

THE HISTORY OF THE DEVELOPMENT THE HAJJ PILGRIMAGE IN TURKEY: HISTORICAL AND CONTEMPORARY PERSPECTIVES

Faishal Sultan Bagaskara

Fakultas Adab dan Humaniora UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

Email: faishal.bagas12@gmail.com

ABTRACT

The management of the Hajj pilgrimage in Turkey continues to evolve as the ruling government regime changes. During the Ottoman Turkish period, the Hajj was managed directly by the Sultanate. When the Republic of Turkey was established and gradually eliminated the religious aspect, the religious institution also transformed, followed by the Religious institution which was then managed by the State which upholds secularism. This article examines the development of Hajj in the Republic of Turkey from a historical and contemporary perspective by tracing the process of change in accordance with political conditions from the Ottoman Turkish period to the modern period. The finding of this research is that the dynamics of religious activities, especially Hajj, cannot be dissociated from the influence of political transformations that occurred throughout the Ottoman Turkish era, the Republic until the 21st century. The method used in this research is descriptive analytical which refers to the historical research method.

Keywords: *Hajj Journey, Republic of Türkiye*

INTRODUCTION

Hajj is one of the pillars of Islam that is implemented if a Muslim has the capability to perform it. The criterion of it refers to the individual's capabilities in terms of health and travelling expenses. Hajj is a very desirable goal for Muslims around the world, particularly in predominantly Muslim countries, one of which is the Republic of Turkey. Although it has transformed into a secular state since the establishment of the Republic of Turkey, the enthusiasm of the Turkish Muslim community to perform the Hajj has not decreased.

The Ottoman were one of the largest non-Arabic Islamic dynasties that succeeded in expanding their power to Mecca. In addition, The Sultan also claimed its ruler as a spiritual leader for Muslims around the world inspired by classical Islamic politics that began during the reign of Sultan Salim I. Therefore, it is not surprising that there were other Islamic kingdoms around the world that sought legitimacy or favour from the ruler of Ottoman (Hamid, 2020, 11).

Makkah, which was previously under the rule of the Mamluk Sultanate, through Sharif Barakat II bin Muhammad al Hashimi declared its allegiance to the Ottoman Turks. After realising that Sultan Salim I had taken control of Cairo, the sharif of Makkah sent his son, Abu Numayy, to Cairo to declare his allegiance to the Ottomans by handing over the key of the Ka'bah and Medina (Ats Tsunayyan, 2018, 331)

In spite of officially becoming the key holder of the two holy cities, Sultan Selim I still appointed Sharif Barakat II bin Muhammad al Hashimi as the Governor of Mecca and Hijaz and gave him a wide range of authority. In addition, The Ottomans also provided abundant waqf for the benefit of Makkah and Madinah. Meanwhile, the revenue received from the Hijaz was kept exclusively in the treasury of the Sultanate's palace (Ash Shallabi, 2016, 373).

After defeating and occupying the Mamluk Sultanate's territories that included Egypt, the Eastern Mediterranean and Haramayn, the Ottoman Turks officially took over the organisation of the Hajj pilgrimage journey to Mecca until 1923 (Erkan, 2019, 426).

The success of the Ottoman in expanding the territory of their dynasty during the time of Sultan Salim I, has confirmed their image as the front guard in maintaining Sunni orthodoxy and was further reinforced when Sultan Selim I (1512-1520) gave himself the title of Caliph and *Khadim al-Haramayn* (Steward of the Holy Land). After the reign of Sultan Selim I, subsequent Ottoman sultans continued to take important steps to ensure the safety of the pilgrimage, including those from the Indonesian archipelago. In fact, Sultan Sulaiman I (1520-1566) in 1538 commissioned the Egyptian Governor Khadim Sulaiman Pasha to liberate all ports controlled by the Portuguese in order to maintain the safety of voyages for the Hajj to the Port in Jeddah (Burhanuddin, 2016, 375)

The control of the Hijaz region also became extremely important for the Ottoman as the guardians of the two Holy Lands of Mecca and Medina from the efforts of the Portuguese naval fleet that sought to establish colonies

in areas directly adjacent to the Indian Ocean. As explained by Ash-Shalabi, he quotes from *Mauqif Aruba min Daulah al Uthmaniyyah* written by Dr. Yusuf Ats Tsaqafi. The Portuguese tried to control the Prophet's Mosque and the tomb of the Prophet Muhammad, as a pledge that would be used to reclaim the holy city of Jerusalem from Muslims (Ash Shallabi, 2016, 377).

Therefore, the Ottoman played a vital role in the growth of the pilgrimage to Mecca, not only for pilgrims from their own country but also for the Islamic empires in other parts of the world. After the downfall of the Ottoman Turkish Caliphate, Turkey entered the Republican period, where the new government led by Mustafa Kemal Atatürk in Ankara, decided to modernise Turkey by implementing the idea of secularism in every aspect of life. The modernisation also transformed the religious institution that had been managed by Şeyhülislam for hundreds years into a new religious institution that was established by the *Grand National Assembly*.

Şeyhülislam itself had the political and religious authority to regulate and manage Islamic religious affairs. This was because the Ottoman Empire had a legal system based on Shari'ah and the Islamic legal code (Erdem, 2008, 201). In addition, Şeyhülislam also had the important task of advising the Sultan. It was a common practice that the Ottoman sultans would summon the Grand Vizier or Şeyhülislam to the palace if The Sultan was about to formed on an important state decision (Erdem, 2008, 203).

According to Mundzier Suparta, Harun Nasution explained that not long after Mustafa Kemal died, there was a "return to religion" movement in Turkey (Suparta, 1996, 22). This was evidenced by the slow 'rebirth' of Islamic elements from the 1950s to the 21st century, particularly with the escalation of public enthusiasm for the Hajj.

This research will analyse the historical dynamics of the development of Hajj in Turkey from the Ottoman Turkish Dynasty to the Republic of Turkey, whose transformation was also affected by the political dynamics that took place since 1923 when Mustafa Kemal's secular government began implementing regulations that marginalised religious aspects until the 21st century.

This research uses a historical research method that has several stages, including: heuristics (source collection), verification (source criticism), interpretation and historiography (Kuntowijoyo, 2013, 69). Heuristics is a technique of searching and collecting data or sources. In this process the author uses the library research method, in this case the author refers to sources such as books or articles that discuss the history of the implementation of Hajj and

Umrah in Turkey in the period since the establishment of the Republic of Turkey to the contemporary period. Then at the verification stage, the author sorts out the sources that have been obtained whose discussion is closer to the discussion to be analysed. Furthermore, at the interpretation stage, a description process is carried out which will then be presented in the final stage, which is writing (historiography).

THEORETICAL BASE

Definition of Hajj

Harun Nasution, stated that Hajj is one of the worship services that aims to purify the spirit. During the Hajj in Makkah, pilgrims visit the Baitullah (House of God, which means the first house of worship established by God's command in this world) (Nasution, 1985, 32).

According to al Jaziri in *al Fiqh 'ala al Madhahib al Arba'ah*, Hajj etymologically means intending something that is honoured. Meanwhile, according to terminology, Hajj is an activity that is specifically carried out at a particular time and location with a specific purpose.

Meanwhile, in *Fiqh al-Hajj* written by Ibn Taymiyyah, it is explained that Hajj means having a desire or willingness and based on *Shara'* it means having the motivation to visit the *Baitullah al-Haram* in order to carry out worship as an obligation upon Allah's command.

Then according to the view of the majority of scholars, etymologically Hajj means desiring to do something that is honoured. As for the term *shara'* is the intention to visit a certain place (*Baitullah al-Haram* and *Arafah*) at a specified time to perform all the practices that are the legitimate requirements of Hajj.

The Prophet Muhammad SAW pointed out that Hajj is an act of worship that is obligatory for all Muslim men and women who are physically and financially able to perform it once in a lifetime. Therefore, the basis of Hajj in Islam, apart from being based on the Qur'an and Hadith, is also an act of worship that has become an agreement of the people on its obligation, so whoever denies it, he is a disobedient person (Nuri, 2014, 145).

Therefore, from a Fiqh judicial point of view, Hajj is one of the obligatory acts of worship for every Muslim who has the capability to undertake it. This is stated in Surah Ali Imran Verse 97: "*There are clear signs,*

(among them) the station of Ibrahim. Whoever enters it (Baitullah) is safe. And (among) the duties of man towards Allah is to perform the pilgrimage to the House of Allah, for those who are able to travel there. Whoever denies the obligation of Hajj, then know that Allah is rich (in need of nothing) of all the universe."

Therefore, it can be concluded that Hajj is one of the acts of worship that is undertaken by a Muslim in Mecca to visit the House of Allah and perform a series of rituals required for its validity. Hajj is obligatory for Muslims who are able, that is, Muslims who have the ability in terms of health and finance.

Definition of Secularism and the Model of Secularism in Republic of Turkey

Regarding the contemporary period in Turkey, it cannot be separated from the main sky of the Republic of Turkey, which is very closely related to the secularism system declared since 29 October 1923. Therefore, this research will discuss the definition of secularism in general and the model of secularism in Turkey.

Western tradition explains that, secularism refers to several meanings, such as the separation of religion from the world, unholiness, rationality, scientism and modernism. Etymologically, secularism comes from the Latin *saeculum*. Meanwhile, in terms of terminology, secularism means everything that deals with this world, as well as indirectly disconnected from religion (Qaramaliki, 2011, 7)

According to Alfian, Turkish secularism (*laiklik*) was inspired by *Laïcité* (The principles of French Secularism) Philosophically, this understanding requires faith and religion to be transformed into the principle of rationality. Politically, it places state power above the religious order (Alfian, 2018, 13)

The secularism that took place in Turkey in the early phases of the Republic's formation was solely aimed at modernising Turkish society in all aspects of life, from political, social and cultural. Alfian also pointed out that modernisation in Turkey that marginalises Islamic groups is an integral part of Kemalist reforms that aim to make Turkey a modern secular state like European countries (Alfian, 2018, 38)

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Hajj during The Ottoman Period

As one of the largest Islamic dynasties in the world, the passion of the Ottoman Turkish leaders for the two Holy Lands of Mecca and Medina had been nurtured by them long before the expansion of the Daulah's territory during Sultan Salim I's time.

Mehmet Maksudoğlu explained that every year the Ottoman used to send gifts (*surre*) to the people of Makkah and Madinah. It was first performed by Sultan Mehmed Celebi (1413-1421). The activity continued from 1517 until the period of World War I in the 20th century. *Surre Emini* (head of the Surre group) performing the pilgrimage on behalf of the Sultan (Maksudoğlu, 2023, 167).

Ash-Shalabi also elaborated on the fact that when Sultan Muhammad II *al-Fatih* conquered Constantinople in 1453, he immediately sent the good news to the ruler of Makkah. Moreover, he also asked for prayers from the ruler of Makkah and delivered presents (Ash Shallabi, 2016, 250).

The Ottoman were very protective towards their citizens who travelled to undertake the Hajj pilgrimage. If we trace the period before the reign of Sultan Salim I, in the period 1485 to 1491 when Sultan Beyazid II became the ruler of Ottoman Turkey, conflict arose between Ottoman Turkey and the Mamluk Sultanate, one of the triggers was caused by the neglect of pilgrims from Ottoman by the Mamluk Sultanate. it was then responded by sending Ottoman Turkish troops to Hijaz to look after their pilgrims while in Hijaz (Ats Tsunayyan, 2021).

During the Ottoman Period, they utilised Damascus as a gathering point for pilgrims from Istanbul, Anatolia, Rumelia (Ottoman territory in the Balkan Peninsula, covered Greece to Bulgaria) and the Khanates of Central Asia travelling to the Haramayn, Due to the conflict between Ottoman Turkey and the dynasties in Iran, pilgrims from the Central Asian Khanate could only travelled north to the port of Kefe (Crimea Island) and the port of Özi (Mykolaiv Oblast). In 1869, there were pilgrims from Rumelia who chose the route via the Suez Canal (Erkan, 2019, 434).

In 1900 during the reign of Sultan Abdul Hamid II, the project to build the Hijaz railway line on the Damascus-Madinah route was established. This railway line was expected to shorten the duration of the journey for the pilgrims

from Anatolia by approximately four to five days, compared to the caravan route or the sea route which took more than ten days. The construction of the Hijaz railway was not merely for Hajj purposes, but also had political and military purposes (Ash Shallabi, 2016, 758).

Erkan mentioned that according to the civil records of the Ottoman period, there are numerous lists of people who had the title of Hajj, but there is no information available on the population numbers who performed the pilgrimage during that period (Erkan, 2019, 428).

Ultimately, it can be concluded that during the period of the Ottoman, the implementation of the Hajj was administrated by the government agencies under the direct supervision of the ruling Sultan. The enthusiasm of the people to perform Hajj in this period was encouraged by the Government by providing plenty of facilities to facilitate and streamline the pilgrimage route.

The Early Republic under Mustafa Kemal Atatürk

Since their childhood, Turkish villagers have had an orientation towards Makkah, which has been a point of view that goes hand in hand with their psyches and spirituality. However, after the victory of the secularists, they changed this perspective by placing the spiritual aspect into the realm of individual beliefs (Delaney, 1990, 517).

There are no historians who can deny that Islamic Shari'a had a strong influence on the lives of the Turkish people. In fact, throughout its history, The Ottoman Dynasty was an international and national Islamic institution of power that existed for hundreds of years until Mustafa Kemal dismantled it in the early 1920s. Then he formed a new identity of the Modern Turkish nation which was far from Islamic spirituality elements (Mahfud, 2020, 51).

According to Feroz Ahmad in *The Making of Modern Turkey*, after the establishment of the Republican era, it was argued that "Modern Turkey did not emerge 'from the ashes of the Ottoman Turkish Empire'. Rather, it was 'shaped through the vision of Kemalist elites who triumphed in the national struggle against foreign invaders and the old regime (Alfian, 2018, 38).

Mustaka Kemal known as the founder of secularism, especially in Turkey. Turkey was the first Muslim-majority country to declare itself secular and to make the separation of politics and religion its officially recognised policy.

In 1937, all the fundamental principles of the Turkish Republic first formalised in the constitution. These became known as Kemalism (*Atatürkçülük/Atatürkçü Düşünce*) symbolised by six arrows (*altı ok*), each meaning republicanism (*cumhuriyetçilik*), populism (*halkçılık*), secularism (*laiklik*), revolutionism (*devrimcilik*) and nationalism (*milyetçilik, ulusçuluk*). According to Erik J. Zürcher, this kind of Kemalism is frequently labelled as "Turkish religion," or at least has reconstructed "Turkish Islam," which refers to religious practice as an individual concern, in spite of the fact that the practice is still controlled by the state (Alfian, 2018, 42)

The enthusiasm for Hajj began to change along with the replacement of the ruling regime. The transition was signalled by the establishment of the Grand National Assembly on 23 April 1920, which symbolised the establishment of the Republic of Turkey. The Assembly then replaced the previously established *Şeyhülislam* institution with a new institution, the *Şeriye ve Evkaf Vekaleti* (Ministry of Shari'ah) on 2 May 1920. This institution was later changed again to *Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı* (DİB) (Korkut, 2016, 42)

At that time, the government began to marginalise religion in various aspects. This had an impact on the dynamics of the Hajj pilgrimage where government institutions did not prioritise religious affairs. Mundzier Suparta, quoting from Harun Nasution, states that the implementation of the Hajj pilgrimage in the early days of the Republic had been suspended and gradually reappeared in 1950 (Suparta, 1996, 22).

Organising Hajj during the Republic of Turkey

In organising the Hajj, countries have a duty to accommodate their citizens in participating in the pilgrimage. The effort to provide the facilitation is through establishing an organisation that is responsible for pilgrims during their journey.

Organisation is a group of people formed to maximise potential, through good management, clear division of labour, structured, mutually cooperative and constructive in achieving common goals. Within the context of organising the Hajj, the government has an obligation and holds responsibility for the success of this national task, whether it is related to policy, implementation, and supervision. The organisation of Hajj is the responsibility of the ministry, in its daily implementation, structurally and technically functional.

The implementation of Hajj in the Republic of Turkey managed by the *Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı* (DİB) (Directorate of Religious Affairs in Turkey). Korkut explained that Diyanet is an essential government institution that has branches at the central and provincial levels. Diyanet was established on 3 March 1924 as a successor to the *Şeriye ve Evkaf Vekaleti* (Shari'ah Ministry) which was established by the Grand National Assembly on 23 April 1920 (Korkut, 2010, 118)

DİB officially began organising the pilgrimage in 1979. Previously, Turkish pilgrims performed the pilgrimage without an official organisation from the government, which caused serious problems. During the period from 1979 to 1988, DİB cooperated with *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı* (TDV) (Turkish Religious Institute) in the conduct of the pilgrimage (Karasu, 2017, 759).

Smith observes that in 2003, following the reestablishment of relations with Arab countries under then Foreign Minister Abdullah Gul, Ankara had been negotiating with the Saudis to increase Turkey's annual quota of pilgrims to Makkah from 80,000 to 100,000 (Smith, 307). Therefore, DİB also took the necessary actions in Hajj programme by collaborating with other countries and relevant institutions that are related to the security of the Hajj pilgrimage (Karasu, 2017, 759).

Karasu explained that DİB has a responsibility to organise, conduct and maintain the Turkish Hajj pilgrims in terms of their safety and health during their pilgrimage to the Holy Land (Karasu, 2017, 759). Erkal also mentioned that since 1978, the Directorate of Religious Affairs of Turkey has been continuously improving its services in organising the Hajj journey. It ensures the safety of the pilgrims to the holy land in order to fulfil their worship obligations in a good and proper way and return to Turkey safely (Erkal, 2001, 160).

Some of the facilities that provided by DİB include Hajj education services for pilgrims, such as the provision of Hajj and Umrah study guidebooks, seminars or Hajj preparation courses held by the mufti office in each city or province. Generally, the materials presented in the course include: understanding of Hajj (health and nutrition, security, hotel accommodation, prohibitions during ihram, pilgrimage in Makkah and Madinah, fines and exposure to Umrah (Karasu, 2017, 760).

Akbulut and Ekin pointed out that according to data released by the Riyadh Central Department of Statistics, Turkey is the third highest country of pilgrims among non-Arab countries. As reported by the latest data provided by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Turkey, in 2016 there were

500,528 Turkish pilgrims who travelled to Saudi Arabia to perform Hajj and Umrah (Akbulut & Ekin, 2018, 19).

Karasu found an interesting data, that DİB provided the opportunity or additional pilgrimage quota for the veterans and martyrs' families of the Turkish coup event that happened on 15 July 2016 (Karasu, 2017, 759). Yumuşak and Bilgin explained that in recent years the number of people in Turkey who wished to perform the Hajj pilgrimage had significantly increased. Based on data from the distribution of pilgrims in 2017 by country released by al Jazeera, Turkish pilgrims totalled 79,000 people (Yumuşak & Bilgin, 2021, 6).

In 2020, the Hajj quota announced by DİB, totalled 83,430 out of a total of 2,298,800 applicants. However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic that hit the world, the scheduled Hajj departures were cancelled and a limited number of pilgrims departed in 2021, which resulted in an increase in the waiting list in the following years (Yumuşak & Bilgin, 2021, 8).

Zekiye Demir's research on female Hajj pilgrims found that Hajj can lead to improvements in individual attitudes and behaviour. After performing the Hajj, the quality of their worship has been enhanced, such as wearing the hijab, being more patient, and improving their awareness of the ephemerality of life in this world (Demir, 2014, 127).

An Analysis of the Hajj Pilgrimage Development in the Republic of Turkey

Based on the data exposure above, I found several points that are appropriate to analyse:

- 1) After the transformation of Turkey from a state with an Islamic caliphate system to a republic with secularisation principles. The policy resulted in the restriction of religious rights, for the example in the implementation of the Hajj, which had decreased the enthusiasm of pilgrims in the early days of the Republic of Turkey.
- 2) The freedom of religion returned to the surface after the relaxation of secularism in 1946, although it was still under strict government supervision. During this period, the Republic of Turkey did not have a proper constitution for an official state institution to manage the Hajj. In spite of the fact that, the people enthusiasm of Hajj departures in Turkey did not subside.

- 3) The religious policies, particularly in the implementation of Hajj in Turkey are closely related to the policies of the Government of the Republic of Turkey.

Comparatively, the number of Turkish pilgrims from the early Republic to the contemporary period has a significant discrepancy. The difference is strongly influenced by the role of the government. In the case of Turkey, the variation in the number of pilgrims can be seen from the regulation of the government of the Republic of Turkey, which is very strict in supervising religious activities. This condition changed, however, when the Government of the Republic of Turkey began to gradually reform religious policies, especially in the 21st century when the AKP was in control of the government. During that period, Turkish enthusiasm for the Hajj pilgrimage greatly increased. Furthermore, the additional Hajj quota to honour the families of martyrs and veterans of the 2016 Turkish coup has shown that the Turkish government has a substantial role in improving the religious atmosphere in the midst of secularist ideology.

CONCLUSIONS

Turkey and Islam are inseparable, due to the roots of Islamic culture since the Ottoman Empire. However, in the early 20th century, when the Republic of Turkey transformed its political direction into a republic, it encouraged Turkey to modernise in various aspects of life by implementing secularist ideas. It greatly impacted the restriction of religious freedom, particularly in the implementation of the Hajj pilgrimage.

In the early days of the Republic the pilgrimage was prohibited. Then during the period of loosening of secularism atmosphere in Turkey in 1946, the enthusiasm of the Turkish people in performing the pilgrimage gradually increased until today. The departure of Mustafa Kemal in 1938 led to the relaxation of secular Kemalism. It greatly influenced the enthusiasm of the Turkish people to improve their religiosity, specifically in performing the Hajj under the auspices of secularism with the military as its guardian.

Therefore, it can be concluded that government regulations are very influential on religious aspects. If the government restricts religious freedom, then religious expression will experience decadence, while if the government provides religious freedom, then public interest in worship will continue to increase.

REFERENCES

- Akbulut, O., & Ekin, Y. (2018). Impact of Hajj and Umrah Pilgrimage on religious stories in Mugla-Turke. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 6(3), 17-29.
- Alfian, M. Alfian. (2018). *Militer dan Politik di Turki: Dinamika Politik Pasca-AKP Hingga Gagalnya Kudeta*, Jakarta: Penjuru Ilmu.
- Ats-Tsunayyan, M. K. (2021). Ertugrul: Sejarah Turki Utsmani dari Kabilah ke Imperium.
- Ash-Shallabi, Ali Muhammad. (2016). *Sejarah Daulah Utsmaniyyah: Faktor-Faktor Kebangkitan dan Sebab-Sebab Keruntuhannya*. Penerjemah: Imam Fauzi, Jakarta: Ummul Qura.
- Burhanudin, Jajat. (2016) "Pasang Surut Hubungan Aceh dan Turki Usmani: Perspektif Sejarah" *Studia Islamika*, 23 (2).
- Demir, Z. (2014). Haccın Kadınları Dönüştürücü Etkileri. *Diyanet İlmî Dergi*, 50(2), 103-129
- Delaney, C. (1990). The Hajj: sacred and secular. *American ethnologist*, 17(3), 513-530,
- Erdem, G. (2008). Religious Services in Turkey: From the Office of Şeyhülislâm to the Diyanet. *The Muslim World*, 98(2-3), 199-215.
- Erkal, M. (2001). HAC EMİRLİĞİ (YÖNETİMİ) VE BUNUNLA İLGİLİ BAZI FIKHI MESELELER. *Sakarya Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi (SAUIFD)*, 3(4), 145-161
- Erkan, N. (2019). SİCİLLER IŞIĞINDA MEŞAKKATLİ BİR İBADET OLAN HAC VE OSMANLI HACILARI. *Celal Bayar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 17(03), 423-451.
- Hamid, Noor. (2020). *Manajemen Haji dan Umrah: Mengelola Perjalanan Tamu Allah ke Tanah Suci*, Yogyakarta: Semesta Aksara.
- Karasu, T. (2017). Hacı Aday ların ın Eğitimi ve Bu Eğitime İlişkin Görüşlerinin Değerlendirilmesi Muş İli Örneği. *Researcher*, 5(4), 756-769, h. 759

Korkut, Ş. (2010). The Diyanet of Turkey and its activities in Eurasia after the Cold War. *Acta Slavica Japonica*, (28), 117-139.

Korkut, Ş. (2016). The Diyanet of Turkey and Its Historical Evolution. *International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, 11(17), 447-466.

Kuntowijoyo, (2013). *Pengantar Ilmu Sejarah*, Yogyakarta, Tiara Wacana.

Mahfud, M. (2020). Pemikiran Islam Modern Perspektif Mustafa Kemal. *FATAWA: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 1(1), 44-55.

Maksudoğlu, Mehmet. (2023) *The Untold History of Ottoman: Menelusuri Daulah Islamiyah Terbesar di Dunia dan Pemerintahannya*. Penerjemah: Wisnu Tanggap Prabowo, et.all. Jakarta: Pustaka al Kautsar.

Nasution, Harun. (1985) *Islam Ditinjau dari Berbagai Aspeknya Jilid I*, Jakarta, UI Press.

Nuri, M. (2014). Pragmatisme Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji Di Indonesia. *SALAM: Jurnal Sosial Dan Budaya Syar-I*, 1 (1).

Rohayati, Tati. Kebijakan Politik Turki Utsmani di Hijaz 1512-1566 M, *Al Turas*, XXI (2), Juli, 2015

Smith, T. W. (2005). Between Allah and Atatürk: Liberal Islam in Turkey. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 9(3), 307-325.

Suparta, M. (1996). *Pembaharuan pemikiran keagamaan masa dan pasca Mustafa Kemal di Negara Turki*. IAIN Jakarta.

Qaramaliki, Muhammad Hasan Qadrđan (2011) *Al Qur'an dan Sekularisme: Agama dan Politik di antara Pengalaman Religius dan Falsafah Kenabian*. Penerjemah: Ammar Fauzi Heryadi. Jakarta, Sadra International Institute.

Yumuşak, İ. G., & Bilgin, R. (2021). HAC İBADETİNİN MALİ ZORLUKLARINI AŞMADA BİR MODEL ÖNERİSİ: TÜRKİYE HAC SANDIĞI. *İslam Ekonomisi ve Finansı Dergisi (İEFD)*, 7(1), 1-32.