



Government Policy in Public Services in the Republic of Tatarstan, Russia*

Refly Setiawan,¹ Mohamad Fikri Sulthan,² Abdurrahman³

^{1, 2, 3}Kazan Federal University, Russia



[10.15408/jch.v8i3.17950](https://doi.org/10.15408/jch.v8i3.17950)

Abstract

Government policy is a step taken by the government to achieve a goal. The main objective of the policy of the Republic of Tatarstan is to provide the conditions for the full social and cultural development of the whole society, to strengthen civil society and society's morals based on respect for the rights of citizens and their recognition as the highest value. This study aims to explain how government policies in the Republic of Tatarstan are related to public services and to find out how the government of the Republic of Tatarstan provides the best services for the welfare of the people. This study uses a qualitative analysis method with a normative juridical approach. The results of this study explain that the government of the Republic of Tatarstan has taken the right policy steps in providing services to the community, namely by providing fast, responsive, optimal, fair, transparent service and utilizing technological advances for the welfare of the people in the Republic of Tatarstan.

Keywords: Government Policy, Public Service, Republic of Tatarstan

* Received: February 18, 2020, revised: March 22, 2020, accepted: July 27, 2020, Published: December 5, 2020.

¹ **Refly Setiawan** is a Student of Political Science Master Program at Kazan Federal University Russia. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0719-1287>

² **Mohamad Fikri Sulthan** is a Student of International Relations Bachelor Program at Kazan Federal University Russia.

³ **Abdurrahman** is a Student of Economy Bachelor Program at Kazan Federal University Russia.

*Corresponding author: refly@ubl.ac.id

Kebijakan Pemerintah dalam Pelayanan Publik di Republik Tatarstan, Rusia

Abstrak

Kebijakan pemerintah merupakan suatu langkah yang diambil oleh pemerintah untuk tercapainya suatu tujuan. Tujuan utama dari kebijakan Republik Tatarstan adalah untuk menyediakan kondisi bagi perkembangan sosial dan budaya-budaya penuh seluruh masyarakat, untuk memperkuat masyarakat sipil dan moral masyarakat atas dasar penghormatan pada hak-hak yang di miliki warga negara serta pengakuannya sebagai nilai tertinggi. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menjelaskan bagaimana Kebijakan pemerintah di Republik Tatarstan terkait dengan pelayanan publik dan untuk mengetahui bagaimana pemerintah Republik Tatarstan dalam memberikan pelayanan bagi kesejahteraan seluruh masyarakat. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode analisis kualitatif dengan pendekatan yuridis normatif. Hasil penelitian ini menjelaskan bahwa pemerintah Republik Tatarstan telah mengambil langkah kebijakan yang tepat dalam pelayanan kepada masyarakat yaitu dengan pelayanan yang cepat, tanggap, optimal, adil, transparan, dan memanfaatkan kemajuan teknologi demi kesejahteraan masyarakat di Republik Tatarstan.

Kata Kunci: Kebijakan Pemerintah, Pelayanan Publik, Republik Tatarstan

Государственная политика в сфере государственных услуг в Республике Татарстан, Россия

Аннотация

Правительственная политика - это шаг, сделанный правительством для достижения цели. Основная цель политики Республики Татарстан - обеспечение условий для полноценного социального и культурного развития всего общества, укрепление гражданского общества и нравственности общества на основе уважения прав граждан и признания их высшее значение. Это исследование направлено на объяснение того, как политика правительства в Республике Татарстан связана с государственными услугами, и на то, чтобы выяснить, как правительство Республики Татарстан предоставляет лучшие услуги для благосостояния людей. В данном исследовании используется метод качественного анализа с нормативно-правовым подходом. В этом исследовании используются вторичные данные, которые можно получить из литературных исследований. Результаты этого исследования объясняют, что правительство Республики Татарстан предприняло правильные политические шаги для оказания услуг населению, а именно путем предоставления быстрых, оперативных, оптимальных, справедливых и прозрачных услуг и использования технологических достижений на благо народа в Республике Татарстан.

Ключевые слова: государственная политика, государственная служба, Республика Татарстан

A. INTRODUCTION

Tatarstan Republic is a Republic that is part of the Russian Federation, which is located not far from the borders of the Mari-El Republic and the Republic of Chuvashia. The capital of the Republic of Tatarstan is the City of Kazan which is the 3rd largest city in Russia after Moscow and Saint Petersburg. The majority of the population in the Republic of Tatarstan are indigenous Tatar people who are Muslim and are dominated by various other tribes in Russia (Zaznaev, 2000). At this time the Republic of Tatarstan has undergone many changes and progress both in terms of economy, society, and culture and is very open to residents who come from outside the City of Kazan as well as foreign residents. The main source of community income in the Republic of Tatarstan comes from oil and natural gas mining which is well managed by the government. Besides, the Government of the Republic of Tatarstan continues to focus on improving people's welfare by improving the economy, education, health services to public services in various sectors. The Government of the Republic of Tatarstan continues to improve itself and improve the quality of public services for the welfare of society. This can be seen from the satisfaction of the people in the Republic of Tatarstan in receiving government services from the public sector to services in the private sector (Rinatovich, 2020).

The Government of the Republic of Tatarstan has currently implemented digitalization in public services that can make it easier for people to access public services and accelerate services to the community. The Government of the Republic of Tatarstan in carrying out its public service functions, based on Federal Law dated 27 July 2010 No. 210-FZ Regarding state and city service provision organizations implementing several policies that can be implemented for the welfare of society, which include (Rinatovich, 2020):

- a. Application of Information and Technology Functions in public services that can facilitate access to users;
- b. Provision of public services appropriately and following public service ethics;
- c. Provision of legal consultation for people who have complaints about violations of the law in public services;
- d. And the implementation of control and evaluation of the performance of public service officers.

Public Service is one of the steps of the government of the Republic of Tatarstan in meeting the needs of the community (Khayrullovi, 2019). Through good service, people feel satisfied and have a good assessment of a government. The public can judge the good or bad of government administration through public services that are responsive and responsible. Good service is not only from the quantity produced but also from the quality that can answer the wishes of the community (Homberg et al., 2019). At this time all residents of the Republic of Tatarstan, both residents and foreign residents, are struggling to survive the disaster that has befallen all people in the world, namely the Covid-19 Virus outbreak. The community demands responsive health services, especially for Covid-19 sufferers who are being treated at the Hospital for Infections and Infectious Diseases in Kazan City. Rustam Minnikhanov as President of the Republic of Tatarstan stated that the government of the Republic of Tatarstan has taken the right steps to prevent the spread of the Covid-19 Virus following established regulations and provides the best public services for all people in the Republic of Tatarstan (Rinatovich, 2020).

In terms of educational services, all people can still learn through online learning which has been determined following the regulations of the central government and the government of the Republic of Tatarstan. As for health services, all people can access directly by telephone and can access the official website of the ministry of health as well as telephone numbers for health services listed on the official website of the government of the Republic of Tatarstan. Until now, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan continues to strive to provide the best service to the community even though the number of personnel on duty is still limited, but efforts are still made to respond to responses from the community. In carrying out its functions the government is faced with several problems including limited human resources, limited tools to support public services, and frequent miss-communication between the central government and the government in the Republic of Tatarstan, especially related to regulations in public services. However, this problem can be resolved properly by the government of the Republic of Tatarstan through appropriate steps to provide optimal services to the people in the Republic of Tatarstan (Zaznaev, 2000).

B. METHODS

The method used in this research is qualitative research methods with a normative juridical approach. According to Moleong (Setiawan, 2016), the

qualitative research model is rooted in the natural setting as wholeness, relies on humans as a research tool, utilizes qualitative methods, conducts data analysis inductively, directs research objectives towards finding theories from the basics, is descriptive, limiting studies by focus and have a set of criteria for checking the validity of the data.

This research was conducted in the Republic of Tatarstan Russia, in this study the researchers examined more in-depth government policy in public services in the Republic of Tatarstan, Russia, and reviewed it based on facts. Sources of data in this study come from secondary data sources. Secondary data sources are data sources that are done by reading, studying, citing, and reviewing the literature, archives, articles, documents, and other supporting materials related to the issues to be studied.

C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Concept of Public Policy

The concept of public policy of the government of the Republic of Tatarstan refers to the concept of the national policy of the Russian Federation (Khayrulloev, 2019). The concept of the national policy of the Russian Federation is a modern system of views, principles, and priorities in the activities of the state authorities of the Russian Federation in the field of national relations. This concept takes into account the need to ensure the unity and integrity of Russia in the new historical conditions of the development of Russian citizenship, the coordination of the national interests and interests of all those who inhabit Russia, the formation of cooperation, and the development of a national language and culture (Valiullova, 2015). The national policy of the state is based on the principles of the Constitution of the Russian Federation and generally recognized norms of international law and finds its expression in the federal legal system, the law of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, as well as treaties on the limitation of the subject of jurisdiction and power between federal agencies of state power and bodies. state power from the constituent bodies of the Russian Federation (Garipov & Zaznaev, 2013). This concept is intended to be a point of reference for public authorities in solving problems of national development and the regulation of inter-ethnic relations, ensuring constitutional human and civil rights.

The main objective of the policy of the Republic of Tatarstan is to provide the conditions for the full social and cultural development of the whole

society, to strengthen civil society and the morals of society based on respect for the rights and freedoms of humans and citizens and their recognition as the highest value. One of the tools for the implementation of the Republic of Tatarstan's policy is the program-target approach, which ensures the unification of the efforts of state authorities, local authorities, and national society in achieving common goals of improving the quality of life, meeting the needs of society and culture in the Republic of Tatarstan (Valiullova, 2015). The Federal Program for the socio-economic and cultural development of society is an appropriate program of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and must take into account the provisions of the government policies of the Republic of Tatarstan (Khayrulloviich, 2019).

The needs and interests of the people must be fully reflected in the federal and regional programs, which are constantly taken into account in the political, economic, and cultural life of the republic and the autonomous formation of the Russian Federation (Golubeva et al., 2019). Equally important is the solution to the complex problems of republican societies, autonomous formations, as well as national communities living in other constituent entities of the Russian Federation, ensuring the proper representation of the people of the Russian Federation in government bodies and local self-governing bodies.

2. Public Service and Policy Innovation

The public sector is a sector that is non-commercial in its implementation, oriented to the public interest, based on the legitimacy of power, as well as the existence of interaction of accountability and transparency between citizens as mandates and the state or government as implementers of public policy. Due to the fact that the public sector is driven by the existence of public policies, innovation in the public sector is inevitably linked to the formulation of public policies. Innovation in the public sector will be very difficult to attend if it does not include or involve a public policy procession in it (United Nations, 2017).

On the other hand, the public sector with all its rigidity has also experienced a wave of demands for change, to be more flexible, better able to respond to challenges, changes, and dynamics that occur during society (Nasi, 2011). The increasing awareness of citizens of their rights, as well as the level of education, literacy, welfare, and other socio-economic aspects have forced the public sector to balance it with policies and quality of services that are equal to the capacity of citizens (Peters & Pierre, 2003). The reasons that underlie the

necessity of the public sector to innovate are also put forward by many groups, not only from academics, as well as practitioners, and of course the general public (Kingdon, 2003).

In the public sector, innovation and policy are two terms that complement each other. Innovation comes as a new product and its nature replace the old way. Likewise, the nature of the policies that exist to replace old policies. This means that every policy, in principle, must contain innovations (United Nations, 2017). Policies that do not contain anything new or replace old ones will only become non-functional policies.

In blending the phrase innovation with policy, there are three types of interaction between innovation and policy, namely:

a). Policy innovation: new policy direction and initiatives. The policy innovation referred to is the existence of new policy initiatives and directions. This means that every public policy issued in principle must contain something new. In particular, a policy innovation according to Walker is a new policy for the country that adopts it, regardless of how outdated the program is or how many other countries have adopted it before.

b). Innovations in the policy-making process. In this role, the focus is on innovations that affect the process of policymaking or formulation. The innovation that appears, in this case, is how to integrate citizen participation mechanisms in the policy formulation process.

c). Policy to foster innovation and its diffusion. The policy in question is a policy specifically created to encourage and develop and spread innovation in various sectors (Kingdon, 2003). Besides, Berry (Holzer & Lee, 2004) explains that the spread of policy innovation occurs by referring to two important determinants, namely internal determinants and regional diffusion. What is meant by internal determinant or internal determinant is the social, economic, and political characteristics of a country that determine the innovativeness of a country. Meanwhile, regional diffusion is the possibility of a country adopting a certain policy is higher if its neighboring countries have adopted the policy. An illustrative example of the internal determinants that lead to policy innovation is domestic socio-economic changes, public demonstrations, the political instability that forces fundamental policy changes for the public interest. Regional diffusion occurs when neighboring countries or other countries implement certain policies that are imitated by a government. In this case, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan made a policy that was usually imitated by neighboring republics such as the Mari-El

Republic and the Republic of Chuvasia although not all policies were the same (Valiullova, 2015).

3. Public Service in the Republic of Tatarstan

Public Service in the Republic of Tatarstan refers to the Federal Law dated 27 July 2010 No. 210-FZ Concerning state and municipal service provider organizations and Federal Law of 27 July 2004 No. 79-FZ On the State Civil Service of the Russian Federation (Rinatovich, 2020). Public services can be interpreted as all forms of services, both in the form of public goods and public services, which in principle are the responsibility and are carried out by government agencies at the central and regional levels to meet the needs of society (Setiawan, 2016). Public services can also be interpreted as service assistance the needs of people or communities who have an interest in the organization following the basic rules and procedures that have been determined (Dube & Danescu, 2020). Based on Federal Law of 27 July 2004 No. 79-FZ, Article 3 states that the state civil service is further divided into federal and state civil services from the constituent entities of the Russian Federation (Golubeva et al., 2019).

Under Article 4 of the Federal Law of 27 July, 2004 No. 79-FZ stated that the principles of public service include: a). Human and civil rights priorities and freedoms; b). Unity of the legal and organizational basis of the service; c). Professionalism and competence of civil servants; d). Civil service stability; e). Availability of information on the civil service; f). Interaction with public associations and citizens (Rinatovich, 2020).

The main objectives of the public service are the practical implementation of the functions of the state, solve its problems, ensure the welfare of society, satisfy the public interest based on the principles and provisions set out in the Constitution of the Russian Federation (Garipov & Zaznaev, 2013).

In carrying out public service functions, based on Article 17 No. 79-FZ, a civil servant who works in the public sector is prohibited from doing:

- a. Fill a civil servant position in: Election or appointment to a public office; Elections for elective positions in local government bodies; Selection of paid elective positions on trade union bodies.
- b. Engage in entrepreneurial activities privately or through proxies, as well as participate in the management of economic entities;

- c. Buy securities where income can be obtained;
- d. Become a lawyer or representative for the third party in a state body where he or she is replacing a civil servant position;
- e. Receive remuneration from individuals and legal entities (gifts, monetary remuneration, loans, services, payments for entertainment, recreation, transportation costs, and other remuneration) (Rinatovich, 2020).

4. Government Policy in Public Services in the Republic of Tatarstan

Government policy is a step taken by the government in carrying out programs that have been determined for the welfare of society (Stone, 2012). In carrying out policies related to public services, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan synergizes with all existing elements, both the government itself and involving the community as actors in public services. The public can be directly involved in the implementation of public service activities and can provide criticism to the government for the advancement of public services in the Republic of Tatarstan. Public policy can be interpreted as the allocation of power values to all binding societies (Khayrulloev, 2019). In this case, only the government of the Republic of Tatarstan can take an action to society and that action is a form of something that is chosen by the government which is a form of allocating values to society. Easton's public policy can be classified as a management process, which is a phase of a series of public official works. In this case, only the government of the Republic of Tatarstan has a share in taking action to the community to solve public problems, so this definition can also be classified in the form of government intervention.

Public policy in the Republic of Tatarstan is related to decisions taken by public officials in the area and has a great impact on the people of the Republic of Tatarstan (Valiullova, 2015). Regarding public services, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan refers to the Federal Law dated 27 July 2010 No. 210-FZ Concerning state and municipal service provision organizations and Federal Law of 27 July 2004 No. 79-FZ Concerning the Civil Service of the State of the Russian Federation, provides an alternative in carrying out policies related to public services to the public which include; a). Responsive services in the education and health sectors; b). Digital services that make it easier for people to access them; c). Services that are optimal, fair, transparent, and touching all levels of society; d). And services that are clean and free from corruption (Rinatovich, 2020).

Through these alternative policies, it is hoped that the government can optimally meet the needs of the community related to public services (Kingdon, 2003). The effects of these government actions include:

- a. There are policy choices made by politicians, government employees, or others that aim to use public power to influence people's lives;
- b. There is a policy output, where the policies implemented at this level require the government to regulate, budget, establish personnel and make regulations in the form of programs that will affect people's lives;
- c. There is a policy impact which is the effect of policy choices that affect people's lives (Stone, 2012).

In the preparation of a policy agenda in public services, Agenda setting is a very strategic phase and process of public policy. If an issue succeeds in gaining status as a public problem and gets priority on the public agenda, then that issue deserves more allocation of public resources than any other issue (Kingdon, 2003).

In the agenda-setting, it is also very important to determine a public issue that will be raised in a government agenda. Policy issues are often referred to as policy problems. Policy issues usually arise because there has been a disagreement between actors regarding the direction of action that has been or will be taken, or conflicting views regarding the character of the problem. According to Dunn (Arnold, 2014), policy issues are a product or function of a debate either about the formulation, details, explanation, or assessment of a particular problem. However, not all issues can be included on the policy agenda.

In the government policy of the Republic of Tatarstan, there are several criteria for issues that can be used as a public policy agenda (Valiullova, 2015) including: a). has reached a certain critical point if ignored, will be a serious threat; b). has reached a certain level of particularity has a dramatic impact; c). concerning certain emotions from the point of interest. crowds (mankind) and receive mass media support; d). questioning power and legitimacy in society; e). concerning a fashionable problem (difficult to explain, but easy to feel its presence).

Characteristics: The elected and appointed officials of the Republic of Tatarstan (Duma Council) put the issue on the public agenda. Many problems were left untouched, while others were put on hold for a long time.

Illustration: The Duma Council and all government officials preparing a bill submit it to the Ministry of Health and Welfare Commission for study and approval. The draft stops at the committee and is not elected. In this case, the preparation of the policy agenda should be done based on the urgency and essence of the policy, as well as stakeholder involvement. A policy should not obscure the urgency, essence, and involvement of stakeholders.

Two consequences can arise from policymaking according to Sabatier (Peters & Pierre, 2003), namely: policies that are oriented towards public services in the sense that they are following the meaning of democracy and policies that poison the public or policies that are set for the interests of only a few groups, and This second impact is very counterproductive to democratic values. As we know, one of the functions of politics is to make policies and policies exist due to 2 factors, namely; there are social problems and a change of power which results in changing policies. The policy can be realized using; Making Law Regulations, Planning Activities, Various interventions in the economy or social community. Because the policy is an act and decision of the government, the policy is characterized by the power that is dominated by the government and following the law and government authority (Nasi, 2011).

In implementing policies on public services, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan provides easy access for the public to be able to connect with the government through active sites and digital applications that can be accessed easily. The following is an example of an application used by the government of the Republic of Tatarstan regarding public services:

Figure 1. Online Public Services



Source: <https://uslugi.tatarstan.ru/>

Online public service is a step taken by the government of the Republic of Tatarstan to stay connected to the public. Through this online application, the public can easily access it after initial registration so that they can be registered as users of public services. Besides, the public can provide criticism and suggestions through the available contacts and comment fields in the online application that can be accepted by the government for improving the public service system in the Republic of Tatarstan (Rinatovich, 2020). Good public service is a service that can be quickly felt by the community without differentiating between certain statuses and groups (Homberg et al., 2019). In public services in the Republic of Tatarstan, the government has implemented service functions optimally based on public service procedures that prioritize professionalism for the welfare of the people in the Republic of Tatarstan. This can be seen from the response of the people in the Republic of Tatarstan who feel that their needs for education, health, and other services can be met by the government in the Republic of Tatarstan so that most people are satisfied with the services provided by the government.

According to Freed (Setiawan, 2016), Public services in good governance must meet the quality that must be met. The existing public services must function to reduce (even eliminate) the role gap between the central organization and the implementing organizations in the regions. The number of staff or employees is appropriate, not less, and not at the middle and upper levels so that public services can be right on target. The services provided must also bring the government closer to the community as customers. In this case, the government of the Republic of Tatarstan continues to strive to provide the best service for the people of the Republic of Tatarstan and avoid social disparities in services to the community, both local and foreign.

Government policies in public services can be assessed positively or negatively by the community, this depends on how society reacts to it and how the role of government in providing services to the community (Stone, 2012). If people feel satisfied and feel happy without giving negative criticism, then government policies are deemed right on target and have a good impact on services to the community.

D. CONCLUSIONS

Based on the research results it can be concluded that the government policy of the Republic of Tatarstan related to public services is considered to have been carried out optimally, this is based on the implementation of the

Federal Law dated 27 July 2010 No. 210-FZ Concerning state and municipal service provider organizations and Federal Law of 27 July 2004 No. 79-FZ On State Civil Service of the Russian Federation. In implementing this law, the government has a clear flow in providing public services in the Republic of Tatarstan. Until now, the Government of the Republic of Tatarstan provides services both digitally and manually and is carried out professionally for the welfare of the people in the Republic of Tatarstan.

The application of digitalization in public services is considered a good step to stay connected to the community as service users. The people feel cared for by the government and think that government exists for the people in the Republic of Tatarstan. With government policies in public services in the Republic of Tatarstan, so far it has been assessed as being right on target and meeting the needs of the community. The government is considered successful and has worked optimally for the advancement of the Republic of Tatarstan and the interests of the people. Therefore, the government always receives criticism from the community for the expected development and progress and can have a positive impact in the future.

REFERENCES:

- Arnold, G. "Policy learning and science policy innovation adoption by street level bureaucrats", *Journal of Public Policy*, Volume 34 Number 3 (2014).
- Dube, S., & Danescu, D., "Supplemental Guidance: Public Sector Definition", The Institute of Internal Auditors, https://global.theiia.org/standards_guidance/Public%20Documents/Public%20Sector%20Definition.pdf, downloaded on July 19, 2020.
- Garipov, R. F., & Zaznaev, O. I., "Political Responsibility of The Head of The Region in Modern Russia" *Bulletin of the Saratov University*, Volume 13 Number 2 (2013).
- Golubeva, A. A., Gilenko, E. V., & Dzhezheya, V. B. "Enhancing Public Value of Local Public Services through Electronic Interaction", *Russian Management Journal*, Volume 17 Number 2 (2019).
- Holzer, M. & Lee, S. *Public Productivity*, New York: Marcel Dekker, 2004.
- Homberg, F., Vogel, R., & Weiherl, J. "Public service motivation and continuous

- organizational change: Taking charge behavior at police services”, Volume 97 Number 1 (2019).
- Khayrulloev, M. F., “State Council of The Republic of Tatarstan: Parliament at The Service of Society Interests”, Current Problems of Theory and Practice of Constitutional Proceedings, Volume 14 Number 1 (2019).
- Kingdon, J. W. *Agendas, Alternatives, and Public Policies*, United of Kingdom: Longman, 2003.
- Nasi, G. “Public Personnel Policies: Impact on Government Performance”, *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, Volume 13 Number 1 (2011).
- Peters, B. G. & Pierre, J. *Public Administration*, London: Sage, 2003.
- Rinatovich, K. A., “Minister of Digital Development of Public Administration, Information Technologies and Communications of the Republic of Tatarstan” <https://digital.tatarstan.ru/infa.htm>, downloaded on July 21, 2020.
- Setiawan, R. “Peranan Etika Aparatur Sipil Negara Dalam Pelayanan Publik Pada Dinas Kependudukan Dan Catatan Sipil (Disdukcapil) Kota Bandar Lampung” *Jurnal e-JKPP*, Volume 2 Number 2 (2016).
- Stone, D. *Policy Paradox: The Art of Political Decision Making*, Norton & The company, 2012.
- United Nations, “Innovation in The Public Sector Country Experiences and Policy Recommendations” United Nations Publication Issued by The Economic Commission for Europe, Switzerland, 2017.
- Valiullova D. R., “State Youth Policy: Experience of The Republic of Tatarstan”, Conference: Legal and Socio-Pedagogical Aspects of Prevention of Offenses of Minors and Youth, Elabuga on April 17, 2015.
- Zaznaev, O. I., “Republic of Tatarstan” *Journal of Constitutional Law: An Eastern European Review*, Volume 3 Number 1 (2000).