal Beauty Influenced by Globally Published Fashion and Beauty Magazines?" *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research* vol, 43 no. 3, 2014, pp. 194–214. https://doi.org/10.1080/17475759.2014.917432.