What Can the Afghanistan Ulama Learn from The Islamic Modernism Movement in Indonesia?

Habiburrahman Rizapoor*
Badakhasan University
Badakhasan, Afghanistan
habiburrahman.rizapoor19@mhs.uinjkt.ac.id

Ghulam Mustafa Nukhba
Kabul University
Kabul, Afghanistan
mnukhba.nukhba@gmail.com

Abstract

This article aimed to explain what the Afghan Ulama learned from the Islamic modernism movements in Indonesia in implementing the Islamic modernism values in Afghanistan. This study explored the challenges, methods of implementation of Islamic modernism values in Indonesia. This research used the analytical and descriptive method by referring to books and journal articles. This study argued that implementing Islamic modernism values in Afghanistan was a challenging and problematic process. Therefore, the Islamic Modernism movements of Afghanistan needed to work cautiously to remove obstacles and challenges calmly and without violence to pave the way for the spread of their massages. This research concluded that Islamic scholars and academics in Indonesia were mostly successful at spreading Islamic modernism values and overcoming the challenges faced with in the country. Similarly, because of the social, political and religious features; being of Indonesia as the largest Islamic country with racial and religious diversity, having the experience of Islamic modernism, and the existence of similarities between the two countries, Indonesia was an outstanding model for Afghanistan's Islamic modernism movements. Therefore, the Afghan Islamic modernism movements can use the approaches that Indonesian Islamic modernism movements used for the spread of Islamic modernism values in the country.

Keywords: *Afghanistan Islamic modernism; Indonesian Islamic modernism; Islamic modernism, new Islamic modernism*

*Corresponding Author

Abstrak

Artikel ini bertujuan untuk menjelaskan apa yang dapat dipelajari oleh para Ulama Afghanistan dari gerakan modernisme Islam di Indonesia dalam mengimplementasikan nilai-nilai modernisme Islam di Afghanistan. Lebih lanjut, penelitian ini mengeksplorasi tantangan, metode implementasi nilai-nilai modernisme Islam di Indonesia. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode analitik dan deskriptif dengan mengacu pada buku dan artikel jurnal. Studi ini berpendapat bahwa implementasi nilai-nilai modernisme Islam di Afghanistan merupakan proses yang menantang dan problematis. Oleh karena itu, gerakan Modernisme Islam Afghanistan perlu bekerja dengan hati-hati untuk menghilangkan rintangan dan tantangan dengan tenang dan tanpa kekerasan untuk membuka jalan penyebaran pijatan mereka. Hasil penelitian ini menyimpulkan bahwa para ulama dan akademisi Islam di Indonesia sebagian besar berhasil menyebarkan nilai-nilai modernisme Islam dan mengatasi tantangan yang dihadapi di tanah air. Demikian pula, karena ciri-ciri sosial, politik dan agama; Indonesia sebagai negara Islam terbesar dengan keragaman ras dan agama, memiliki pengalaman modernisme Islam, dan adanya kesamaan antara kedua negara, Indonesia akan menjadi model yang bagus untuk Gerakan modernisme Islam Afghanistan. Oleh karena itu, gerakan modernisme Islam Afghanistan dapat menggunakan pendekatan yang digunakan oleh gerakan modernisme Islam Indonesia untuk penyebaran nilai-nilai modernisme Islam di Tanah Air.

Kata kunci: *modernisme, modernisme Islam, modernisme Islam baru, modernisme Islam Indonesia, modernisme Islam Afghanistan*

الملخص

تهدف هذه المقالة إلى شرح ما يمكن أن يتعلمه العلماء الأفغان من حركات الحداثة الإسلامية في إندونيسيا في تطبيق قيم الحداثة الإسلامية في أفغانستان. علاوة على ذلك، تستكشف هذه الدراسة التحديات وطرق تطبيق قيم الحداثة الإسلامية في إندونيسيا. يستخدم هذا البحث المنهج الوصفي التحليلي بالرجوع إلى الكتب والمقالات الصحفية. تجادل هذه الدراسة بأن تطبيق قيم الحداثة الإسلامية في أفغانستان عملية صعبة وإشكالية. لذلك فإن حركات الحداثة الإسلامية في أفغانستان بحاجة إلى العمل بحذر لإزالة العقبات والتحديات بهدوء ودون عنف لتمهيد الطريق لانتشار التدليك. يخلص هذا البحث إلى أن العلماء والأكاديميين المسلمين في إندونيسيا نجحوا في الغالب في نشر قيم الحداثة الإسلامية والتغلب على التحديات التي تواجه الدولة. وأيضا بسبب السمات الاجتماعية والسياسية والدينية، كون إندونيسيا أكبر دولة إسلامية ذات تنوع عرقي وديني، ولديها تجربة الحداثة الإسلامية، ووجود أوجه تشابه بين البلدين، فإن إندونيسيا ستكون نموذجًا رائعًا لحركات الحداثة الإسلامية في أفغانستان. لذلك، يمكن لحركات الحداثة الإسلامية الأفغانية أن تستخدم الأساليب التي استخدمتها حركات الحداثة الإسلامية الإندونيسية لنشر وتكامل قيم الحداثة الإسلامية في البلاد.

الكلمات الرئيسية: الحداثة، الحداثة الإسلامية، الحداثة الإسلامية الجديدة، الحداثة الإسلامية الإندونيسية، الحداثة الإسلامية الأفغانية

INTRODUCTION

The term Islamic Modernism is defined by the Oxford Islamic studies online as, "the reform of Islamic tradition through the emphasis on the Quran and Sunnah to meet the needs of modern society, including its institutions and technology arose in the nineteenth century. Its goal was to restore the strength, dynamism, and flexibility of Muslim societies" (Oxford, 2020). According to some scholar, Islamic modernism is definable by three aspects: "as an analytical instrument; as a social fact; and as an ideology" (Owoyemi, 2012).

Islam and modernism values are not generally contradictory, and it is possible to be a Muslim with modernist values. For instance, there can be a society whose members believe in Islam, think in Islamic thought and practice, and behave in an Islamic manner while they are observing the values of modernism, which are not against Islamic teaching. The affairs of society need to be governed based on collective wisdom, freedom, and the rights of individuals. It means that Islam and modernity are well-matched in most parts; however, this does not mean that Islam is compatible with all the values of western modernism and that there is no incompatibility between the two.

Introducing Islamic modernity has its pros and cons. Some argue that Islamic modernity is a distortion of the genuine spirit of Islam. For example, *Majma'al-Fiqh al-Islami* argues that Islamic modernism is a term that looks very good and beautiful, but it is a poison used against Islam, and it is a distortion of the true face of Islam (Jadah, 2010). Whereas, the Islamic renaissance, on the one hand, looks at it as the renewal of Islam because it could help Muslims regain their lost glory. Muslim reformers demand reform and reinterpretation of Islam in line with modern trends and contemporary needs of the world (Owoyemi, 2012).

What makes this research important is that Islamic modernity in Afghanistan is now re-emerging after a hiatus during the Mujahideen and the Taliban, and by promoting the modernization of Islam and embracing new values such as democracy, freedom of opinion, freedom of religion, freedom of speech, and other modernist values, have raised questions in people's minds. Some see it as absolute infidelity and a project of Westernization of Muslims by Westerners and the occupying forces, while others see it as a need for Afghan society and a step to reduce the role of religious extremist groups in society. Because they believe that institutionalizing these values can eliminate violence and reduce the role of extremist groups by gaining the support of the people. Similarly, Dr. Yousuf Al-Qardawi thinks that acts of violence and terrorism are triggered by fanaticism and intolerance which extremists believe and use for reaching their goals (Haris, 2006). When we say Islamic extremists, of course, the target is not only those who take up arms and kill others. But the target is also the people who strictly interpret religious texts, and think that their interpretation and understanding of Islam is the only interpretation and anyone who interprets Islam contrary to their interpretation, are heretics "Mubtad'i" and count them as a threat to themselves (Haris, 2006).

There is no independent article or book about this study. However, many articles and books have been written about Islamic modernism separately in Indonesia and Afghanistan: for example, "The Typology of Contemporary Religious Movements in Contemporary Herat" (2018) written by Abdulkadir Salehi. In this book, the author discusses various Islamic groups, including Islamic modernists in Afghanistan, and describes the characteristics of each group. The author of this book argues that one way to eliminate religious extremism in Afghanistan is to spread the Islamic modernism values in the country. Because Islamic modernism movements can eradicate Islamic extremism and bloodshed by rereading and reinterpreting the religious texts according to the needs of the contemporary world. Similarly, by strengthening the relationship between Allah and people and criticizing the violent interpretation of religious texts by extremists and followers of political Islam.

The author also adds that doing the above activities is difficult, but it is one of the effective ways to eradicate the monster of violence and extremism in the country (Salihi, 2018). The shortcoming seen in this book is the lack of information on explaining the problems and challenges Islamic modernism movements faced with in spreading Islamic modernism values. However, it can help us better understand Islamic modernity in the city of Herat, which is the origin of most of the Afghan Muslim modernist scholars.

Similarly, the article *"Ahmad Dahlan, Islam, dan Modernitas di Indonesia"* by Nyong Eka Teguh Iman Santosa (2003) discusses the role of Ahmad Dahlan in implementing and spreading Islamic modernism in Indonesia, and can provide a clear picture of Islamic modernity in Indonesia, for instance, how Islamic modernity grew up in Indonesia, what methods were used, and what challenges they faced and how they overcame those challenges. The author of this article claims that the emergence of Islamic modernization movements in the Islamic world is a positive step toward the improvement of Islam. Muslims need to prove their cultural identity and that Islam is the answer to the existing social, economic, and political problems. The way to reach this goal is Islamic modernism, which is the connecting point between the modern world and Islam; and calls for a new interpretation of religious texts corresponding to the new era (Santosa, 2003).

METHOD

In this article, the author uses analytical and descriptive research methods. The study was done by referring and analyzing various books and articles on Islamic modernism and related topics in Indonesia and Afghanistan. In the beginning, the writer does a literature review and explains what Islamic modernism mean, the history of Islamic modernism, types of Islamic modernism, and then provides a glance at the Indonesian approach to Islam, and Islamic modernism in Indonesia, after that explains the Islamic modernism movement, challenges toward it in Afghanistan, likewise explores the lessons that Afghan Islamic modernism movements can learn from the Indonesian Islamic movements. Similarly, the study suggests ways that Indonesian Islamic modernism movements and the Indonesian government can help their Afghan counterparts in the spread of Islamic modernism in Afghanistan.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Islamic modernism

Modernism as a movement can be understood as mastering motivation of western education, technology, and industrialization, including ideas about democracy. Islamic Modernism was introduced by some scholars from the Islamic reform movement, such as Muhammad Abdu and Fazlur Rahman (1919-1988). The scholar divided the dialectics of development renewal in the Islamic world into several movements: First, Revivalism Pramodernists appeared around the 18 to 19th century in the Arabic world. In India, the general characteristics of this movement include: (1) Concern about the moral degradation of Muslims both in religion and education. (2) Exclamation back to original Islam. (3) Call to get rid of shades of predeterminism. (4) Recommendations on the need to use the force of weapons when urgent (Fundamentalism). Second, classical Modernism (the mid-19th century or early 20th century) under the influence of Western ideas. There was an appeal that the door of *Ijtihad* was open and there was a connection between reason and revelation (Muh Abduh), and social modernism, women's emancipation (Qasim Amin) and political modernism (*Ali Abdul Raziq*) helped mark the rise of Islamic modernization.

Third, post-revivalist modernism or Neo-Fundamentalism. This group did not continue to fire classical modernism - they always distinguish Islam from the West.

Fourth, neo-modernists are a synthesis movement that wants to fight revivalists and cover the shortcomings of classical modernists (Abdullah A. , 2013)

Maẓharuddin Siddiqi in his article "Islamic modernism", divided modernist reform movements into four categories: Pure educational movements, Educational movements with intellectual implications, Political movements to liberate the Islamic world, along with a certain amount of intellectual thinking, and Pure intellectual movements (1973).

Most Islamic modernists have been influenced by the teachings of Sayed Jamaluddin Afghani. Al-Afghani was dissatisfied with the existence of governments in Islamic countries that were under the influence of the West and wanted to turn these governments into independent governments that, in the one hand, serve their people and in other hand can lead Islamic countries to progress and excellence. Sayyid Jamal al-Din Afghani was not in favor of the abolition of a government in a country, but he was eager to change the system of the government in all Islamic countries. Although Sayed Jamaluddin failed in implementing his desire to change government systems in Islamic countries, he influenced the *Ulema* and academics in various Muslim counties. After him, many scholars and academics pursued his goals and promoted them, such as Muhammad Abdu, Rashid Reda, and others (Siddiqi, 1973).

Sayyid Jamal al-Din Afghani considered the founder and dynasty of religious modernism (Hafiz, 1997). Sayed Jamal's modernist ideas were not exposed to "fundamental religious texts" but mainly his idea-focused on the axis of "re-reading" The rationality of the *Shari'a* was centralized. While emphasizing the full compatibility between fundamental religious texts and human reasoning, he believed that the backwardness of Muslims was because of the misunderstanding and misinterpretation of Islam and because the Islamic world is suffering from domestic tyranny, foreign colonialism, and other socio-political misfortunes, there must be an interaction between religion and modern science and narrations must be reinterpreted in the reason's light (Salihi, 2018).

Islamic modernists in the classical era, especially the nineteenth century, wanted reforms in the politic, society, law, moral and intellectual issues. The classical modernists dealt with the issues of the status of women, modern education, constitutional reform, and freedom of men and women. However, modernists dealt with all the facts of life, especially intellectual reforms (Rahman, 1970).

The relationship between religion and modernity is controversial. Some believe that religion and modernity are compatible, while others think that religion and modernity have no compatibility. Based on facts, it is possible to create compatibility between the two with little interference and seizure, for example, by localizing the indicators of modernity or a corrective attitude towards religion (Shafaqna, 2016). Alê 'Abd al-Réziq thinks that Islam is not against modernity, just as Islam is not against democracy, democratic institutions, and values. He believes that the Prophet (PBUH) brought a religion that has a clear spiritual message and is not a political system, government, or country, and the prophet paid more attention to the spiritual affairs of the people than to their worldly and political affairs ('Abdal-Réziq, 2009). Some Islamic reformists believe that the Islamic world lacks the concepts of democracy, human rights, gender equality, social justice, freedom of expression and thought, development of science and technology and excellent education. Therefore, the Muslim world needs to copy these concepts from the west and adopt them in their communities (Owoyemi, 2012). Even Islamic scholars think that Islamic modernism or modernization of Islam is a big threat to Islam and their culture as Mustafa Sharif Says that modernity is one of the biggest challenges that the Arab world faces today, in fifteen

centuries after the revelation of the Qur'an, there is a crisis of values, because of the complexity of the world today and the lack of proper approach, and in order not to lose our identity, Muslims must find a balance between originality and modernity (Sharif, 1999).

Samantha Huntington gives the best answer to whether it is possible to be modern without westernization, arguing that modernization and Westernization are completely different things. Before the West became modern, the West gained its distinctive features around the eighth or ninth centuries, but the West only became "modern" around the eighteenth century. Huntington further argues that Western civilization is valuable, not because of its universal character, but because it is unique. The modernization of society means industrialization, urbanization, and raising the levels of literacy, education, and wealth. But Western society means classical heritage, the separation of religion and state, the rule of law, and civil society. Modernization is not westernization (Kazimi, 2018).

Religious modernism is a theoretical approach that challenges the common understanding of Islam and seeks to distinguish between the teachings of religion and establish the modern world. The emergence of religious modernism in the Islamic world dates back to the 19th century.

With consideration of the pros and cons of compatibility of Islam and modernity, accepting popular and one hundred percent Western culture and values or fully rejecting of modernity does not seem logical and correct, we as Muslims accept cases of modernity that are not against our religious values and reject those that are against our religious values. In this way, we have both preserved our religion and made ourselves equal to the contemporary world and its values (Sharif, 1999, pp. 17-18). It is one mistake of some Islamic modernist movements and individuals that they are very extreme in accepting the modern values as they try to interpret Islamic teaching according to what the West thinks and wants. Thus, in implementing modernity, several points must be considered, including. First, in implementing modernity, Muslims should use innovation and not blindly follow up of the West. By considering this point, modernity can be implemented by considering the religious principles. Second, modernity must be practiced in which there is no harm to others. So, in this case, Muslims will not build weapons of mass destruction and will not do other harmful actions. Third, modernity should be seen and practiced as an internal phenomenon, not an external and Western phenomenon (Taḥa, 2006).

Indonesian Approach to Islam

Indonesia is the largest Muslim country in the world, with a 229 million Muslim population out of 255 million total population. Muslims in Indonesia comprise 87.20% of the whole population (Population, 2020). Islam spread in Indonesia by Sufi traders who come from India and other parts of the world (Abdullah A. , 2018). Besides Muslims, other religions such as Protestants, Catholics, Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism, and many other small religions, such as Ahmadiyya and other local religions (Mujiburrahman, 2019). Although Islam is the second-largest religion in the world and it is one religion in all parts of the world, but some Islamic sects differ in some practices. Likewise, Muslims behave with Islamic teaching differently. For example, some look at Islam as the religion of peace, tolerance and love; and others believe that it is the religion of Jihad and killing nun-Muslims. Muslims in Indonesia are more peaceful, friendly, and tolerant (McDaniel, 2014). Likewise, Indonesian Muslims are more accommodating towards local beliefs, religious practices, traditions, and culture.

According to Azyumardy Azra, the Islamic civilization has eight cultural domains: Arabic cultural domain which has many traditions and tribe, the second is Iranian cultural domain which has Persian intellectual tradition, the third is the Turkish cultural domain

which is not very philosophical, the fourth is Sudanic Islamic culture domain which has an orientation of local culture, the fifth is Indo-Pakistan cultural domain with strong mystical tradition because of its much influence by Hindu tradition, the sixth is China Islamic cultural domain which is very respectful for ancestors, the seventh is the Western Islamic culture domain which is facing to threats and became a kind of politics of identity, the eighth is *Nusantara* Islamic Culture domain which distinctive Islam and its more tolerant, relaxed and flowering (Darajat, 2015). Azra claims that the principal reason for this difference is because of the different methods used to spread Islam in Indonesia and other parts of the world. Islam spread in Indonesia mostly by Sufis in the 12th century onwards. In other parts of the world, such as Africa, Europe, Islam was mostly spread by the sword and war. for this reason, that war put effects on them and they are not more friendly and tolerant like countries Islam spread in peaceful ways (Amran, 2018).

Islam in Indonesia has some characteristics that differ from Islam in other parts of the world, for instance:

1. Indigenist and cultural Islam. In reality, Islam cannot be separated from the context of local culture. Muhammad (PBUH) also rejected the unfair customs and traditions of his tribe and approved and practiced their lawful ones. For example, when the Prophet Mohammad (PBUH) saw the lizard at his table, he did not eat it. Khaled (one of his companions), asked whether the lizard's eating was forbidden, oh Messenger of Allah? The Prophet (PBUH), said: No, but it is not eaten in the land of my people, so I found not to eat it (Al-Qushairi). It means that culture plays a significant role in practicing Islam and it respects and observes the local cultures, as the prophet did not eat the lizard because his tribe Quraish used to not eat it, not because its eating was forbidden. Muslim intellectuals in Islamic modernism movements unite Islam with the local culture. Likewise, they parallelize and harmonize Islam with a vision of nationality and statehood, objectively and proportionally.

2. When one sees Indonesian Islam, one sees how tolerant, peaceful, pluralistic are Indonesian Muslims. Islam in Indonesia provides a good example of how a religion can develop in a pluralistic and multi-ethnic society. Indonesian Islam is the least Arabicized Islam, but it is not less Islamic. However, it has some characteristics that most Muslim countries do not have. For example, Muslim women in Indonesia have more freedom in religious, social, cultural, and political life. They can be seen in each aspect of life and play their role as men do. Although most of the population are Muslim and most practice Islam, conservative and Islamist groups never get the majority vote in elections, neither in the presidential or parliamentary elections. This shows that Indonesian Muslims are saying 'no' to Islamism and are eager to have a Pancasila based government (Nugraha, 2012).

Indonesians, without consideration of religion, race, color, ethnicity, or other differences, have accepted to have a government based on Pancasila values. Muslim leaders in the country accepted Pancasila as Islamic enough and as a *Kalima al-sawa* for the country because it is a middle path between the ideas of secular and Islamic states. This kind of government can keep people together and prevent a community from disagreement, division, separation, strife, and war. Indonesia is not a country with one religion and one ethnicity. There are tens of religions and many ethnicities and they cannot come together without having something in common, referred to as a Pancasila. Having a government based on Pancasila, Indonesia enjoys political stability and steady economic growth. It is the largest democracy after India and has a growing economy among countries of the region. Indonesia also has many civil society groups, such as Nahdlatul 'Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah,

which work for the prosperity of the country and people in the political, educational, and health areas (Morfit, 1981).

Islamic Modernism in Indonesia

The terms modern, modernism and modernization refer to the flow of movement and efforts to change notions, customs, and old institutions, etc., to enable it to adapt to discoveries by science and technology. In the religious perspective, this means improving the insight of religious knowledge and encourage people to independently understand religious teachings (Syabani, 2018).

Muslims are eager to receive progress and development in their daily life because their religion responds to the needs of people in each place and time and it should work for all the people, at all times, and everywhere. Indonesian Islam known as a moderate Islam in the world, and Islamic modernism has long roots in Indonesian society, As president Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono said in one of his statements that Indonesia is "a country where democracy, Islam and modernity go hand in hand" (Nugraha, 2012) In Indonesia, some young people (for example, Harun Nasution, Mukti Ali, Nurcholish Madjid, Djohn Efendi, Ahmad Wahib, Muh Natsir, and other), who were educated by modern education, started Islamic modernism movements in the country (Abdullah A., 2013). Indonesian religious groups, such as Muhammadiyah and NU both agree on modernizing religion based on the famous rule that says: "Preserving the good old, and adopting the better new" meaning: maintain the relevant old one and retrieve a new more relevant one. (Syabani, 2018) From these two organizations in Indonesia Muhammadiyah accepts the local traditions as religious practice as long they are not against the specific text of Islam, thus Muhammadiyah is referred to as Cultural Da'wah (Darajat, 2015).

Muhammadiyah implemented modernization in all aspects of life but focuses on social and religious aspects. In social aspects, it includes patterns of relationships, communication, influence, and other community activities. In the religious aspect, the activities are related to religious services and matters relating to human relationships with Allah (Syabani, 2018). For example, Muhammadiyah modernized the field of education by linking religious science with general science by making Madrasas, colleges, and universities (Syabani, 2018). According to Budhy Munawar Rachman, Islamic modern thinking can be divided into three categories, each of which has its characteristics:

Rational Islam
In this category that Islamic research is carried out to fulfill the role of establishing universal opinion, eliminating doubts, and finding a conclusive belief about Islam. Rational Islam refers to identifying rational beliefs from effective value, which is rationally epistemologically justified. Famous figures include Harun Nasution and John Efendi.

Islamic civilization
This seeks to create meaning from concrete manifestations in the Qur'an. Therefore, besides linguistic analysis of key concepts of the Quran, it also pays attention to understanding Islam from *Salaf* (Islamic predecessors) perspectives. This circle is trying to transform the understanding gained from Islamic history into social history today. Famous figures of this category are Nurcholish Madjid and Kuntowijoyo.

Transformative Islam
This is motivated by radical social science. The basic mission is to carry out activities that free poor Muslim communities, both in physical and moral form. Famous figures of this category includes M. Dawam Raharjo and Adi Sasono (Rachman, 1995).

Nurcholish Majid draws two facts in his view: first, that modernity is a universal phenomenon that must be accepted and contributed; The second is that Islamic Modernity is possible. Muslims today have to face this by seeking a rational understanding of the phenomena and accepting once again that living with secularism is not a declaration of the disappearance of faith and the invalidity of religion, because religious movements have multiplied in terms of demand for modernization, but more likely to understand secularism as transforming the religious phenomenon in modern societies, in terms of roles and functions (Munsaf, 2017).

Indonesia has gone through many difficulties in Islamic modernization. Indonesian Islamic modernism movements have implemented many actions to modernize Islam in the country:

1. Establishment of schools, Madrasas and universities that spread the message of modernization. For example, before 1899, schools were only for boys, girls were not allowed to attend schools, but were trained in the home about how to be an excellent housewife. However, between 1899 and 1904, girls were educated and given the right to be educated in schools and Universities.
2. Spreading the modernization message by publishing articles in magazines and newspapers. For example, around 1910-1916 AD, al-Munir magazine, published by Abdullah Ahmad. The Islamic modernist used this as a tool to spread their voice of reform and modernization to Muslims in the region. Tempo magazine played a significant role in socializing the values of modernism and providing information about Nurcholish Madjid in the May 1971 edition. (Abdullah A. , 2013)
3. Establishing religious organizations that voice modernism and reform by preaching at religious centers and educating people via their educational centers. For example, in 1912 AD, Ahmad Dahlan established the organization Muhammadiyah in Yogyakarta which played a significant role in spreading moderate Islam in the country. Their goal was to purify Islamic teaching from non-Islamic teaching, polytheism, and heresy. This organization started educating people with a curriculum that contained both Islamic and general science subjects.
4. The nationalism approach. This movement with an Islamic approach and nation loving resisted foreign domination to free Indonesian territory from the grip of the Dutch invaders (Fathoni, 2011). This movement played a significant role in Indonesian unity by lobbying for Pancasila as the base of the state. Also, they were looking to Islam as an ideology that can be a symbol of nationalism and national unity. At the result of their efforts, the archipelago agreed to establish a state called Indonesia (Ilyas, 2020).

Indonesia is one of the Islamic countries where the dialogue and conflict between Islamic modernists and traditionalists is visible. This dialogue lasted for almost a century and continues to nowadays. The conclusion that can be drawn from this struggle is that the Islamic modernists did not succeed in eliminating the traditionalists (Hasbullah, 2014). Perhaps the reason Islamic modernists could not eradicate the traditionalists is that traditional Islam is old in Indonesia and its roots are deep in this land and it seems difficult to eradicate it easily (Hasbullah, 2014). The goal of Islamic modernists should not be to eliminate traditionalism, but only to replace the new concepts with which Islam is compatible.

The country's vast natural resources have led Indonesia's elite to believe that Indonesia deserves a prominent role in the world. (Nugraha, 2012) That is why Indonesia adopted a policy based on which they will spread Islam with modernist values and tolerance for the sake of decreasing the negative effects of extremist groups on Islamic values in the world

and the region (Tan, 2007). Therefore, Indonesia can play a role in spreading Islam with modernist values in Afghanistan.

This article proposes the Indonesian Islamic modernism movement as a model for the Islamic modernism of Afghanistan. Because of the characteristics that can make them superior to others. For example, Indonesia is the largest Islamic country, with multi-culture, multi-religion, multi-ethnic, the culture of tolerance, observing the principles of Islam, and modernism values. The other thing that makes this country unique is that Indonesia is not involved in proxy wars in the region and the world. Also, it is not backing one side of the war in Afghanistan. The people of Afghanistan look at Indonesia as a friendly and impartial country. Other countries like Pakistan, Iran, Turkey, Saudi Arabia, and other Islamic countries of the region either fueling the war and extremism in Afghanistan or do not have the characteristics to become a model for the Islamic modernism movement of Afghanistan. Afghanistan is a multinational, multi-sect, and multi madhab/country. Likewise, the majority of afghans are Hanafi, but there are Some Salafists, some Shias, and even there is a small population of Hindus. Also, there are distinct races like Pashtuns, Tajiks, Uzbeks, Hazaras, Sadat's, and many others that live in different parts of the country. It shows that Indonesia and Afghanistan are similar in many aspects. Therefore, Indonesia can be a dominant model for the Afghan Islamic modernism movement.

Modernism in Afghanistan

The religion of Islam has been one of the most influential forces in the history of Afghanistan. Before the spread of Islam many other religions such as Buddhism, Zoroastrian Fire worshipers and Brahmins were existing in the country. Islam came to Afghanistan by Arab conquerors during the khilafat of Usman bin Afan (Green, 2016).

In Afghan society, tribal and local traditions and customs are usually prominent. It is very rare for these tribal and local traditions to change and be replaced by recent phenomena. Sometimes, even these tribal customs and habits are replacing religious values and rules. Sometimes, even religious scholars (*Ulama*) cannot deal with and prioritize Islamic injunctions to the local customs. Therefore, it sounds challenging to transform Afghanistan from a traditional society to a modern one based on Islamic values (Jawedan, 2009).

The debate between tradition and modernity in Afghan society has been one of the most serious issues in the last hundred years, and sometimes has led to the fall of political regimes and the emergence of backward governments. In recent years, especially after the alternative approach of the international community to Afghanistan, this debate has entered various scientific, religious and civil fields and has provoked the reactions of the opponents and the supporters of this historical trend (Taqwa, 2013).

Today, in Afghanistan, when people hear the words 'modern' or 'Islamic modernism', they usually pay attention to the appearance of a person, such as the style of dress, beard and even their way of eating food. If people are not aware of the meaning of 'modern' and 'modernism' and blindly imitate the so-called "modernism values," then modernist behavior will also lead to extremism (Kazimi, 2018). In countries where religion is involved in all aspects of society, especially in Islamic countries, phenomena, such as modernism are considered synonymous with western colonialism and westernizing society. Even backward governments and religious institutions have shown extremist behavior against modernism. Today, one justification for Islamist terrorist groups in Afghanistan and the Middle East is the discourse of modernism, which they all equate with westernism, blasphemy, cultural imperialism and Western thought. These misconceptions and misinterpretations of the discourse of modernism have led to obstacles to development and modernization in society (Kazimi, 2018).

Taqwallah Taqwa one scholar of the Islamic movement in Afghanistan argues no one should think of tradition and modernity as the opposite of each other, and that one eliminates and neutralizes the effects of the other. Because the result of this belief will not benefit the society. But we conclude that we can harmonize the traditional values with the characteristics of modernity and the requirements of today's conditions in such a way as to complement and enrich Islam and modernity and build a society based on the principles of Islamic values, participation, tolerance, and equality (Taqwa, 2013).

In Afghanistan, modernism has spent three periods alongside the ideologies of secularism, socialism, and liberalism. However, the process of modernization has faced countless twists and turns. Modernism in Afghanistan has gone through three periods.

1. The period of modernization in Afghanistan started with reforms under King Amanullah Khan (1919-1928) in the social, cultural, economic and political spheres. During this period, modernism moved in line with the ideology of secularism, led by King Amanullah Khan, Mahmoud Tarzi, and the intellectual class of the time, who called for reform and change in society. However, it did not take long for traditional Islamists to defeat modernist Amani ruler against British-backed modernism (Kazimi, 2018). The process of modernization began in Turkey under Ataturk, also in Iran, under Reza Shah, although soon after, in 1928, Amani's modernist government collapsed. In Iran modernism was stopped in 1979, because of the Islamic Revolution, but this trend continues in Turkey. Amanullah Khan's big mistake in implementing modernity values in Afghanistan was that he changed a very radical way and without the consideration of the culture and religious beliefs of the Afghan people. For example, in the traditional society of Afghanistan the appearance of a woman in European clothes without covering her hair and limbs was considered blasphemy. But Amanullah Khan's wife following his return from Europe wore European clothes and appeared in public without a hijab. His extremist and deliberate actions prevented him from implementing the actual reforms needed by the Afghan people and society.

2. The second period of modernization started from the beginning of Dawood Khan's (1953-1963) presidency until the fall of Dr. Najibullah's government (1987-1992). During this period, modernism was manifested as socialism. This was the most extreme period of modernization in Afghanistan. During this period, there was a serious attempt to modernize society in a very extremist way by importing former Soviet values and impose them on the people as values of modernity. The mistake of the modernists, especially the People's Democratic Party, was that they lacked experience in this area and relied too much on the power of the former Soviet Union, thinking that the Soviet Union was invincible, thus they took action to provoke a popular uprising against them, and the process they had undertaken failed. The other mistakes of this period include ignoring the customs, traditions, and beliefs of the people and insulting the religion of the people. These mistakes led to the failure of their reformist efforts and the fall of their regime (Zaery, 2011).

3. The third period of modernization in Afghanistan began after 9/11 with the overthrow of the Taliban regime and the establishment of a new government of Hamid Karzai (2001). This continues up to date. During this time, modernism entered with liberalism and secularism in the political, social, economic and cultural spheres of citizens, and promoted the recruitment of the educated, intellectuals, politicians, capitalists and the media. In this period modernism, secularism and liberalism in Afghanistan have the support of European and Western countries (Kazimi, 2018). An example of Islamic modernism values in this period can be seen in the new constitution of the country, as stated in the preamble, that this constitution will comply with the UN Charter and

concerning the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and to strengthen national unity and The territorial integrity of the country, to establish a system based on the will of the people and democracy, to create a society free of oppression, tyranny, discrimination and violence; based on the rule of law, social justice, protecting human dignity and the provision of fundamental freedoms and rights. Similarly, various other articles in this constitution refer to the principle of being Afghanistan an Islamic country and that no law can be contrary to Islam (Afghan Constitution 2004). The constitution passed with the mediation of Western countries, especially the United States, therefore it pays much attention to modern values. What is missing in this period is the lack of sufficient will of the government to implement the modernist values. Another phenomenon that is clear in this period is the division of most society into two poles. On the one hand, some are the people who entirely against modern values and reject anything new and count it Western, and there are educated people who want to see everything in the Western mirror and pay less attention to Islamic values. Of course, there is a third group, the religious modernists, who are in the minority and are often not supported by the government and the other two poles (Zaery, 2011).

Like other countries in Afghanistan, the Islamic modernism movement has its staunch opponents. Sometimes, even some scholars and writers opposed to Islamic modernism equate modernists with secularists and Orientalists. As Abdulwadwd Āref in his article considers Islamic modernism to be those who are neither aware of the Shari'a law nor of the general laws, and they are the puppets of Westerners and Orientalists. He also claims that Islamic modernists usually try to desecrate the sacred things of Islam, to deviate from the prophetic hadiths, to humiliate the Islamic heritage, to distort Muslim personalities, and to disregard the *Salaf 's* understanding of religion (Ārif, 2018).

Islamic Modernism in Afghanistan has failed to attract the attention of the people for several reasons: first, in Afghanistan, they are facing a very traditional society that their traditional views have mixed with their religious beliefs, the acceptance of Islamic modernism by such society is difficult. Another reason can be the lack of proper understanding of religious texts and Islamic sciences and the lack of an accurate definition from Islamic modernism.

Mohammad Moheq, one of the prominent Islamic modernists in Afghanistan, argues that religious modernization in Afghanistan has not yet fully started its activities because the ground for discussing and exchanging views on the values of Islamic modernization is not favorable. He adds that Islamic modernists do not seek religious innovation or gain of political power in Afghanistan but seek to meet the needs and requirements of the Muslim era. He also claims that Islamic modernists in Afghanistan attacked by two groups, religious extremists and those who have a closed interpretation of religion and secularists. Also, fundamentalists and extremists accuse Islamic modernism movements of religious innovation and atheism, and secularists accused him of reviving religious thought. However, the Islamic modernism movement has no problem with Islamic principles, but their focus is on the readings and the interpretations of Islam. One of the major goals of the movement is to say no to violence, killing, bloodshed, and extremism in Afghanistan (Islahat K. , 2016).

One of Afghanistan's leading newspapers, Subh-e Kabul, argues that one of the primary reasons that extremists have grown up and been given the opportunity to accuse anyone who is against their view of blasphemy is the lack of growth of religious modernism in Afghanistan. If the Islamic modernism movement grows in the country and criticizes and fight the thoughts of the extremists scientifically then the defeat of extremism is inevitable (Subh-e-Kabul, 2020).

Challenges Toward Islamic Modernism in Afghanistan

Afghanistan has faced many challenges in the modernization of the Islamic society after passing various periods of ideological governments, such as radical liberalism and secularism of King Amanullah Khan's kingdom, Dr. Najibullah's extremely anti-religious and socialist period, and the Taliban and Mujahideen's radical Islamism period. The challenges toward modernization of the country can be categorized as the following:

1. One of the major challenges that Islamic modernism faces in introducing Islamic modernism values is the growing trend of secularism in the country. A new generation that seems tired of the traditional way of practicing religion can be seen in the modern secular landscape. This movement toward secularism either slows down the Islamic modernism movement or destroys the sense of transition to Islamic modernism (Abdi, 2019).

2. A project looks at the process of Islamic modernism: The influx of foreign aids in the cultural, social, economic and political spheres, and the launch of various projects by the countries involved in the Afghan issue, after the fall of the Taliban regime, it has had some positive points and negative ones. For example, whenever there is talk of religious modernity, listeners and audiences in the public think that this may be a Western project to divert Muslims from Islam (Abdi, 2019).

3. The accusation of apostasy and other suspicions by Islamists to religious modernists: religious extremists often accuse religious modernists of apostasy and irreligion, because extremists believe that the real religion is what they believe in and all other kinds of thinking of Islam are un-Islamic. They use the weapon of apostasy to discredit religious modernists (Islahat, 2016).

4. Madrasas (Islamic Schools) outside the control of the Afghan government: these religious schools are often run by mullahs (ulama) who have graduated from Pakistani or Afghan Madrasas. These schools rarely have a single curriculum. Whoever owns and manages the school, builds the curriculum according to his or her wishes and beliefs. In most cases, the curriculums of madrasas are not in line with national interests and real religious values. The government, or any official body, does not intervene in the inspection and evaluation of madrasas. Some mullahs who manage and teach in madrasas don't know enough about Islam or have a very narrow understanding of Islam. They teach materials that lead students to extremism, fundamentalism, terrorism, and to fight any new phenomenon or resist any kind of religious modernity (Roy, 2002).

5. With the graduation of extremism and anti-modernist forces from madrasas and colleges in Pakistan, and Iran. For a long time, the majority of people who were interested in religious teachings would travel to Pakistan, Saudi Arabia, or Iran for studying Islam. Religious schools in these countries are often identified as preachers of extremism and terrorism in the region and the world. Therefore, the majority of those who graduate from the schools of the above countries and return to the country are those who have fundamentalist and extremist ideas. Consequently, they oppose any recent phenomenon in religion and reject it. With such extremist groups, it seems difficult to modernize Afghanistan's Islamic society (Fuller, 1991).

Lessons Afghan Islamic Modernist Can Learn from Indonesian Modernist

Many methods can be used for spreading Islamic modernism in a society. For example, Fazlurrahman, a famous Pakistani modernist scholar, claims that there are various approaches to Islamic modernism, such as silence, double-speaking and double-writing, reform through tradition, the partialist and link approach, the systematic interpretation

method and secularism (Rahman, 1970). Considering the methods of spreading Islamic modernism in a society mentioned above, the Islamic modernist scholars of Afghanistan need to implement the above methods by considering the cultural and social differences of the country. As has been shown in this paper, Indonesian Islamic modernist scholars have used the mentioned methods well and have had significant and positive results in Indonesian society.

Indonesian Islamic modernists and government can play a significant role in helping Afghanistan's modernist scholars to build a modern, pluralistic, friendly, and peaceful Islamic society where all religions, sects, ethnicities, and all political and ideological groups can live together. Indonesian modernist scholars, with the help of the Indonesian government, can assist the Afghan modernist with the following actions to spread   Islamic modernism in Afghanistan:

1. Provide educational scholarships for professors, students of Sharia law faculties and students and teachers of Madrasas of Afghanistan to come to Indonesia and learn Islam in how Indonesians learn and apply it in their life. These students will return to the country and will try to implement this model of *Wasatiyah* Islam in Afghanistan.

2. Holding short- and long-term seminars and workshops for the goal of spreading the values of Islamic modernism among scholars, ulama and politicians of Afghanistan by inviting them to come to Indonesia and see how a tolerant, pluralistic and peaceful country Indonesia is, and how they make a modern country with Islamic values.

3. Assist Afghanistan's Islamic modernists to create media organizations such as radio, television, newspapers and magazines that can help them broadcast and disseminate issues related to Islamic modernism in national and international languages. As mentioned in the article, Al-Munir magazine and other journals in Indonesia have played a significant role in promoting Islamic modernism in Indonesia, so these devices and instruments can play a good role in the spread of modernism in Afghanistan.

4. Cooperation in the publication of scientific articles in scientific journals of Afghanistan and Indonesia. The publication of articles by ulema and the Indonesian Academic Society in Afghanistan's scientific journals can expand the values of Islamic modernism for Afghan readers and will also lead to dialogue among elites on issues related to Islamic modernity. The publication of articles by Afghan scholars and the Afghan academic community in Indonesian magazines and journals will increase their capacity and they will learn alternative theories and new knowledge about research on Islamic modernism values.

5. Enabling the Indonesian embassy to be more active in Afghanistan in spreading Islamic modernist values by conducting workshops and seminars on Islamic modernism for religious, political, and academics of Afghanistan.

Afghan Islamic modernist scholars can learn the following lessons from their Indonesian counterparts:

1. Afghanistan's modernist scholars can learn that the spread of Islamic modernism is not a short-term process, but a long-term process that requires patience and perseverance. Ulema and activists in Islamic modernization in Afghanistan must work tirelessly to achieve this goal. As it is clear, Indonesian modernist scholars have worked decades to achieve this goal, but have not yet fully achieved it.

2. As discussed above, the modernist scholars of Indonesia used scientific methods to spread and generalize Islamic modernism in the country, such as the creation of scientific journals in which various articles about Islamic modernism were written. Undoubtedly, these magazines have played a significant role in generalizing and expanding Islamic modernity in Indonesia. Therefore, the Islamic modernist scholars of Afghanistan can use the above methods to convey their modernist ideas to people correctly and scientifically.

3. Afghan modernist scholars can learn from their counterparts in Indonesia to create schools, universities and Madrasas run by modernist scholars, like Abdullah Dahlan established schools and universities by establishing the "Muhammadiyah" organization, which played a significant role in promoting modernist ideas in Indonesia.

4. Afghan modernist scholars can learn from their counterparts in Indonesia that they must avoid extremism because extremism is reprehensible in everything and will not have excellent results. If Islamic modernists of Afghanistan take extreme measures and accuse those who oppose their views of petrification, backwardness, extremism and other misconceptions, their actions will not be welcomed by the people. Therefore, they must avoid any accusations or statements that could hinder their path to their goal, which is to have a modern Islamic society.

CONCLUSION

Indonesia is an exceptional country among Islamic countries with its moderate and *Wasatiya* Islam. By spreading the Indonesian culture of tolerance, moderation, and peacefulness, Indonesia can play a significant leading role in bringing peace, stability in Muslim countries. The modernization process is not a short-term process and free of challenges and problems. Indonesian modernists have been able to spread Islamic modernization by overcoming many problems and challenges. Of course, they used different strategies for spreading the message of Islamic modernism, such as establishing schools, universities, religious schools, publishing scientific articles on Islamic modernism issues in academic journals and newspapers; the creation of institutions and organization to help spread Islamic modernism. Indonesia and Afghanistan have much in common, as both countries are multi-religion, multi *madhab,* and multi-race. Given these similarities and the fact that Indonesia is more experienced in promoting the values of Islamic modernism; and is not involved in proxy wars in the region and the world, and that most Afghans consider it as a friend and unbiased country, it can serve as an excellent model for Islamic modernism movements of Afghanistan. Afghanistan's modern Muslim scholars and scientists can also use the methods Indonesian Islamic modernism movement used, to spread the values of Islamic modernism. Islamic modernism in Afghanistan has gone through various stages but has not yet found its place in Afghan society, and they faced to many challenges in spreading the values of Islamic modernism. Taking into account the challenges and opportunities, to have a modern, prosperous, pluralistic and inclusive society, Islamic modernists in Afghanistan need to work cautiously and learn from the experience of Indonesian Islamic modernism movements.

REFERENCES

'Abdal-Réziq, A. (2009). A Religion, Not a State. Salt Lake City, United States: University of Utah Press.

Abdi, R. (2019, May 11). Religion in a new style, opportunities and challenges. Retrieved from Kabul Morning daily: https://subhekabul.com/.

Abdullah, A. (2013). Studi Tentang Modernisme Indonesia. Jurnal Wawasan Keislaman, 17-19.

Abdullah, A. (2018). Origins of Islam in Indonesia. International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics, 1155-1159.

al-Qushairi, M. b. (n.d.). Saheh Muslim. Berut: Dar Ehiau al-turas al-arabi.

Amran. (2018, April 23). Karakteristik Islam Indonesia. Retrieved from unsulbarnews: http://www.unsulbarnews.com/terkini/karakteristik-islam-indonesia

Ārif, Ā. (2018, March 23). Emerging Mw'atilaḥs: From Religious Innovation to Crossing the Boundaries of Constants Sharia law regulation. Retrieved from Islah Online: https://www.eslahonline.net/2018/03/23/

Darajat, Z. (2015). Warisan Islam Nusantara. Buletin Al-Turas 21(1), 77-92.

Fathoni, R. S. (2011, March 23). Modernisme Islam di Indonesia Abad XIX-XX. Retrieved from Wawasan Sejarah: https://wawasansejarah.com/modernisme-islam-di-indonesia/

Fuller, G. E. (1991). Islamic Fundamentalism in Afghansitan. Rand National deffense research institute, 10-18.

Green, N. (2016). Afghanistan's Islam From Conversion to the Taliban. California: University of California Press.

Hafiz, M. A. (1997). Jmaludin Al Afghani wa Ishkaliyat al asur. Al-Majlisul ala le Saqafat.

Haris, A. (2006). The Role of Muslims in the Struggle Against Violent Extremist Ideology in Indonesia. Connections, Vol. 5, No. 4, 157-166.

Hasbullah, M. (2014). A Century of NU-Muhammadiyah in Indonesia. Islamika Indonesiana, 2.

Ilyas. (2020). Islam dan Kebangsaan: Pergumulan dalam BPUPKI, PPKI, dan Piagam Jakarta. Buletin Al-Turas, 26(1), 19-35.

Islahat. (2016, July 24). The door to religious modernity in Afghanistan. Retrieved from Islahat: https://www.islahat.org/.

Islahat, K. (2016, August 03). The door of Islamic Modernism must be opened. Retrieved from Islahat: https://www.islahat.org/

Jadah, M. I. (2010). Al-Ḥadathah. Mojalh Majma'a Al-FĪqh al-islami, 1892.

Jawedan. (2009, 6 3). Modernesm dar Afghanistan. Retrieved from Jawedan for freedom: https://jawedan.com/1388/3698/

Kazimi, S. A. (2018, october 16). 8 Am daily. Retrieved from 8 Am: https://8am.af/can-it-be-modern-without-the-west/

McDaniel, J. (2014). Indonesia, modernity and some problems of religious adaptation. wacana, 315-318.

Merriam-Webster. (2020, Jun 24). Merriam-Webster. US, United States

Morfit, M. (1981). Pancasila: The Indonesian State Ideology According to the New Order Government. University of California Press, at JSTOR, 838-850.

Mujiburrahman. (2019, August 6). State Policies on Religious Diversity in Indonesia. Researchgate, 102-107. Retrieved from Learn Religions: https://www.learnreligions.com/religion-in-indonesia-4588353

Munsaf. (2017, April 7). Tajdyd alfykr al Īslamy al-Muasir fī Indonisia Bi Ītymad ala NŪR Khalys Majyd. Twnys, Twnys, Twnys . Retrieved from Al Mominoun: https://www.mominoun.com/articles/

Nugraha, A. (2012). Moderate Islam as New Identity in Indonesian. JICSA, 12.

Owoyemi, M. Y. (2012). The Compatibility of Islam with Modernity: A Brief Discourse on Muslim. Researchgate, 318.

Oxford. (2020, Jun 24). Oxford Islamic studies online. Oxford, Oxford, England.

Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary. (2020, Jun 24). the Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary. Oxford, England: Oxford.

Population, W. (2020, January 1). Muslim Population By Country 2020. Retrieved from World Population Review: https://worldpopulationreview.com/country-rankings/muslim-population-by-country

Rachman, B. M. (1995). Pemikiran neo-Modernisme Islam Indonesia, dalam Ulumul Qur'an. Dalam Ulumul Quran, 26.

Rahman, F. (1970). Islamic Modernism: Its Scope, Method and Alternatives. International Journal of Middle East Studies, 1(4), 317-333. Retrieved June 25, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/162650. Jakarta, Indonesia

Roy, O. (2002). Islamic Radicalism in Afghanistan And Pakistan. UNHCR.

Salihi, A. (2018). The typology of religious currents in contemporary Herat. Stratigic studies of Afghanistan, 78.

Santosa, N. E. (2003). Ahmad Dahlan, Islam, dan Modernitas di Indonesia. Universitas Muhammadiyah Sidoarjo, 1-4.

Shafaqna. (2016, August 26). the Relationship between Religion and Modernity. Retrieved from Shafaqna: https://af.shafaqna.com/FA/152169

Sharif, M. (1999). Al-aslam wal-hdathh hal Yakwn ghda 'ealm 'erby. Cairo: Dar-Al-Shuruq.

Siddiqi, M. (1973). Islmic Modernism. Jstor, 179.

Subh-e-Kabul. (2020, October 12). The reason for the instability of the discourse of religious modernism in Afghanistan. Retrieved from Subh-e-Kabul: https://subhekabul.com/the-reason-for-the-instability-of-the-discourse-of-religious-modernism-in-afghanistan-part2/

Syabani, M. A. (2018). Islam Modernism movement in Indonesia. Journal of Social science Studies, 5-6.

Taḥa, Ā. (2006). Roḥ Ālḥadatha. Byrwt: Ālmarkaz thaqafy Āl-Āraby.

Tan, P. J. (2007). Navigating Turbulence Ocean: Indonesia's Worldview and Foreign Policy'. Asian Perspective, 3.

Taqwa, T. (2013, May 02). Afghan society in contrast to traditionalism and modernity. Retrieved from Khurasan Zamin: https://www.khorasanzameen.net/php/read.php?id=1771

Toledo, T. U. (2020, Jun 24). The University of Toledo website. Toledo, Ohio, USA.

Zaery, A. (2011, November 11). The Struggle between Tradition and Modernity in Afghanistan. Retrieved from Shabahang: http://zayeri.blogfa.com/post/93