Overview of Halal Cosmetics in a Decade: A Bibliometric Analysis

Wan Suryani¹, Irwan Mohd Subri², Ahmad Rafiki³, Fitriani Tobing⁴, Sutan Emir Hidayat⁵

Abstract. This article applies bibliometric analysis to examine existing works and literature on halāl cosmetics to explore the concept’s evolving journey since its emergence. The bibliometric approaches applied are citation, co-citation, and co-occurrence of author keywords of 137 publications extracted from the Scopus database between 2004 and September 2021. This research examines and elaborates on the type and direction of research on halāl cosmetics undertaken over the last few decades. It also identifies the topic’s most influential writers, journals, institutions, and countries. A short SWOT analysis includes in this study. This study provides academics and practitioners with detailed insights into the halāl cosmetics concepts to be used as a reference for strategic efforts.

Keywords: Halal, Cosmetics, Bibliometric Analysis, Scopus


Kata kunci: Halal, Kosmetik, Analisis Bibliometrik, Scopus
Introduction

Indonesia is staunchly built on the Muslim population that offers enormous potential and development of halāl products, sectors and industries. Global Religious Future data shows that Indonesia’s Muslim population in 2020 has reached 229.6 million people, equivalent to 87.2% of the total population. The growing demand for halāl products in Indonesia also shows a positive direction. This makes Indonesia a potential market for the marketing of halāl cosmetic products. If the halāl product market was previously considered limited and less profitable, halāl products have become a prime resource that can increase foreign exchange.

Since the dawn of civilization, food and pharmaceutical products (medicines, cosmetics and personal care products) have been the earliest human needs (Mursidi, 2013). However, Muslims have strict religious guidelines when it comes to consumption and use. For example, Allah commands Muslims to consume only those things which are Halal (i.e. religiously permissible) and good (Quran, 23:51). Namely, Muslims are obligated to consume and use only halāl products (Rezai et al., 2009; Salehudin and Luthi, 2011; Rahim and Junos, 2012).

The fact that Indonesia is an excellent market for the cosmetic industry is in line with the growing halāl lifestyle worldwide, especially among Muslims in Indonesia (Adinugraha & Sartika, 2019). The concept of halāl or Islam was traditionally acknowledged and applied to food products and banking & financial services but later developed into other product categories, including cosmetics (Islam & Chandrasekaran, 2013). In 2014, the global Muslim cosmetic industry spent $54 billion, or about 7% of world spending, and is projected to increase in 2020 by $80 billion (Yuswati, 2018). The cosmetic industry in Indonesia booked a positive trend of 20% in 2018 compared to the previous year. This was mainly triggered by the significant demand from the domestic and export markets, especially for women, who were the main target of the cosmetic industry (Ministry of Industry, 2018). In Asia-Pacific, China and India, the high demand for colored cosmetics from 2015 to 2020. Color cosmetics are dyes and cosmetics used in eye shadow, foundation, nail polish, lipstick, and others (Mohammadzadeh, 2015).

Several cosmetic brands of its predecessors then followed. Cosmetic products use halāl certification as a brand as the main selling point to answer the growing trend of demand for halāl products for Muslim women in Indonesia. Moreover, awareness of the importance of halāl brands in the cosmetic industry among customers is still lacking (Rajagopal et al., 2011). It was revealed that research and publications on halāl cosmetics are still scarce. There are gaps to fulfill by
elaborating the map or trend on *halāl* cosmetics, which could be a reference for future research. *Halāl* awareness is influenced by various factors such as *halāl* knowledge by frequently participating in *halāl* development events or *halāl* exhibitions, *halāl* training, and the *halāl* certification process (Nusran et al., 2018). In addition, *halāl* awareness among consumers, *halāl* product quality certification, and market promotion have a positive effect on consumers’ purchase intentions for *halāl* products (Hussin et al., 2013; Majid et al., 2015). As a majority Muslim country, Indonesia has challenges regarding the lack of public awareness of the importance of *halāl* products and understanding of *halāl* law.

**Literature Review**

Cosmetics symbolize the beauty of a woman who always wants to look beautiful. A Muslim woman uses cosmetics not only to beautify their face but also to show serenity and self-confidence. Therefore they must be more careful in choosing cosmetic products and ensure that the products used are in accordance with religious sharia and have a *halāl* certificate (Briliana et al., 2017).

In contrast to the *halāl* food industry, there is a mixed perspective on *halāl*. Consumers in Malaysia have higher acceptance and intentions toward *halāl* food products than *halāl* cosmetic products (Rahman et al., 2015). However, for the majority of the Muslim population in several Islamic countries, the application of Islamic principles shows differences in their implementation (Rizkityshsha, 2020).

Research conducted by Annabi et al. (2017) explains that many cosmetic choices are available in the market in cosmetic products, most of which originate from non-Muslim countries (Briliana et al., 2017). This raises concern for Muslim consumers (Ahmad et al., 2015). In addition, it is also not accompanied by *halāl* certification.

Delener (1994) suggests that each person has a different level of religiosity, ranging from non-religious to very religious, and these different levels of religiosity affect consumption behavior. According to research conducted by Suhartanto et al. (2020), a person’s level of religiosity does not affect the behavior toward *halāl* cosmetics due to the view of consumers who perceive that cosmetics are different from other *halāl* products.

Cosmetics are only applied on the outside, which cannot be swallowed or enter the body. Therefore in *halāl* cosmetics, consumer loyalty is more influenced by emotional attachment and product quality than religiosity (Suhartanto et al., 2020). This is an input for the *halāl* cosmetic industry to further improve product quality.
and continue innovating to provide excellent service and customer satisfaction. This research is supported by Khan et al. (2020), which state that generation Y is not concerned with religious beliefs in buying halāl cosmetics. The safety factor of cosmetic ingredients and halāl logos are important decision-making considerations in consuming halāl cosmetics.

However, a different opinion was expressed by Rizkitysha (2020) that the higher a person’s level of religiosity, the more likely they are able to identify halāl products and avoid haram products, and the more aware their appreciation of using halāl labels to save shopping time to be more efficient. This opinion is in line with Briliana et al. (2017), which explains that consumers with a high level of religiosity and highly educated are very concerned about halāl labels used to identify halāl cosmetic products.

Halāl cosmetics are considered innovations in the cosmetic industry due to the new ingredient contents that meet customer demands (Mohezar et al., 2016). In 2010, a cosmetic company entered the market by launching as the pioneer of the first halāl label for cosmetics in Indonesia, which prompted similar companies to produce halāl cosmetics. In addition, the halāl certification has become one of the prominent features of the growing trend in the new phenomenon of growing demand for halāl products among Muslim women in several countries. Below is the market value for halāl products as a reference for future research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Realized and Predicted Value (USD, Million)</th>
<th>Value (USD, Million)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Halal Food</td>
<td>1,37 1,97 6,3</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Islamic Finance</td>
<td>2,52 3,47 5,5</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Halal Travel</td>
<td>189 274 6,4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Halal Fashion</td>
<td>283 402 6,0</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Media &amp; Recreation</td>
<td>220 309 5,8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Halal Pharmacy</td>
<td>92 134 6,5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Halal Cosmetics</td>
<td>64 95 6,8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Thomson Reuters (2019)
Methods

A rigorous bibliometric analysis in this study aimed to address all the pre-defined research questions. In addition, bibliometric analysis manifests interconnections among the articles regarding the frequency of an article cited and co-cited by other articles. In addition, this study includes a SWOT analysis to see the phenomenon of the halāl cosmetics industry.

Figure 1. The Process of Bibliometric

This study has retrieved data from Scopus, a comprehensive database that has been used extensively by various researchers for carrying out bibliometric analysis in multiple domains. The primary reason for choosing Scopus is the sheer availability, which is nearly 60 percent larger than the Web of Science (WoS) database (Zhao & Strotmann, 2015). Hence, the authors searched for articles relevant to this study from the Scopus database with the following titles; “Halāl” and “Cosmetics”. The study limits its analysis only to the discipline of “business” and “management”, which emphasizes the subject of halāl cosmetics. The publication dates of the articles range from 2010 to 2021. Additionally, articles and reviews were published only in journals considered for this study, while conference papers are excluded from this study, and the articles were published only in English. A thorough review is done based on selected articles.
Most Cited Article

Table 2 shows the top ten cited articles on the subject of halāl and cosmetics. The documents are ranked in descending order of the number of citations received. The article by A. Mukhtar (2012) is the most cited article, with 196 citations. The next most cited article is the work of M. Tieman (2012). The least citation (10th rank) is an article by D. Yener with 22 citations.

Table 2. Top Ten Most Cited Articles 2010-2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Cites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Mukhtar</td>
<td>Intention to choose halāl products: The role of religiosity</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Tieman</td>
<td>Principles in halāl supply chain management</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Abd Rahman</td>
<td>Consumers and halāl cosmetic products: Knowledge, religiosity, attitude and intention</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Ngah</td>
<td>Applying the TOE framework in the halāl warehouse adoption study</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Izberk-Bilgin</td>
<td>A new look at faith-based marketing: The global halāl market</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Garg</td>
<td>Purchase intention of “Halal” brands in India: the mediating effect of attitude</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Briliana</td>
<td>Exploring antecedents and consequences of Indonesian Muslim youths’ attitude towards halāl cosmetic products: A case study in Jakarta</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Aoun</td>
<td>Building holistic brands: An exploratory study of halāl cosmetics</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Yener</td>
<td>Factors That Affect the Attitudes of Consumers Toward Halal-Certified Products in Turkey</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most Dominant Author

Table 3 shows the most dominant authors in the halāl cosmetics subject. The influence of the authors is measured by the number of articles they have published pertaining to halāl cosmetics vis-a-vis the citations received by each of them. In terms of the total number of citations received, A. Rohman and A.H. Ngah are the most dominant authors, with three documents, respectively.
Table 3. Most Dominant Authors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cite</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A. Rohman</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A.H. Ngah</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>B.L. Yeo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>S. Arbak</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>T.U. Putri</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 shows the average of citations per document led by A.H. Ngah and A.Rohman as the most dominant authors, with 3 and 5 citations per document, respectively.

Table 4: Cite Document Per Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Cites</th>
<th>Cites Per Year</th>
<th>Doc Per Year</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A.H. Ngah</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A. Rohman</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.43</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>B.L. Yeo</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>S. Arbak</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>T.U. Putri</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most Cite Journal

Table 5 shows that the most dominant journals have narrated the concept of halāl cosmetics. On the total number of citations received, the Pertanika Journal of Consumer and Family Economics appears to be the most dominant journal with a total of 17 citations, followed by the International Journal of Supply Chain Management with a total of 4 citations. The Journal of Islamic Marketing has a higher rank with a number of published articles of 25, followed by the International Journal of Supply Chain Management with a number of published articles of 5.
Table 5. Most Dominant Journals (in terms of the total article published)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Cites</th>
<th>Article</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Journal of Islamic Marketing</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>International Journal of Supply Chain Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Malaysian Journal of Consumer and Family Economics</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Pertanika Journal of Social Science and Humanities</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cosmetics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Food Research</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Global Journal Al-Thaqafah</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences Reviews</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>International Food Research Journal</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>International Journal on Advanced Science, Engineering and Information Technology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 shows the average citations received per article. The Journal of Islamic Marketing appears to be the most dominant journal with 14.1 average citations per article, followed by the International Journal of Supply Chain Management with average citations per article of 9.

Table 6. Most Dominant Journal (average cite per year)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Cites</th>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Journal of Islamic Marketing</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>International Journal of Supply Chain Management</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Malaysian Journal of Consumer and Family Economics</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Pertanika Journal of Social Science and Humanities</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Advanced Science Letters</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cosmetics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Food Research</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Global Journal Al-Thaqafah</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences Reviews</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Most Dominant Institutions (in total citations received)

Table 7 shows the most dominant institutions that have published articles on halāl cosmetics. The institutions are plotted based on the authors who have published articles and received citations and affiliations with those institutions. On the total number of published articles, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia and Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia are on the top list, while for the total citations received, the Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia is the highest in the rank with a total citation of 23, followed by the Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia with a count of 20.

Table 7. Most dominant institutions (in total citations received)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cite</th>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A.H. Ngah</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Universiti Malaysia Terengganu</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A. Rohman</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>B.L. Yeo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>University College Tunku Abdul Rahman, Johor</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>S. Arbak</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>School of International Studies, University Utara Malaysia, Sintok, Kedah</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>T.U. Putri</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As depicted in Table 8, based on the average of citations received per article, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia, is the most dominant institution with 19 average citations per document, followed by Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia, with average citations per document of 7.43.
Table 8. Most Dominant Institutions (in average citation per document)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cite</th>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Average cite per year</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A.H. Ngah</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Universiti Malaysia Terengganu</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>A. Rohman</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.43</td>
<td>Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>B.L. Yeo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>University College Tunku Abdul Rahman, Johor</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>S. Arbak</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>School of International Studies, University Utara Malaysia, Sintok, Kedah</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>T.U. Putri</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Bina Nusantara University, Jakarta</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Most Dominant Country**

Table 9 shows the most dominant countries with highly cited papers related to halāl cosmetics. Based on the total citations received, Malaysia appears to be the most dominant country with a citation count of 23, followed by Indonesia with a count of 20.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cite</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the average citation per document, Malaysia is in the top list, as seen in Table 10, where the publication of highly cited articles belongs to the authors from this country. Another dominant country on the list is Indonesia, with a number of average citations per document of 7.43.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cite</th>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Average cite per year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**SWOT Analysis of Halāl Cosmetic Industry**

**Strength**

Based on the data derived from the published articles in the reputable database. It indicates the concern and interest in halāl cosmetics are increasing, which means the opportunities to explore halāl cosmetics products are widely open. There is an increase in the number of publications. Moreover, there is an increase in the percentage of the market value of 6.8% (from 64 to 95 USD million). Many countries now engage with institutions related the halāl certification issuance to increase the number of product registrations of halāl products, such as what has been done by the Indonesian Ulama Council (MUI), which the Halal Products Certification Agency now handles under new national law. This indicates that halāl cosmetics have become a huge target and have prospects.

**Weaknesses**

There are differences in the definition of halāl in each country. This results in the absence of uniformity and inconsistency in the definition of halāl (Ab Talib & Hamid, 2014), as well as the unavailability of halāl cosmetic brands in the market. Another weakness is the non-integration of halāl label registration in the ASEAN region, making it difficult for products distributed in the ASEAN region. Moreover, the development of halāl cosmetics in some countries, including Indonesia, has weaknesses. These include the complexity of the procedure in applying for a halāl certificate and the complicated bureaucracy in obtaining certificates. Expensive rates in obtaining halāl certificates are another issue.

**Opportunity**

The limited number of researchers studying halāl cosmetics are mainly focused on halāl products. Indeed, the awareness of halāl cosmetics has started to grow but is still at a low stage (Shahid et al., 2018). The report mentioned in the State of the Global Islamic Economy Report 2019/2020 shows that the halāl industry’s highest growth is in the halāl cosmetics sector, which is 6.8% compared to other industries. In addition, Indonesia is a country with the largest halāl cosmetics consumers globally and occupies the second position in the halāl cosmetic market after the halāl food industry. The Muslim population in ASEAN countries will increase in 2050, and the increase in the Muslim population will correlate with halāl food and product consumption.
Threat

The threat to *halāl* cosmetics is the lack of uniformity in *halāl* standards (Mahyeddin, 2017). This also could be a challenge for the *halāl* industry. Many illegal cosmetics are circulating in developing countries through social media. The government’s role is to educate the public on the importance of buying legal cosmetic products, including *halāl* ones (Handriana et al., 2019).

Emerging Themes in *Halāl* Cosmetic Literature

**Research agenda related to *halāl* cosmetics highlights several things:**

The religion and religiosity-based consumer segment identified the spiritual dimensions associated with functional and emotional attributes; The country of origin of cosmetic brands has a moderate role to which consumers respond differently; the consumer demographic segment highlights gender and social class in the use of cosmetics; geographical segments of consumers such as Muslim minority countries, Muslim majority, and non-Muslim consumers, the millennial generation has differences in consuming cosmetic products; in Muslim minority countries identify the role of culture and religious identity as factors that can mediate the intention to buy *halāl* cosmetics; for cosmetic products with international brands, it is better to design a marketing campaign that focuses on creating awareness about their compliance with *halāl* products by using open and sharp communication; millennial generation loyalty to *halāl* cosmetic products. There are several things that need to be re-examined, such as religiosity, world views related to *halāl* cosmetics and millennial generation’s loyalty to *halāl* cosmetics (Ali et al., 2018; Annabi & Ibida-Obe, 2017; Briliana & Mursito, 2017; Garg & Joshi, 2018; Handriana et al., 2020; Isabelle Aoun Laurent Tournois, 2015; Ishak et al., 2019; Mukhtar & Butt, 2012; Sama & Trivedi, 2019; Shahid et al., 2017).

Conclusion

This paper aims to explore the subject of *halāl* cosmetics by mapping out its development over ten years with a thorough bibliometric analysis. The analysis in the previous section revealed the number of publications associated with *halāl* cosmetics has significantly increased over the years since its conceptualization. Of the number of articles, the most cited paper on the *halāl* cosmetics subject entitled "Intention to choose Halal products: The role of religiosity" by A. Mukhtar (2012) with 196 citations.
The most dominant authors are A.Rohman (in total citations received) and A.H. Ngah (in average citations per document). At the same time, the highest number of publications associated with halāl cosmetics is the Journal of Islamic Marketing, with 25 publications. The Journal of Islamic Marketing appears to be the most dominant journal, with 14.1 average citations per document. Then, the Universiti Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia and Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia, secured the top lists as the most dominant institutions on the total and average citations received per article. Eventually, Malaysia appears to be the most dominant country in the total citations received and the most dominant prevalent in the citations per article. The results exemplified the most prevalent contributors that significantly impact halāl cosmetics and point out the increasing interest in the subject of halāl cosmetics by prominent scholars and institutions globally.

This study elaborates on some significant implications by providing considerable information on the dominant contributors to the subject of halāl cosmetics. It exhibits data on the most impactful studies, journals, and institutions contributing to the issue of halāl cosmetics. The study also reveals the development and progression of the halāl cosmetics subject over the years. Finally, it describes a comprehensive insight into halāl cosmetics, which can be used as a reference for future studies.

One of the limitations is that this study adopted a single source or database for data collection and synthesis. Although other bibliometric research used a single database to avoid duplication, there are possibilities to include other methods in analyzing the literature on halāl cosmetics. Another limitation is the inability to capture the broader and deeper context of the citation structure of the articles. However, this study has sufficiently explained some other citation structures for the literature on halāl cosmetics.

References
and halal cosmetic products: knowledge, religiosity, attitude and intention”, Journal of Islamic Marketing


Boran, G. (2013). Gelatin: Production, applications and health implications. *Gelatin: Production, Applications and Health Implications, 1*-238,


Huang, Y. (2020). Recent advances in animal origin identification of gelatin-based products using liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry methods: A mini


Mackwood, W. (2012). The next generation food machinery grease 10 years on. *NLGI Spokesman, 76*(3), 14-26, ISSN 0027-6782,


Mohamed, R.N. (2017). Interdependence between social value, emotional value,
customer experience and customer satisfaction indicators: The case of halal cosmetics industry in Malaysia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 25, 131-142, ISSN 0128-7702,


Ngah, A.H. (2019). Modelling the adoption of halal warehousing services among halal pharmaceutical and cosmetic manufacturers. *Journal of Sustainability Science and Management, 14*(6), 103-116, ISSN 1823-8556,


Putri, TU. (2018). Response to a New Wave in Digital marketing: Does beauty blogger involvement the most influencing factor in halal cosmetic purchase intention. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management, 7*(6), 446-452, ISSN 2051-3771.


Rohman, A. (2014). Quantification of lard in the mixture with olive oil in cream cosmetics based on FTIR spectra and chemometrics for Halal authentication. *Jurnal Teknologi (Sciences and Engineering), 69*(1), 113-119, ISSN 0127-9696, https://dx.doi.org/10.11113/jt.v69.2062

Rohman, A. (2016). The use of vibrational spectroscopy and chemometrics in
the analysis of pig derivatives for halal authentication. **International Food Research Journal**, 23(5), 1839-1848, ISSN 1985-4668,


Rusmil, M.R.A. (2016). The use of venom and venom-derived products in medicine and cosmetics: The ethical issues from Islamic perspective. **International Medical Journal Malaysia**, 17, 1-6, ISSN 1823-4631,

Safira, MEE (2019). The legal application of consumer and halal product protection in the health sector. **International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change**, 10(5), 1-18, ISSN 2201-1315,


