# SUFISM AND ECONOMIC RESILIENCE TRAJECTORY OF TAREKAT NAQSYABANDIYAH-KHALIDIYAH BABUSSALAM (TNKB)

Ziaulhaq Hidayat

Abstract: This article provides updated information on the tarekat following the entrepreneurial bankruptcy in the Tarekat Naqsybandiyah-Khalidiyah Babussalam (TNKB). This study charts the TNKB trend regarding the spiritual institution's economic toughness. This research asks how TNKB will be able to continue operating if its founder no again walks away from entrepreneurs and what other economies may emerge in his place. Findings from the study show that the entrepreneurial bankruptcy of TNKB entrepreneurs is strongly tied to the conflict of the leader, which is exacerbated by Tuan Guru's need to concentrate on other issues. Uang salam originated as a substitute for a new economic source to preserve the TNKB. Uang salam is a practice that persists until it eventually makes room for commodification. Commodification is a tactic used by TNKB as part of its survival plan after the entrepreneurial bankruptcy so that it can continue to exist and advance up to the present.

Keywords: Tarekat; Economy; Entrepreneurship; TNKB; Uang Salam

#### 194 Ziaulhaq Hidayat

Abstrak: Artikel ini memberikan informasi terbaru tentang tarekat setelah kematian wirausaha di Tarekat Naqsybandiyah-Khalidiyah Babussalam (TNKB). Penelitian ini memetakan tren TNKB terkait ketangguhan ekonomi lembaga spiritual tersebut. Penelitian ini mempertanyakan bagaimana TNKB akan dapat terus beroperasi jika pendirinya tidak lagi menjadi wirausahawan dan ekonomi apa yang dapat muncul sebagai gantinya. Temuan dari penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa kebangkrutan wirausaha TNKB sangat terkait dengan konflik pemimpin, yang diperburuk oleh kebutuhan Tuan Guru untuk berkonsentrasi pada isu-isu lain. Uang salam muncul sebagai pengganti sumber ekonomi baru untuk melestarikan TNKB. Uang salam merupakan praktik yang terus berlangsung hingga akhirnya membuka ruang untuk komodifikasi. Komodifikasi adalah taktik yang digunakan TNKB sebagai bagian dari rencana keberlangsungan hidupnya setelah kebangkrutan wirausaha sehingga dapat terus eksis dan berkembang hingga saat ini.

Kata Kunci: Tarekat; Ekonomi; Kewirausahaan; TNKB; Uang Salam

#### Introduction

An article titled *Tarekat et Entreprise à Sumatra: L'exemple de Syekh* Abdul Wahab Rokan (c. 1830-1926)" was published in 1990 by Denys Lombard.<sup>1</sup> The material is based on direct observations made in Langkat in 1983 at Besilam Village. In the years that followed, researchers such as Perret,<sup>2</sup> Bruinessen,<sup>3</sup> Weismann,<sup>4</sup> and others frequently acknowledged the article as a key source to understand how the tarekat and entrepreneurship relationship, arose in the Malay world region. The Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah-Khalidiyah Babussalam (TNKB) was one of the tarekat in the East Sumatra (now North Sumatra) members that became early development entrepreneurs. The tarekat has successfully developed different types of entrepreneurs, including plantations, farms, fisheries, and others. The research was done on TNKB after Lombard's findings were only able to confirm what he had already discovered. However, there have been considerable changes in TNKB, particularly in economic development.

TNKB has long been regarded as one of the most important tarekats in the world's Malay, Indonesian and Malaysian regions. Influence the fact that the TNKB network in both nations continues to use TNKB as its primary foundation, despite some minor disconnections discovered. This TNKB has grown significantly to become the dominant Sufism identity in the region.<sup>5</sup> TNKB is seen as a representation of tarekat in the Malay world, who go through changes in practically identical circumstances and conditions, particularly in their reactions to all the progress and changes that are taking place. The economic priorities pursued to ensure the survival of the tarekat is impacted by the change. Jama'ah (members) can benefit from using economic direction to better understand how economies are created and managed. The jama'ah still belongs to a community organization that is formed with good financial resources to grow as a spiritual institution.

The tarekat's attempts to endure all the changes are a crucial component of their plan to live and carry on living. Because of their circumstances, TNKB has changed its economic orientation in response to social and political developments, forcing it to develop innovative ways to protect itself in the new environment. Shaykh 'Abd al-Wahhab Rokan (880-1926 AD) referred to the early TNKB experiences, specifically those that occurred under the tutelage of the Tuan Guru Pertama (TGP). Lombard has noted that TNKB was developed with an entrepreneurial spirit to suit all demands, including those of the jama'ah interested in it.<sup>6</sup> All jama'ahs participate in entrepreneurial practices as part of a group that actively participates in developing all forms of entrepreneurship.

The TNKB's needs as a Sufi organization and those of pilgrims who dedicate themselves to it have both been met by the outcomes of entrepreneurship. The entrepreneurial attitude fostered by TGP has enabled TNKB to fulfill its mandate as a philanthropic institution that supports underserved communities and is an organization that focuses on spiritual growth. The TNKB's charitable function is demonstrated by its readiness to assist and make accommodations for orphans, widows, the elderly, and others who wish to join the TNKB. The new Tuan Guru appears to confront challenging circumstances in its development, particularly following the demise of the TGP leadership, as the scenario has changed from previously. Conditions associated with the power transfer from Holland to Japan led to a concentration of lead in the drive to establish the TNKB economy.7 Leadership conflict exists in a situation that is not favorable for TNKB leadership, which has led to the creation of leadership dualism in the organization. Disagreements and divergent viewpoints do not just arise from leadership conflicts within the TNKB family.

The ongoing disagreement, which has the attention of all groups, has consequences for a change in the economic direction of TNKB because it no longer fosters the entrepreneurial spirit that the TGP started. In the end, it disregards entrepreneurship, which is TNKB's primary source of income. The Tuan Guru leaders of TNKB have stopped paying attention to efforts to maintain and expand entrepreneurship due to ongoing leadership disagreements. The TNKB's economic resources have changed due to the leadership dispute. To address economic necessities, an entrepreneurial spirit is no longer an option. However, TNKB must function as a spiritual institution. What are the alternatives the economy created by TNKB has so that it can continue to exist, endure, and thrive at this time after the entrepreneurial bankruptcy? The resilience economic activities conducted by TNKB have demonstrated that spiritual institutions can cling on and develop in more positive ways than they did in the past. The economy of TNKB, which is resilient, is intriguing to researchers because it has the potential to become one of the continuous tarekat with a significant impact on middle-class society. On the other hand, the connection between the tarekat's economics and its direct spiritual institution cannot be broken. Therefore, the tarekat's economy's resilience becomes crucial for continuing to live the tarekat.

## **Genealogy of TNKB**

In the Malay world, particularly in Indonesia and Malaysia, TNKB as a jama'ah is expanding significantly. Shaykh 'Abd al-Wahhab Rokan (1880-1926 AD), who was actively involved in the planned expansion of the TNKB network in the Malay world, served as this tarekat's leader and was recognized by Tuan Guru Pertama (TGP) as the founder of TNKB.8 The lineage of the tarekat that the TNKB's founder got from Shaykh Sulayman Zuhdi, a well-known murshid of the Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah-Khalidiyah (TNK) situated in Jabal Abi Qubais, Mecca, is where the organization's history can be traced. One of the key liaisons for the TNK genealogy, which has become well-known among communities in Indonesia and Malaysia.9 TGP earned a TNK ijazah (diploma) after spending around 6 years in Mecca studying various Islamic scholarly subjects, including jurisprudence, hadith, interpretation, and tasawuf. But until he ultimately made the Sufi path a part of his life, the last field mentioned was the one that drew his attention the most. After TGP, it was said that he spent roughly in Mecca before returning to Indonesia and taking on the primary responsibility of an agent for spreading TNK throughout the Malay world following the mandate of the ijaza he obtained from his spiritual instructor.<sup>10</sup> TGP, as a spiritual figure, was easily accepted in the territory of the Malay Sultans because he used a spiritual and cultural approach that developed in his community. To project the expansion of the TNKB network, TGP has visited Malay Sultans in Sumatra and Peninsular Malaysia, who are renowned for being very strong in Islamic spirituality.<sup>11</sup>

Different Sultanal circles have become interested in actively participating in the practice and making the TNKB teachings an "official spiritual school" in the Malay Sultanate due to TGP's expansion of the TNKB network in the Malay world.<sup>12</sup> The TGP itself tended to serve the political objectives of the Malay Sultans in developing intimate links with their people, particularly in attempts to perpetuate power with spiritual vigor. The TNKB in the Malay Sultanate became a legitimacy for authority. TGP is regarded as a critical player in the growth of TNK, who established cordial ties with the Malay Sultans in a mutually beneficial relationship after realizing the need for authority to sustain the TNK network in the Malay world. TGP traveled to many Sultanates to expand the TNKB network before deciding to remain in the Langkat region.<sup>13</sup> TGP's role includes serving as Sultan's spiritual advisor and as a spiritual teacher for the community. The establishment of Kampung Tarekat (Tarekat Village), specifically Kampung Besilam, as an independent territory for tarekat groups to practice beliefs and rituals that are still used today in society was significantly aided by the TGP's presence in the Sultanate of Langkat.<sup>14</sup>

By contributing resources to construct a hamlet as the TNKB's base, the Sultan of Langkat wholeheartedly backed the creation of Kampung Tarekat. The Kampung Tarekat concept created by TGP is a tarekat capable of powerful dialectics so that its existence is acknowledged and accepted as a necessary component of its life. Geographically, the TNKB is situated in North Sumatra's Langkat Regency, which was once the Sultanate of Langkat. The tarekat model owned by TNKB may be the only one with a particular settlement, claim Bruinessen and Weismann.<sup>15</sup> Currently, Kampung Besilam is an autonomous region for TNKB and is exempt from land and building taxes. The tarekat network, either through the network established by TGP or the network formed by the Tuan Guru who carried on the leadership of TNKB in Kampung Besilam networks is spread in the Indonesian and Malaysian Malay communities.<sup>16</sup>

The fact that Kampung Besilam still has *jama'ahs* in numerous places, particularly in Indonesia and Malaysia, serves as evidence that it served as the foundation for TNKB.<sup>17</sup> Connections with TNKB serve as confirmation that Kampung Besilam's status as the source of spiritual authority has remained protected and acknowledged up until this point. Currently, activity *haul* (Arabic: *hawl*) (the memorial of TGP's death) is an activity implemented yearly, showing that the widespread network, both originating from Indonesia or Malaysia, makes an effort to become part of the implementation activity. This ability to sustain and uphold the teachings and practices that have grown to be an integral part of the tarekat has been demonstrated throughout the evolution of TNKB, from its founding until the present. Ability to persist This is directly tied to future TNKB leaders' knowledge to maintain the TGP's pioneering principles and allow all current dynamics to pass.

## Entrepreneurship of TGP

The early TNKB, particularly when TGP was in charge, engaged in tarekat efforts to create an economy centered on entrepreneurship. The establishment of Kampung Tarekat, afterward known as Babussalam or, more jokingly, Besilam, was directly sparked by TGP. Originally a woodland uninhabited by people, this tarekat village eventually evolved into a livable hamlet under the direction of the TGP. TGP and his jama'ahs were personally involved in clearing forests to make them acceptable settlements as part of the effort to build this community. They also provided a foundation for *jama'ah* and shelters for the needy, like widows, and orphans who had nowhere to dwell.<sup>18</sup> TGP's spirit of independence is the primary source of inspiration for the development of entrepreneurs as a source of the TNKB economy. The entrepreneurial spirit makes TNKB an independent spiritual organization.<sup>19</sup> As the first murshid of TNKB, TGP works to increase its financial resources while cultivating an independentminded business attitude. Though the Sultan of Langkat, the local ruler at the time, continued to support TGP to fulfill the entrepreneurial spirit, the economic activity carried out showed some independence.<sup>20</sup>

The many economic operations conducted make the entrepreneurial spirit very obvious. The TNKB survival, particularly that of the weaker groups residing in the *jama'ah* hamlet, depends on this economic activity more than just for the profit of TGP. TGP mandates that all jama'ahs participate actively in any entrepreneurial endeavor launched to meet the financial demands of TNKB.<sup>21</sup> The jamaat's involvement in entrepreneurship contributes to boosting the economic side and forms an essential component of the tarekat's operations, including spiritual training.<sup>22</sup> According to Lombard, TGP and his *jama'ah* engaged in several economic activities, including growing delicious oranges, rearing cattle, raising chickens, raising goats, and growing black pepper.<sup>23</sup> However, once upon a time it also happened economic activities suffered losses due to unfavorable environmental conditions throughout its development, such as the floods that took place at the time. TGP's entrepreneurial spirit, however, has continued to flourish since, in later developments, some plants that were thought to be susceptible to flooding were replaced with the planting of other varieties, including nutmeg, coffee, areca nuts, durian, rambutan, coconut, and others. Varied chosen entrepreneurial professions undoubtedly take into account various characteristics of appropriateness with the environment in which they reside.<sup>24</sup>

Since circumstances are always shifting, different sorts of entrepreneurs are chosen that are pertinent to the current circumstance. In addition to being carried out, TGP's entrepreneurial operations take into account every aspect of the current environment and the prerequisites for achieving success. Entrepreneurs who have established themselves in Kampung Tarekat and run various agricultural companies can do so with excitement and drive for financial independence. TGP's close relationship with the Sultan of Langkat gave TNKB a chance to satisfy needs with the help of the Sultan, who didn't necessarily have to engage in business activities.<sup>25</sup> However, as a *jama'ah* that aims to become economically established by making use of the potential already existing, both in terms of natural potential and the members with their surrounding environment. The entrepreneurial attitude of TGP serves as an example of how to live a spiritual life that is both deeply rooted in God's spirit and financially selfsufficient. As Kampung Tarekat has grown, entrepreneurship has replaced other forms of employment as the primary means of subsistence for its *jama'ah*s and residents.<sup>26</sup>

The TNKB concept of living an economically secure and spiritually fulfilling existence places a significant emphasis on entrepreneurial activity. Strengthening potential entrepreneurial spirit is also seen in TGP's purchases of a printing press and establishment of Babussalam Printing. When it was challenging to locate a printing press, the idea of starting a printing press represented a genuine attempt to further education both from an entrepreneurial and educational standpoint. The printing firm has successfully released many books and attracted outside printers. Eventually, printing will become one of the most renowned publishers in the Malay world, particularly in Indonesia<sup>27</sup> and Malaysia. However, with TGP's passing, printing operations ceased to exist. Following Tuan Gurus did not pursue many additional TGP-initiated economic ventures, leaving only the vestiges of TNKB's entrepreneurial activity, such as agricultural and cattle land. Due to the TNKB's poor asset management, several other entrepreneurship-supporting structures and facilities are absent. On the other hand, TNKB has additional economic potential, so it can continue to exist for the time being.

At the right moment, the TNKB's top murshid is in the eleventh generation of the Tuan Guru. The TNKB's general leadership tradition that leadership is always favored in the context of *dhurriat* (close family), which is also supported by TNKB philosophy and leadership traditions applies to TNKB, which has a tendency to be family-based. There is a strong perception that tarekat spiritual institutions are created to be family assets and heirlooms, ensuring that in the case of a leader's death, the family will immediately assume the leadership position at the top of the hierarchy.<sup>28</sup> According to TNKB's experience, this leadership tradition is also referenced during the procession for choosing and appointing leaders, ensuring that all TNKB leaders are part of the TGP family while also considering spiritual achievement. Selecting a leader in the other half is based on the wishes of the previous TGP, or Tuan Guru. It is carried out after discussion among the family and senior caliphs. The TNKB leadership is still considering genetic factors as a requirement for leadership in the organization.<sup>29</sup>

The TNKB has so far been led by some Tuan Gurus in succession, specifically from TGP to Zikmal Fuad (2020). Who led the TNKB can be detailed in more detail; specifically, Yahya Afandi (1926–1922), appointed following TGP's wishes, continued the leadership after TGP passed away (Said, 39). Following Yahya Afandi's leadership, Abdul Manaf (1932–1955), similarly nominated based on the preceding Tuan Guru referee, maintained it. Additionally, Abdul Jabar (1935-1942), still chosen following the former Tuan Guru's wishes, remained in the leadership. Muhammad Daud (1942-1943) was elected as the next caliph following a family gathering with senior caliphs. Since there were two excellent possibilities, the choice of Tuan Guru is believed to have prompted disagreements among the family while deciding on the leader. Ultimately, Muhammad Daud was given the position of leadership.<sup>30</sup> A social revolution occurred under Tuan Guru Daud's direction, which affected the growth of the anti-sultan movement in the Malay world. The Japanese defeat occurred concurrently until the allies entered the Netherlands in 1947.

Due to his anti-sultan stance, Tuan Guru Daud found himself in a challenging situation in TNKB and ultimately decided to depart for Aceh. Another story claims that Tuan Guru Daud left for Malaysia at the same time that TNKB experienced a leadership void. As a result, Tuan Guru Fakih Tambah was chosen by the TNKB family to fill the leadership void.<sup>31</sup> Tuan Guru Tambah has been given control over Besilam Village in both the tarekat aspect and the management of the village as a result of his nomination as the TNKB's head. However, in 1951 Daud returned to TNKB to continue his leadership after things started to get back to normal. Daud's return, however, was opposed by some TNKB family members, which finally led to a leadership dispute because the two Tuan Gurus each had their supporters. There are now disagreements inside the family due to the ongoing leadership battle. There have been several attempts to end the fight, both from the senior caliphs who are still living and from the administration, but none of them have been successful.<sup>32</sup>

The Tuan Guru Tambah group and its successors were referred to as

the "*madrasah atas*" to separate them from the Tuan Guru Daud group. In contrast, the Tuan Guru Daud group was known as the "madrasah bawah" and continued its leadership. The two parties to the battle kept up their different spiritual pursuits, particularly by aggressively supporting the expansion of the TNKB network's influence in the Malay world.<sup>33</sup> Through their respective networks, which do have a Malay ethnic foundation, the two leaders have significant power that is dispersed throughout Indonesia and Malaysia. The following are Tuan Guru from "*madrasah atas*" and "*madrasah bawah*" who have led the TNKB.

Following the deaths of the two Tuan Gurus who were at odds in 1971, later developments were carried out by the leaders who came after them, and so on to the present. The two, however, tend to get along better than they used to since they look out for one another not to jeopardize their relationship and perform ritual acts under their separate rules.<sup>34</sup> Both sides are still in charge of the TNKB, which includes upholding historical mysticism and other spiritual pursuits. The "madrasah atas" and "madrasah bawah" groups gathered in Friday prayer practices. When performing the rite, the two come together in the nosah or mosque in local parlance.<sup>35</sup> Although the competition for influence between the "madrasah atas" and "madrasah bawah" persists, particularly within the mystic jama'ah interested in it, leadership practice and authority continue according to their separate traditions. Because the development orientation is now focused on preserving and promoting entrepreneurship as an economic resource, leadership conflict impacts TNKB's entrepreneurs as a source of economy.

Since Tuan Guru's leadership, the foundation of the TNKB economy has transitioned from an entrepreneurial spirit to a desire to use TNKB as part of economic activity. It is still being determined as of the time the study was done. According to several sources, the original enterprise that gave rise to the current economy still has land accessible.<sup>36</sup> However, because of the tensions that arose, it needed to be clarified exactly who had the authority to carry on with various forms of entrepreneurship, ultimately leading to its abandonment as the TNKB's economic foundation. In the end, this protracted dispute made it impossible to manage entrepreneurship as it ought to, leading to the neglect of diverse land and other economic organizations. the transformation of the TNKB's financial assets from an entrepreneurial attitude to the practice of using TNKB in an endeavor to meet financial demands. Since Tuan Gurus no longer care about entrepreneurship, it is typical to see in practice that continual leadership disagreements have undermined the spirit of entrepreneurship.<sup>37</sup>

#### 202 Ziaulhaq Hidayat

Entrepreneurship is regarded as a distinct component of spiritual activity since those who are also engaged in a spiritual activity are only understood as engaging in purely economic activities. In this context, the alteration of TNKB's financial resources is an attempt to end the independent tradition that TGP has followed. The leadership dispute that has persisted up to this point has had an effect on Tuan Guru's charm and influence in the community, eliminating the TNKB's source of economic resiliency. The tradition that pertains to TNKB is that one way to make an effort is to respect Tuan Guru, or members, by giving only to receive blessings.<sup>38</sup> Changes in economic resources are directly tied to this practice. This custom has existed since TNKB's founding and has since spread to include discussions about the organization's fiscal resiliency.

#### **Entrepreneurial Bankruptcy**

The TNKB shifted in leadership after TGP's passing since the replacements could no longer accurately represent the TGP leadership, particularly regarding power and handling of the organization's financial resources. Alterations in the authority of the new leaders Tuan Gurus are not the only primary source of spiritual guidance because senior caliphs with ties to TGP still play important positions in TNKB. The entrepreneurial reforms that TGP had started as the primary means of "supporting" TNKB are no longer operating as they should. Tuan Guru should have paid more attention to the existing TNKB entrepreneurs since the various circumstances, and conditions during the leadership of the new Tuan Guru demanded concentration on other factors. As a source of income for TNKB's independence, the numerous existing entrepreneurs are no longer a worry. TNKB no longer utilizes entrepreneurs to support current initiatives.<sup>39</sup> The TNKB is administered on a spiritual institution basis, with participation from all of its components. As such, the waning of the entrepreneurial spirit has a direct bearing on the meager economic resources of the TNKB. In particular, the pattern of pilgrims' participation as salikin (members) in TNKB is impacted by the inefficiency of entrepreneurship in the economic sector. Previously, or at the moment, the salikin group is engaged in business as part of a process of spiritual formation through selfdedication to TNKB.

Internal leadership conflicts between the TNKB leadership families are a significant contributing factor to the failure of TNKB businesses. Internal disagreements hinder the TNKB leadership process because they prevent all operations from taking place as they ought to. The *jama'ahs* participating in the war were likewise impacted by it, resulting in them being grouped in special bonds. In addition, the conflict directly affected changes in the TNKB's fiscal resources and weakened the organization's standing as a spiritual institution. Tuan Guru no longer gives much thought to entrepreneurial activities because its attention is now more on the ongoing struggle, to the point where it no longer even considers the current entrepreneurs. Finally, numerous forms of entrepreneurship supporting infrastructure should be operating more. Leadership disputes have an impact on the creation of the TNKB's economic resources since the organization must continue to function as a spiritual institution while entrepreneurship is no longer working as an economic resource to enable the TNKB to survive and grow.<sup>40</sup>

Entrepreneurship needs to be better protected and managed to affect the TNKB's economic resources until they pass away. The loss of business owners exposes Tuan Guru's administrative shortcomings in his attempt to portray economic independence as a crucial component of TNKB development. As part of the doctrine that teaches that members are not simply a process of spiritual enlightenment, TGP initiated entrepreneurship intending to make TNKB an economically independent organization. The tarekat, however, was also developed as a business with a spirit of independence. There needs to be more financial resources to ensure TNKB's continued existence. Therefore, spiritual growth must be balanced with economic aptitude. Even though it was acknowledged that it was an integral aspect of the spiritual activities taught by TGP during his leadership, the challenging situation encountered by the Tuan Gurus as they continued to lead the TNKB did not leave much room for efforts to continue the spirit of economic development. Due to the entrepreneurial death, TNKB is now a weak spiritual institution from an economic perspective, despite its close connection to spiritual growth.<sup>41</sup>

Another circumstance that contributed to the demise of entrepreneurship was the Malay Sultans' underwhelming support for the TNKB-developed entrepreneurial sector. At that time, the relationship was not mutually supportive between the Malay Sultan and the Tuan Guru. Due to the circumstances, entrepreneurship is no longer seen as the primary resource that must be taken into account in the growth of TNKB. Because Sultan's assistance became a crucial component of the TNKB's entrepreneurial ethos, the negative relationship between the Malay Sultan and the Tuan Guru indirectly impacted the growth of the entrepreneurial sector. Due to the development of cordial connections between the two throughout the TGP period, the Malay Sultans, particularly the Sultan of Langkat, enthusiastically backed all business endeavors. In addition to giving the land and resources required for entrepreneurship development, the Sultan of Langkat also supports it from a material aspect.<sup>42</sup>

Along with assisting in fulfilling all requirements connected to entrepreneurial operations overseen by the TNKB. All facets of the social structure in TNKB were actively involved in the entrepreneurial growth process since, throughout the TGP period, management of the entrepreneurial sector was conducted on a communal basis. The outcomes of entrepreneurship are also meant to serve practical needs and the interests of all *salikin* concerned. It was discovered that not all of them had the entrepreneurial drive to try to build an independent economy for TNKB during the administration of Tuan Guru, who replaced TGP. It takes attention to concentrate more on areas of cooperation amongst families to maintain and perpetuate the traditions that apply in TNKB in the scenario faced by the Tuan Guru, who continues to lead the organization.

In these conditions, entrepreneurship is no longer considered because the time of continual leadership transition means that business operations only proceed as usual once they eventually come to an end. Plantations, cattle, printing, and other kinds of entrepreneurship were ignored until they ceased to be a source of income for TNKB. In the end, the various entrepreneurial structures and facilities that had previously been in place started to lose their functionality until they eventually ceased to exist altogether. In such a setting, the TNKB has been operating as a spiritual institution alongside a shifting economic landscape, particularly in efforts to maintain and continue the TNKB as a spiritual institution. However, TNKB has demonstrated its tenacity in preserving these religious organizations' continuity.

# Ecomonic Resilience through Uang Salam

The TNKB, as a spiritual institution, continues to fulfill its role as a spiritual reference in society even after failure in business and, ultimately, death. Efforts To continue, the TNKB economy ultimately sourced *uang salam* (giving money through handshake) as an alternative supply. In the TNKB experience, *Uang salam* does not appear very formal, but the practice has been given space by its basic normative associated with various TGP doctrines. One taught the belief that giving material offerings, such as cash or priceless items, was an element of showing reverence to Tuan Guru as a spiritual leader. Giving this shows respect for Tuan Guru's leadership role and support for his initiatives. Help for the TNKB is typically provided through financial contributions. However, many pilgrims also provide support in other ways. Bring up *uang salam*, nevertheless, as it is a

common decision to give support in the form of money.43

Giving uang salam has been a long-standing practice under TNKB leadership from TGP to the next Tuan Guru, with amounts changing nominally as the value of money has evolved. The failing entrepreneurship was the previous source of the TNKB economy, but *uang salam* quickly emerged as a brand-new source of the economy to rescue TNKB so that it could survive up until this point.<sup>44</sup> Since it is besides its base normative and practical has become a recurring habit. Keep going continually in TNKB, uang salam as source economy strengthens as an alternative resilient economy. Uang salam has become a TNKB community habit since it is a part of the community's shared tradition. As a result, it also serves to symbolize loyalty and obedience. The uang salam has evolved into TNKB's system mark, and as such, it now serves as a criterion for awarding the organization as a whole. Uang salam has become a well-established custom since it has been consistently observed over time. As a result, it has strengthened and is now the only economical source ensuring the survival of the TNKB <sup>45</sup>

*Uang salam* serves as TNKB's primary economic driver because it is integrated into all of the organization's activities, whether closely tied to its doctrines and rituals or social interactions. Even though the khadim or those associated with TNKB were willing to accept it, *uang salam* was typically exclusively given to Tuan Guru. Due to the sourced *uang salam* from *jama'ah* or pilgrims supplied, Tuan Guru meets all operational TNKB needs.<sup>46</sup> Therefore, TNKB is then responsible for continuity for all needs. Even if the management of *uang salam* is more typically centralized to the leader, the heritage of *uang salam* as a source economy has let TNKB endure and expand to this point. Not only that, but *uang salam* can serve as a source for the development of TNKB, particularly for the upkeep and development of infrastructure that supports all activities in TNKB.<sup>47</sup>

As of right now, TNKB can preserve the tarekat's teachings and customs while also developing its infrastructure, adding new buildings that are easily accessible, and providing *jama'ah* men and women with the permanent housing they need to participate in the suluk rite. Source economies that come from *uang salam* are capable of preserving the TNKB and improving the welfare of Tuan Guru and the associated communities. All form activities in TNKB, including those related to Tuan Guru or that provide services, have merged with established traditions to reinforce *uang salam* as the region's primary economic engine. *Uang salam* practice is included in the TNKB's process of creating social or class pilgrims. Giving *uang salam* always fluctuates, and how much is given truly relies on the

social status of the pilgrims and the visitors. Group class social interaction will always distinguish itself from other group class social interaction by the amount of *uang salam* given. As time passes, the class social medium will posture itself differently than the class social lower to extent of *uang salam*.

Differences in the amount of *uang salam* gifts immediately impact the TNKB economy. The value of the *uang salam* received will impact how TNKB manages continuity when there are more lots. *Uang salam* is being recognized as the TNKB's source economy, particularly during this phase of the implementation activity. Islam's national holidays, such as Mawlid, Isra' Mi'raj, and others, are celebrated on this day. Moments of importance are typically attended by people from many different circles, who then significantly influence the process of giving *uang salam*. Peak from all direct action that impacts the rise in *uang salam* is the yearly installation of *haul.*<sup>48</sup> From every TNKB network in the Malay world, Indonesia, and Malaysia, the moment *haul* will draw thousands of *jama'ah* and pilgrims. Not only that, but when dignitaries and politicians from various circles attend the *haul* as well,<sup>49</sup> TNKB typically sees an increase in the amount of *uang salam* that it receives at that time.

Alternative TNKB economic sources such as uang salam are not without repercussions for the TNKB entity as a religious institution. Uang salam becomes a component of the practice commodification that occurs in TNKB, legitimizing it and reinforcing it through form exchanges of spiritual objects for material goods. Additionally, practice commodification occurs in all TNKB activities, from those directly tied to doctrine to those in social relationships. Practice commodification has evolved into a component of the extension of *uang salam*, which includes all other elements and current components, particularly the social class structure below in TNKB. Commodification has changed the spiritual orientation of the material, which is the portion that cannot be separated and has become a part of bolstering the economy. The strategy to meet the demands of the TNKB, particularly those of the *caliph* (assistant of Tuan Guru) and *khadim* (servant of Tuan Guru) groups, includes practice commodification. These groups are directly involved in maintaining and caring for tradition in the TNKB.

Recent events demonstrate that the TNKB economy is no longer based on the entrepreneurial spirit but rather on strengthening *uang salam* as a substitute for economic resiliency. TNKB has changed from a spiritual institution to one more accessible to the outer world due to the *uang salam*. TNKB has evolved into an organization that is a source of the economy due to the shift in economic resources from entrepreneurship to *uang salam*. The practice of commodities for economic interests as a type of the new spirit of capitalism, which incorporates religious or spiritual components as part of economic activity, distinguishes changes in economic sources.<sup>50</sup> Since commodities are only recently becoming a significant economic component of TNKB continuity, it is possible to observe commodity practices in practically all of the practices that are now in existence. In addition to social space, where the process of transforming sacred values into profane values occurs, ritual space also plays a role in the production of commodities.

The forces causing a continual change in TNKB, particularly the undervalued entrepreneurship that formed the foundation of the region's economy, impact changes in economic resources. The adjustments that have been made show that the current scenario allows for adjustments in TNKB's financial resources. Contrary to what Bruinessen said, the leadership battle damaged the TNKB's power.<sup>51</sup> However, the reality is different in TNKB, where the tarekat continues to be the most popular location to conduct various activities linked to spiritual components due to its status as a community spiritual reference, particularly in the Malay culture. In addition, some visitors who come from different areas purposefully save expenses to attend the TNKB. Even if worshipers and pilgrims acknowledge that there has been a shift in spiritual emphasis to a tourist orientation, TNKB's attraction remains a separate component of the community.

The existence of TNKB as a sacred place still strongly influences the neighborhood. Because the network was established on an agency basis and is still in place, TNKB has a significant presence as a jama'ah in the Malay world. The tarekat that *jama'ahs* and pilgrims frequent the most, particularly those from regions where a network has developed within it, is TNKB.52 A different aspect of strengthening the practice of commodification, which has altered the orientation of TNKB as a spiritual corporation and given rise to a more network-based economy, is the possibility of a large spiritual institution. By leveraging this large spiritual institution, extensive influence creates the possibility to alter TNKB's economic perspective. Because the vast number of congregations enhances the economic basis derived from the commodification activities carried out by TNKB within it, the situation is stated to be a separate component of strengthening the economic orientation carried out. The ability of the TNKB to alter itself economically by making use of all available potentials is a creative management technique used by those responsible for ensuring

the continuity of the TNKB.

## Conclusion

It should be underlined that the entrepreneurial spirit that TNKB developed as an economic source has experienced significant modifications due to the topic that has been provided. The economic resources of TNKB have changed, confirming the presence of a world where tarekat spirituality and economic rationality are related to each other. The need to face reality has created space for initiatives to use TNKB's resources and potential as a source of resilience in the economy. Leadership conflicts have affected TNKB, forcing it to use spiritual capital to meet economic demands and uphold and carry on the TNKB heritage. Changes in economic resources are directly tied to these conflicts. After the entrepreneurial bankruptcy, an alternative economy emerged in uang salam. Uang salam is a crucial component of bolstering economic practice, whether part of the overarching plan or not, to ensure that TNKB can continue to exist and grow up to this point. The TNKB's operational interests as a spiritual organization and endeavors to address the needs of all groups within it are always connected to economic practices in all of its activities. The switch in TNKB's economic resilience from entrepreneurship to uang salam is a tactical move that has been able to save TNKB and ensure its survival up until this point. If so, it should be noted that spiritual institutions do not expand and grow regardless of how resilient the economy is.[]

#### Endnotes

- Denys Lombard, "Tarekat et Entreprise à Sumatra: L'exemple de Syekh Abdul Wahab Rokan (c.1830-1926)", Marc Gaborieau, et.al., eds., *Naqshbandis: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle d'un Ordre Mystique Musulman* (Paris: Institut Français d'études Anatoliennes d'Istanbul, 1990), 710.
- Daniel Perret, La Formation d'un Paysage Ethnique Batak et Malais de Sumatra Nord-Est (Paris: Ecole francaise d'Extrême-Orient, 1995), 145, Daniel Perret, "De la Forêt Primaire Aux Plantations Coloniales: Les Deux Ruptures Politiques et Socio-économiques de la Côte est de Sumatra-Nord", Bulletin de l'École française d'Extrême-Orient, 81, 1994, 17.
- 3. Martin van Bruinessen, "Sufi Orders" in Southeast Asia: From Private Devotions to Social Network and Corporate Action", R. Michael Feener et Anne M. Blackburn, eds., Buddhist and Islamic Orders in Southern Asia: Comparative Perspectives (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2019), 138-139, Martin van Bruinessen, "After the Days of Abu Qubays: Indonesian Transformations of the Naqshbandiyya Khalidiyah", Journal of the History of Sufism, 21 (5), 2007, 121, Martin van Bruinessen, Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah di Indonesia: Survei Historis, Geografis dan Sosiologis, Bandung: Mizan, 1992, 115.
- 4. Itzchak Weismann, *The Naqshbandiyya: Orthodoxy and Activism in a Wordwide Sufi Tradition* (New York: Routledge, 2007), 40.
- 5. Ziaulhaq Hidayat and Muzakkir Syahrul, "Indonesian Sufi in Malay World: A Prelimenary

Exploration with Reference to Tariqa Naqshabandiyya-Khalidiyya Babussalam (TNKB)", *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 11 (1), 2017, 201-220.

- Lombard, "Tarekat et Entreprise", 710, Denys Lombard, "Les Tarekat en Insulinde", Alexandre Popovic and Gilles Veinstein, eds, *Les Orders Mystiques dans l'Islam: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle* (Paris: L'ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, 1986), 163.
- 7. Anthony Reid, "The Japanese Occupation and Rival Indonesian Elites: Northern Sumatra in 1942", *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 35 (1), 1975, 49-61.
- 8. Michael Laffan, *The Making of Indonesian Islam: Orientalism and Narration of a Sufi Past* (Princeton dan Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2011), 59.
- 9. As far as I know, some of the Indonesian network of the caliph of Shaykh Sulayman Zuhdi, including two individuals from North Sumatra, i.e. 'Abd al-Wahhab Rokan and Sulayman Huta Pungkut, two individuals from West Sumatra, Ibrahim Kumpulan, and Jalaluddin. Then, four individuals from Central Java, 'Abd Allah Kepatihan, Muhammad Ilyas, Muhammad Hadi, and 'Abd al-Qadir.
- 10. Hidayat and Syahrul, "Indonesian Sufi", 2018.
- 11. Werner Kraus, "Some Notes on the Introduction of the Naqshbandiyya-Khalidiyya into Indonesia", Marc Gaborieu, et al., eds., *Naqshbandis: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle d'un Ordre Mystique Musulman* (Istanbul and Paris: Editions ISIS, 1999), 691-706.
- 12. Lisga Hidayat Siregar, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Syekh 'Abdul Wahab Rokan Babusalam: Suatu Kajian tentang Ajaran dan Aktualisasinya dalam Kehidupan Sosial 1882-1926, *PhD Theses*, SPs UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2003, 112.
- 13. 'Abd al-Wahāb Rokan, "Catatan Syaikh 'Abd al-Wahhāb Rokan", Manuscript, 2.
- M Iqbal Irham, "Pemikiran Sufistik Syekh Abdul Wahab Rokan", *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan*, 8 (2), 2010, 297-314.
- 15. Bruinessen, Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah, 115, Weismann, The Naqshbandiyya, 40.
- 16. Abdul Manan Mohammad, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Khalidiyah in Malaysia: A Study on the Leadership of Haji Ishaq bin Muhammad Arif", *Miqot*, 36 (2) 2012, 299-319.
- Syed Hadzrullathfi bin Syed Omar and Mohd Shahril bin Othman, "The Ritual Practices of The Naqshbandiyya-Khalidiyya Order in Contemporary Malaysia", *Humanities and Social Sciences Review*, 1 (3), 2012, 149-157.
- Siregar, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah, 112, Fuad Said, Syeikh Abdul Wahab Rokan: Tuan Guru Babussalam (Medan: Pustaka Babussalam, 1983), 37.
- 19. Lombard, "Tarekat et Entreprise", 710.
- 20. Perret, La Formation d'un Paysage, 16.
- 21. Said, Syeikh Abdul Wahab, 39.
- 22. Ziaulhaq Hidayat, *Kuasa Kelas Bawah dan Bisnis Berkah di Makam Wali: Narasi Kehidupan Khadim* (Ciputat: Pustakapedia, 2019), 191.
- 23. Lombard, "Tarekat et Entreprise", 712.
- 24. Said, Syeikh Abdul Wahab, 48.
- 25. Perret, "De la Forêt Primaire", 117.
- 26. Mega Hidayati and Tito Handoko, "Revivalism of the Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah in Changing the Local Political Landscape of Rokan Hulu, Indonesia in Post-New Order", *Fikrah*, 9 (2), 2021, 183-202.
- 27. Said, Syeikh Abdul Wahab, 39.
- 28. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 90.
- 29. Interview with Ahmad, January 12, 2020.
- Tajuddin Mudawar, Sejarah Almarhum Waliyullah Qutubuzzaman Syeikh Abdul Wahab Rokan Tuan Guru Babussalam, n.p. n.d., 4.
- 31. Bruinessen, Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah, 135.
- 32. Said, Syeikh Abdul Wahab, 50.
- 33. Rosnaaini Hamid, Adab Sebelum Suluk Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah: Mengikut Syeikh

210 Ziaulhaq Hidayat

*Abdul Wahab Rokan* (Kedah: UUM Press, 2016), 12, Lisga Lindung Hidayat, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Syaikh Abdul Wahab Rokan: Sejarah, Ajaran, Amalan dan Dinamika Perubahan", *Miqot*, 35 (1), 2011, 59-76.

- 34. Siregar, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah, 114.
- 35. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 61-70.
- 36. Interview with Ahmad, January 12, 2020.
- 37. In a mentioned report, it was discovered that certain were selling printing to meet particular needs without informing the TNKB family. Like other entrepreneurship owners, it was discontinued because it was linked to the problem of persistent leadership conflicts, which made it unclear who had the right to rule until the last tract of usable land was rendered inoperable. The owner of certain agricultural land has recently also been a mystery.
- 38. The tradition that governs TNKB contains a written doctrine that is regarded as a component of the TGP doctrine and is found in *wasiat 44*. It includes recommendations for making gifts or financial contributions to the TNKB caliph. One of them states, "The nineteenth commandment, you should make a pilgrimage to him and then offer charity to him if you go to a county or hamlet and there are pious people and teachers in that country, especially the caliph of the Tarekat Naqsyabandiah".
- 39. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 92.
- 40. Interview with Hasan, January 12, 2020.
- 41. Rachida Chih, "Sainteté, Maîtrise Spirituelle et Patronage: Les Fondements de l'autorité dans le Soufisme", *Archives de Sciences Sociales des Religions*, (125), 2004, 79-98.
- Tengkoe Hasjim, Riwajat Toean Sjeh Abdoel Wahab Toean Goeroe Besilam dan Keradjaan Langkat (Medan: H. Mij. Indische Drukkerij, n.d.), 32, Mudawar, Sejarah Almarhum Waliyullah, 2.
- 43. 'Abd al-Wahhab Rokan, Wasiat 44 (n.p. n.d.), 2.
- 44. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 181.
- 45. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 183.
- 46. Interview with Hasan, January 12, 2020.
- 47. Hidayat, Kuasa Kelas Bawah, 185.
- Ziaulhaq Hidayat, "Bisnis Berkah di Makam Tuan Guru: Komodifikasi Ritual pada Haul Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah-Khalidiyah Babussalam (TNKB)", *Jurnal Sinergis Kopertais Wilayah XII*, 2 (1), 2014, 139-151.
- 49. Observation in TNKB.
- 50. Gwenaël Njoto-Feillard, *L'islam et la Réinvention du Capitalisme en Indonésie* (Paris : Karthala, 2012), 310.
- 51. Bruinessen, "Sufi Orders", 109.
- 52. Saiful Umam, "The Guardian of the Integral Vision of Islamic Practice: The Naqshabandi Sufi Order in Indonesia", *Studia Islamika*, 13 (2), 2006, 271.

#### **Bibliography**

- Bruinessen, Martin van, "After the Days of Abu Qubays: Indonesian Transformations of the Naqshbandiyya Khalidiyah", *Journal of the History of Sufism*, 21 (5), 2007.
- Bruinessen, Martin van, "Sufi Orders" in Southeast Asia: From Private Devotions to Social Network and Corporate Action", R. Michael Feener et Anne M. Blackburn, eds., *Buddhist and Islamic Orders in Southern Asia: Comparative Perspectives*, Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2019.
- Bruinessen, Martin van, Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah di Indonesia: Survei Historis, Geografis dan Sosiologis, Bandung: Mizan, 1992.

- Chih, Rachida, "Sainteté, Maîtrise Spirituelle et Patronage: Les Fondements de l'autorité dans le Soufisme", *Archives de Sciences Sociales des Religions*, (125), 2004.
- Hamid, Rosnaaini, Adab Sebelum Suluk Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah: Mengikut Syeikh Abdul Wahab Rokan, Kedah: UUM Press, 2016.
- Hasjim, Tengkoe, *Riwajat Toean Sjeh Abdoel Wahab Toean Goeroe Besilam dan Keradjaan Langkat*, Medan: H. Mij. Indische Drukkerij, n.d.
- Hidayat, Lisga Lindung, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Syaikh Abdul Wahab Rokan: Sejarah, Ajaran, Amalan dan Dinamika Perubahan", *Miqot*, 35 (1), 2011.
- Hidayat, Ziaulhaq and Muzakkir Syahrul, "Indonesian Sufi in Malay World: A Prelimenary Exploration with Reference to Tariqa Naqshabandiyya-Khalidiyya Babussalam (TNKB),» *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 11 (1), 2017.
- Hidayat, Ziaulhaq, "Bisnis Berkah di Makam Tuan Guru: Komodifikasi Ritual pada Haul Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah-Khalidiyah Babussalam (TNKB)", *Jurnal Sinergis Kopertais Wilayah XII*, 2 (1), 2014.
- Hidayat, Ziaulhaq, *Kuasa Kelas Bawah dan Bisnis Berkah di Makam Wali: Narasi Kehidupan Khadim*, Ciputat: Pustakapedia, 2019.
- Hidayati, Mega and Tito Handoko, "Revivalism of the Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah in Changing the Local Political Landscape of Rokan Hulu, Indonesia in Post-New Order", *Fikrah*, 9 (2), 2021.
- Irham, M Iqbal, "Pemikiran Sufistik Syekh Abdul Wahab Rokan", Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan, 8 (2), 2010.
- Kraus, Werner, "Some Notes on the Introduction of the Naqshbandiyya-Khalidiyya into Indonesia", Marc Gaborieu, et al., eds., *Naqshbandis: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle d'un Ordre Mystique Musulman*, Istanbul and Paris: Editions ISIS, 1999.
- Laffan, Michael, *The Making of Indonesian Islam: Orientalism and Narration of a Sufi Past*, Princeton dan Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2011.
- Lombard, Denys, "Les Tarekat en Insulinde", Alexandre Popovic and Gilles Veinstein, eds, *Les Orders Mystiques dans l'Islam: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle*, Paris: L'ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, 1986.
- Lombard, Denys, "Tarekat et Entreprise à Sumatra: L'exemple de Syekh Abdul Wahab Rokan (c.1830-1926)", Marc Gaborieau, et.al., eds., *Naqshbandis: Cheminements et Situation Actuelle d'un Ordre Mystique Musulman*, Paris: Institut Français d'études Anatoliennes d'Istanbul, 1990.
- Mohammad, Abdul Manan, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Khalidiyah in Malaysia: A Study on the Leadership of Haji Ishaq bin Muhammad Arif", *Miqot*, 36 (2) 2012.
- Mudawar, Tajuddin, Sejarah Almarhum Waliyullah Qutubuzzaman Syeikh Abdul Wahab Rokan Tuan Guru Babussalam, n.p., n.d.
- Njoto-Feillard, Gwenaël, *L'islam et la Réinvention du Capitalisme en Indonésie*, Paris : Karthala, 2012.
- Omar, Syed Hadzrullathfi bin Syed and Mohd Shahril bin Othman, "The Ritual Practices of The Naqshbandiyya-Khalidiyya Order in Contemporary Malaysia", *Humanities and Social Sciences Review*, 1 (3), 2012.
- Perret, Daniel, "De la Forêt Primaire Aux Plantations Coloniales: Les Deux Ruptures Politiques et Socio-économiques de la Côte est de Sumatra-Nord", *Bulletin de l'École française d'Extrême-Orient*, 81, 1994.

- Perret, Daniel, *La Formation d'un Paysage Ethnique Batak et Malais de Sumatra Nord-Est*, Paris: Ecole francaise d'Extrême-Orient, 1995.
- Reid, Anthony, "The Japanese Occupation and Rival Indonesian Elites: Northern Sumatra in 1942", *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 35 (1), 1975.
- Rokan, 'Abd al-Wahāb, "Catatan Syaikh 'Abd al-Wahhāb Rokan", Manuscript.

Rokan, 'Abd al-Wahhab, Wasiat 44, n.p. n.d.

- Said, Fuad, Syeikh Abdul Wahab Rokan: Tuan Guru Babussalam, Medan: Pustaka Babussalam, 1983.
- Siregar, Lisga Hidayat, "Tarekat Naqsyabandiyah Syekh 'Abdul Wahab Rokan Babusalam: Suatu Kajian tentang Ajaran dan Aktualisasinya dalam Kehidupan Sosial 1882-1926, *PhD Theses*, SPs UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2003.
- Umam, Saiful, "The Guardian of the Integral Vision of Islamic Practice: The Naqshabandi Sufi Order in Indonesia", *Studia Islamika*, 13 (2), 2006.
- Weismann, Itzchak, The Naqshbandiyya: Orthodoxy and Activism in a Worldwide Sufi Tradition, New York: Routledge, 2007.

*Interviewed* Ahmad, 52-year-old Hasan, 45 years old.

Ziaulhaq Hidayat, UIN Sumatera Utara | ziaulhaq@uinsu.ac.id