

# Analysis of the Leadership Style of the Head of the Library at the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta

**Nurdiansyah\***

*Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta*  
nurdiansyah.ll.arifin@gmail.com

**127**

**Vidiastuti Muljono**

*Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta*  
vidiastuti9@gmail.com

**Nurdin Laugu**

*Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta*  
nurdin@uin-suka.ac.id

\*) Corresponding Author

Received : 16-8-2022  
Revised : 14-10-2022  
Accepted : 31-10-2022

How to Cite:

Nurdiansyah, Muljono, V. dan Laugu, N. (2022). Analysis of the Leadership Style of the Head of the Library at the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta. *Librarianship in Muslim Societies*, 1(2), 127-140

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15408/lms.v1i2.27662>



© 2022 by Nurdiansyah, Vidiastuti Muljono, Nurdin Laugu  
This work is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License (CC BY NC SA)

**Abstract**

*The University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library is one of the private university libraries which has approximately 20 librarians spread across all faculties. Each faculty consists of up to 1 to 2 librarians. The University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta campus consists of 2 campuses, namely the Cirendeuh Campus and the Cempaka Putih Campus. The Central Library is located on the Cirendeuh Campus. This study aims to analyze the leadership style applied by the head of the library at the Muhammadiyah University in Jakarta or abbreviated as UMJ. The method used in this study is a qualitative method with data collection techniques, interviews, and observations. The observation was done to analyze matters related to research, namely the leadership style applied by the head of the library. Data analysis includes data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions or verification. This study shows that the application of leadership style in the UMJ library adopts a situational leadership style system by measuring it through four aspects, namely informant style, sales style, participatory style, and delegation style. The ideal leadership element is already owned by the head librarian of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta, it can be seen from the positive stigma that his subordinates put out, thus making the library a library development that can happen quickly. Furthermore, judging from the application of the leadership style of the head of the Muhammadiyah Jakarta university library, it is very suitable to be applied in the Muhammadiyah Jakarta University library because it can adapt to the work environment that occurs in that place.*

**Keywords:** library, UMJ, leadership style, situational leadership

## INTRODUCTION

The development of science in today's world is a phenomenon that cannot be avoided because it is a form of harmony that arises between technology and the human ability to accept and manage that knowledge into new technology and knowledge. The discoveries that exist also occur in the work environment, which has an impact in the form of various ways for superiors to lead their subordinates. Creating a good work environment is based on quality and continuity between superiors and subordinates in the work environment. Then the main thing that becomes the main concern is the attitude shown by a leader in guiding, directing, and providing the right motivation to his subordinates.

Leadership is a process in which a person or individual can be a role model who is able to direct, guide and influence the behavior and work of others toward certain goals in certain situations. This becomes a positive image because basically the better a person is in leading a job, the morale of the subordinates will arise and of course, can advance the place of work better and develop. Therefore, one of the goals of leadership is to be a means to achieve a goal. That is why leadership can be used as a benchmark for achieving these goals. In addition, leadership also has a goal to motivate others. This is very necessary as a way to maintain and improve the morale that exists in the people they lead.

In the world of libraries, the role of leadership in an organization is very influential, and this is because the library as an institution or organization has an important role in providing all kinds of information that society needs in today's era. Libraries must be managed by people who have competence in their fields, including academic libraries. Academic libraries can also be referred to as college libraries and are part of technical service units at universities, colleges, and higher education institutions (Rifauddin et al., 2020).

Leadership comes from English, namely leader, which means leader; then leadership means leadership. A leader is a person who occupies a position as a leader, while leadership is an activity or task as a leader. There is also what is meant by another meaning, a leader is a person who occupies a position as a leader, while leadership is an activity or task of a leader to accomplish some goals. A person's leadership is not only determined by his physical advantages, such as a large body but is more determined by the person's knowledge of leading or influencing his subordinates. Effectiveness influences the success or failure of a person to lead. However, this is inseparable from other factors such as independence, competitive advantage, education level, interest, motivation,

enthusiasm, discipline, age level, gender, intelligence level, emotional level, the facilities available, situation and conditions of economic level, environment, and so on (Djafri, 2017).

Leadership is an organizational locomotive that is always interesting to discuss. This attraction is based on the historical background that shows the importance of the existence of a leader in every group activity and the fact that leadership is central to the interaction pattern between organizational components. Leadership and the leader's role determine a nation's birth, growth, maturity, and death. Leaders who can adapt in carrying the course of the organization have an essential role in dealing with organizational conditions that are constantly changing because organizational flexibility is the work of people who can act proactively, creatively, innovative, and unconventional. Individuals are needed as leaders of today's organizations. A leader is an inspiration for change and a visionary, That is, having a clear vision of where the organization is going (Andriansyah, 2015).

Leadership is found in every social system, from the smallest social system, namely families, groups, organizations, and institutions, to communities. We can analyze the nature of leadership and social systems to answer why leadership always appears in every social system. The essence of leadership is an ability, process, action, or function generally used to influence other people to do something to achieve specific goals. It can also be a practiced application of power that binds others under their ability to persuade, explain, and conclude that something must be done (Andriansyah, 2015).

At each institution, leaders have different characteristics in running the organizational system they lead. This matter is due to various factors, such as educational background, individual emotions, and many others. The different characteristics of this leader also apply in the library world. The applied leadership style will significantly affect the performance of subordinates and can make morale higher or vice versa, causing conflicts due to an inappropriate leadership style.

Leadership style is a style a leader uses to lead an organization by using existing resources to achieve organizational goals. Human resources are one of the resources in the organization that leaders can use to achieve organizational goals. Employees are human resources that must be led to be utilized according to organizational goals. A leader needs to use a leadership style in the organization to increase employee work motivation, which affects employee performance and supports organizational goals. This study will discuss the performance of employees influenced by leadership style and work motivation.

The results showed that employee performance was influenced by work motivation and leadership style. In addition, the appropriate leadership style will affect employee motivation, so it can significantly improve employee performance in an organization (Rambet, 2022). Leadership style is the behavior or method chosen and used by the leader in influencing the thoughts, feelings, attitudes, and behavior of members of the organization. Meanwhile, Agus Dharma defines leadership style as a pattern of behavior shown by a person when influencing others. Paul Hersey & Kenneth Blanchard say that leadership style is a pattern of behavior when someone tries to influence others and accept it (Nawawi, 2003).

Based on the background described above, why is it taking research data at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta, because the researchers see that the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta is very suitable in this discussion. Seeing a good leadership style, tends to make subordinates obedient and responsible for every task given by the leader, and does not make the leader like other people but work like friends. Therefore, this research can be formulated as How to Analyze the Leadership Style of the Head of the Library at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta?

## **METHOD**

The research method used by the researcher is qualitative research. The research used is a case study type, which is a series of scientific activities carried out intensively, in detail and redundant depth about a program, event, and activity, either at the individual level, a group of people, institutions, or organizations to gain in-depth knowledge about the event. Usually, the selected events in the future, referred to as cases, are real-life events, which are currently ongoing, not something that has passed (Hadi, 2021).

This research was conducted at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library which is located at Jl. KH Ahmad Dahlan, Cireundeu, Kec. East Ciputat, South Tangerang City, Banten 15419. The subjects in this study were librarians at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library from all existing faculties. While the object of research is the Leadership Style Analysis of the Head of the Library of Muhammadiyah University, Jakarta. In this study, primary data was obtained through observation of matters related to research, namely the leadership style applied by the head of the library. And interviews were conducted with ten librarians working in the library, to obtain information regarding all instructions given by the librarian. Secondary data for this study

include geography, library history, state of the library, and research data. The data collection technique used the observation method to obtain information about the leadership model of the head of the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta Library. In conducting interviews, in addition to having to bring an instrument as an interview guide, the author can also use tools such as recorders, pictures, brochures, and other materials to help smooth the interview. (Sugiyono, 2014). Interview data collection method to obtain data through the statements of the interviewees. This method helps the author in obtaining respondent data directly, such as the librarian at the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta Library. As for the analysis process in the Miles and Huberman model, there are three processes, namely:

- a. Data reduction. Data reduction is a form of analysis that sharpens, categorizes, directs, discards unnecessary, and organizes data so that conclusions can be drawn and verified.
- b. Data Presentation. The presentation of data is a collection of structured information that allows concluding and taking action.
- c. Drawing Conclusions/Verification. Drawing conclusions is part of an activity from a complete configuration. Conclusions were also verified during the study (Sugiyono, 2010).

The research flow begins with the selection of research locations when choosing a place, namely the Muhammadiyah University Jakarta library. This situation was chosen because the library has two types of libraries, namely the faculty library and the central library, so it is interesting to conduct research on library leadership styles at the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta. Next is the selection of informants, which is carried out as a process of strengthening research where the selected informants are people who feel the direct impact of the leadership style of the head of the library, which was found from ten informants as data sources. The third stage is to interview informants who have been selected according to research needs. Then, the results of the interviews were combined under a list of questions made to informants to find out the results of previous interviews. The last is the conclusion, where the last response is taken from the informant's statement, existing data, and information. It will be seen what needs to be done and improved from the leadership style of the head of the library at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta that is applied. This must be capitalized as a good input to create a comfortable and conducive work situation, and of course this is one way to advance the library institution of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### Leadership Types, Styles, And Behaviors

Leadership style is the behavior or method chosen and used by the leader in influencing the thoughts, feelings, attitudes, and behavior of members of the organization. Meanwhile, Agus Dharma defines leadership style as a pattern of behavior shown by a person when influencing others. Paul Hersey & Kenneth Blanchard say that leadership style is a pattern of behavior when someone tries to influence others and accept it (Nawawi, 2003).

For a leader to achieve goals effectively, he must have the authority to lead to achieve goals. Generally, two concepts of giving authority are seen from its direction: above and below. Authority from top to bottom generally comes from superiors. For example, a hospital director appoints a nurse to be the head of the nursing department and is then given the authority to govern. This method is called top-down authority (authority from top to bottom). The second concept is bottom-up authority. In this concept, the leader is chosen by those who will be his subordinates. If someone is accepted as a leader and given the authority to lead, the subordinates respect that authority (Andriansyah, 2015).

Tannenbaum & Schmidt explained four factors that influence leadership style: value system, confidence in subordinates/members who are led, the tendency in leadership, and feelings of security in certain situations. Many leadership styles can be used, both traditional and modern, and are more suitable to be applied to the current situation. Eugene Emerson Jennings & Robert T. Golembiewski said there are six types/styles of leadership, namely: autocratic, dictatorial, democratic, charismatic, paternalistic, and laissez-faire (Nawawi, 2003). There are three types of leadership, each of which consists of several leadership styles. The three types of leadership include authoritarian type, democratic type, and free type (laissez-faire or free rein) (Nawawi, 2003).

Then there is also a situational leadership style generated from a series of three factors: the leader's personality traits, the nature of the group and its members, and the anticipated events for the group. One of the best versions of this situational leadership style is the situational leadership model from Hersey and Blanchard. This model starts from the principle that effective leadership can be realized through the ability to choose the right leadership behavior/style based on the level of readiness and maturity of organizational members. This theory states that the effectiveness of leadership is strongly influenced by the level of ability (readiness & maturity) of organizational members in accepting or rejecting the leadership (Andriansyah, 2015).

The leadership style/behavior in this model consists of: First, telling style

(style telling/ordering/directing), which includes; a) implemented with high task orientation; b) low relationship orientation; c) the leader is the centre of activity; d) suitable for the organizational environment where the readiness & personal maturity of its members is low; e) need specific instructions, direction, and close supervision. Second, selling style (the style of offering and selling), with characteristics including; a) carried out with a high task and relationship orientation; b) suitable for the situation of members whose readiness and maturity are still low and whose workability is not sufficient; c) the leader's role is to offer (sell) tasks to those who are willing and able, by providing direction to members whose ability and willingness to work are low; d) leaders as directors and supporters of its members. Third, participating style (participation style) has characteristics including; a) implemented with low task orientation; b) high relationship orientation; c) demonstrating the willingness and ability of leaders to utilize members; d) appropriate if the readiness and maturity of members are already high; e) decision-making is carried out jointly or carried out alone by the leadership as superiors. The last, delegating style (the style of delegation of authority), has the following characteristics; a) implemented with low task orientation and relationship orientation; b) appropriate if the readiness and maturity of members are very high; c) the ability and expertise of members to work are also high, so it is appropriate to be given the delegation of authority.

### **Leadership Style Effectiveness Concept**

The level of maturity being led strongly influences the application of leadership styles. So it is necessary to know the level of maturity being led because there is a direct relationship between the right leadership style to be applied and the maturity level being led to obtaining good obedience and influence. Maturity is not in age or emotional stability but in terms of desire and ability, and experience related to the task (Molantong et al., 2015).

In this approach, there are two leadership style factors, namely: first, a task-oriented style which includes a) the leader provides instructions to subordinates; b) the leader always carries out strict supervision of subordinates; c) the leader convinces subordinates that the tasks must be carried out following his wishes; d) the leader places more emphasis on carrying out tasks than on coaching and developing subordinates. The two styles are employee-oriented, which include; a) the leader is more motivating than providing supervision to subordinates; b) leaders involve subordinates in decision making; c) leaders are more familial, mutual trust and cooperation, and mutual respect among fellow group members (Krisnawulan, 2005).



### **The Leadership Style of the Head of the Librarian of Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta**

Every leader has their leadership style. Leaders who can be said to be effective are leaders who can condition their leadership style from various situations. Leaders do not only use one leadership style in all circumstances or under any conditions. To find out how a leader's leadership style in every situation and condition that occurs can be analyzed using the situational leadership model theory. This theory can be used to analyze how a person's leadership is by looking at several aspects, namely telling style (telling), seller style (selling), participatory style (participating), and delegation style (delegating). This study sees the leadership style of the head of the library of Muhammadiyah University Jakarta (Krisnawulan, 2005).

Muhammadiyah University Jakarta is one of the private universities within the Muhammadiyah foundation, which has two campuses at two different addresses. The research was conducted at the Muhammadiyah University Jakarta environmental library, located on campus A, the Cirendeu campus. In collecting data, the interview method was used. This study aimed to determine how effective the leadership of the library's head at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta was in the success and operation of the services at the Muhammadiyah University Library. The research conducted is divided into several main points, including:

#### **A. Notifier Style**

The informant style is when a leader gives clear instructions to his subordinates. Each task that will be provided is always instructed on how to do it well. In addition to instructing in this style, the leader also supervises the work done by subordinates. At this point, almost the same responses were found from the librarians of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta. The similarities contain several sub-points of questions, including the leader always giving clear instructions, which is helpful so that the work given or ordered can be completed quickly. Then if subordinates still experience misunderstanding, the librarian, without objections, repeats a teacher's instructions. Work in more detail so that it can be better understood.

*"My response is that the head of the librarian always has clear instructions and directions and gives detailed explanations so that a job can be completed in one go. If there is work that the librarian still does not understand, the librarian is happy to repeat his instructions to us. This matter shows a leader with open arms ready to help and direct his subordinates for technical work instructions."*

NH, the librarian, also expressed the same response. The response was as follows: "the attitude shown by the head of the library is excellent, the instructions given are very clear, and if there is still insufficient information, the head is happy to repeat the previous *"instruction."* Likewise, the response from the librarian with the initials AD, who revealed *"the instructions given by the head of the library are very understandable, because each instruction given is explained in detail the intent and purpose of a job so that the expected results are relevant to the intentions desired by the head of the library."*

Every appeal given regarding an instruction must have flaws either from the giver or the message recipient. Even explicit instruction is still challenging to understand for some librarians. This problem is explained by DAF, who says, *"The age factor and the work environment factor. When viewed in terms of age, they do not know about more advanced and modern work tools and their technical work. Looking at the work environment, maybe someone is in a comfortable work environment and makes friends with other people. People who are lazy to work and tend to be pessimistic"*.

The interview results above show that in the theory of the situational leadership model seen from the informant style, the head of the librarian of the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta has applied this style to his subordinates. It can be seen from several interviews with librarians who said that the head of the library always gives clear instructions and always supervises and controls the work carried out by his subordinates.

### B. Seller Style

Sales style is the style of a leader who consistently provides direction and communicates with his subordinates. For each task assigned to subordinates, the leader will always provide direction for the task. It tells how the flow of work from a given task. In this leadership style, the leader always provides direction and communicates with his subordinates. In each work instruction, the Head of the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta Library also includes examples of what his subordinates must do to complete the work under the directions.

The opinion is in line with that of librarian S, who describes the *"seller"* leadership style. S explains, *"in giving assignments, the head of the librarian first directs his subordinates to provide detailed explanations and direction. The information provided is also equipped with examples of what subordinates should do. With the examples given, we as implementers are, of course, to avoid mistakes in its application, we must respond carefully and well to every direction given, so there are no errors or mistakes in work."*

A librarian with the initials KS said the same thing. He said: "*Before carrying out the orders given, we are usually shown an example of how the task is carried out by the head first, then to get the most out of the given task, we must listen and follow the instructions.*" The importance of the leader's direct involvement, in this case, the head of the library, will greatly affect the performance of his subordinates. With the head's direct intervention, the subordinates' confusion about a job can be answered by the direct example given by the leader.

The interview shows that in the theory of the situational leadership model seen from the sales style, the head of the librarian of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta has applied this style to his subordinates. It can be seen from several interviews with librarians who said that the head of the library at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library was able to motivate and provide support to subordinates so that subordinates felt confident in completing the assigned tasks.

### C. Participatory Style

In the Participative style, the leader encourages sharing ideas, facilitates associates' work, and communicates openly with subordinates. In this case, the attitude shown by the head of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library is very cooperative, explained by the librarians who are the head of the library not rejecting the suggestions given by subordinates. It is aimed at the future progress of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library. However, rejection may occur if no consensus is found on an idea or ideas given by members.

According to several sources, the reality at the Muhammadiyah University Library in Jakarta is that the leadership of the head of the library currently adopts a participatory style. It is following the results of interviews conducted with one of the resource persons with the initials TM who is a librarian at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library: "*The head of the library is very receptive to the inputs given by his subordinates, which often opens up opportunities for discussion to see every idea and idea related to the progress of the library from the members, yes, it is positive the head can accept the suggestions of the member, has there ever been an idea it was rejected, yes because there is no agreement between subordinates, usually not from the leadership.*"

In addition to TM, the same thing was also expressed by D, a librarian at the central library of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta. He revealed that: "*The leadership system of the head of the library at Muhammadiyah Jakarta*

*University is very transparent, in which inputs from subordinates are highly valued and accommodated. Then all the existing members are always invited to exchange ideas to come up with new ideas and innovations that can be applied in the library. Intense communication makes the distance between leaders and subordinates seem like nothing."*

The same thing was also expressed by R that *"leadership today is also inseparable from the personality of the leader himself who is firm, disciplined, totality and personality that is willing to accept input from his subordinates, because he considers all input very useful, both in terms of development as well as evaluation material which parts must be improved so that library development can run well and smoothly."*

From the results of these interviews and related to situational leadership styles, it can be concluded that the current leadership adheres to situational leadership. However, the pros and cons of the agreed and realized policies are still found, but apart from that, all the traits applied by the head are very appropriate. They want to receive input from their subordinates, which positively impacts the agency because they feel they will be very appreciated, especially in the decision-making process for sustainable library development.

#### D. Delegating Style

In the delegating style, the leader tends to shift responsibility for the decision-making process and its implementation. In this situation, if seen and interpreted at a glance, the stigma that will appear is negative. It is due to the notion of letting go of a leader's hands on a task and delegating it to his subordinates. However, the story differs from what happened in the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library. The research results from the sources stated that the head of the library sometimes often delegated the responsibility of a job to his subordinates. However, before doing this, the head of the library explained the intent and purpose clearly to their subordinates.

As stated by one of the librarians with the initials TM the following: *"once on occasion, the head sent an envoy to attend a meeting representing the library of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta, here before ordering to attend the meeting. Usually, he had explained in advance the function of the activities to be followed. so that subordinates can have an idea of what needs to be prepared later"*. This continuous thing was also expressed by another librarian with the initials N. *"The headmaster sometimes often delegates responsibility to his subordinates to attend an event or an activity related to the library. Moreover, he is kinda hesitant to attend these activities."*

From the results of the interview above, it is seen that the attitude of the delegation's leadership style is also adopted, where he will assign staff or librarians who are competent in the field to represent them. Then later, the results of the delegation will be discussed and informed to all subordinates. It is always to update the knowledge of all subordinates. Because of the head of the Muhammadiyah University Jakarta Library's totality, firm character, and ability to act according to the conditions he adopts, he adopts a situational leadership style in leading the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library.

## CONCLUSION

---

**139**

The research that has been done from the results of the analysis of the leadership style theory of the head of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library can be concluded that the leadership at the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library adheres to a situational leadership style system by examining it through four aspects, namely storytelling style, sales style, participatory style, and delegation style. In accordance with the theory obtained by the head of the Muhammadiyah Jakarta university librarian, it should be an example for the heads of units in all faculties of the Muhammadiyah University of Jakarta. So that both the head of the central librarian and the head of the faculty librarian work together in realizing a good library that can be emulated by his subordinates.

From all these aspects, the Muhammadiyah Jakarta university library meets the criteria for the type of situational leadership style. The head of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta Library has a firm attitude, totality, and enthusiasm. He is a leader who is always able to adapt to all existing conditions. And he is also very strong and gentle towards his performance and the performance of his subordinates.

The ideal leadership element is already owned by the head librarian of the University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta, it can be seen from the positive stigma that his subordinates put out, thus making the library a library development that can happen quickly. Furthermore, judging from the application of the leadership style of the head of the Muhammadiyah Jakarta university library, it is very suitable to be applied in the Muhammadiyah Jakarta University library because it can adapt to the work environment that occurs in that place.

## REFERENCES

- Andriansyah. (2015). *Kepemimpinan Visioner Kepala Daerah: Kajian dan Teori*. Fakultas Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Prof. Dr. Moestopo Beragama.
- Djafri, N. (2017, February). *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah (Pengetahuan Manajemen, Efektivitas, Kemandirian Keunggulan Bersaing dan Kecerdasan Emosi)*. Deepublish.
- Hadi, A. (2021). *Penelitian Kualitatif: Studi Fenomenologi, Case Study, Grounded Theory, Etnografi, Biografi*. Penerbit Pena Persada.
- Krisnawulan, A. (2005). *Analisis Gaya Kepemimpinan Situasional Manager Pada Divisi Logistik*. PT. Dunkindo Lestari.
- Molantong, C., Boham, A., & Golung, A. M. (2015). *Gaya Kepemimpinan Kepala Perpustakaan Terhadap Motivasi Kerja Pegawai di Perpustakaan Arsip dan Dokumentasi Kota Kotamobagu*.
- Nawawi, H. (2003). *Kepemimpinan Mengefektifkan Organisasi*. Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Rambet, A. (2022). *Gaya Kepemimpinan: Meningkatkan Motivasi dan Kinerja Karyawan*.
- Rifauddin, M., Nurma Halida, A., Kholis, N., Studi Psikologi Islam, P., Tulungagung, I., Studi Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, P., & Mayor Sujadi Timur, J. (2020). Gaya kepemimpinan transformasional dan situasional di perpustakaan akademik. *Berkala Ilmu Perpustakaan Dan Informasi*, 16(2), 184–197. <https://doi.org/10.22146/BIP.V16I2.36>
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan R&D*. Alfabeta.