

# jurnal scopus deni gender (1)-6.docx

*by* Ardiansyah Ahmad

---

**Submission date:** 23-Nov-2023 09:23PM (UTC-0800)

**Submission ID:** 2237264206

**File name:** jurnal\_scopus\_deni\_gender\_1\_-6.docx (102.58K)

**Word count:** 7515

**Character count:** 43425

## **CONTEMPLATION OF ABHAKALAN CULTURE (EARLY MARRIAGE) IN MADURA: A DIALOGUE OF CUSTOMARY LAW, RELIGION, AND THE STATE<sup>1</sup>**

**Deni Setiyawan<sup>1</sup>**

### **Abstrak**

Argumen dari penelitian ini, bahwa budaya Abhakalan madura cenderung kepada *dharran*. Berdampak pada ketidakadilan pihak perempuan dan mengabaikan nilai kesetaraan manusia. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode hukum empiris. Teori konflik, perubahan sosial, serta metodologi Islam, terutama *al-'urf*, *naf'an* serta *dharran*. Penelitian ini menemukan bahwa budaya Abhakalan Madura yang disyaratkan dalam sistem budaya bertujuan baik. Tapi, budaya Abhakalan Berdampak pada ketidakadilan pada pihak perempuan dan mengabaikan nilai kesetaraan antar manusia. Budaya pernikahan dini madura ada berbagai prosedur, yakni perijodohan yang dilakukan oleh orang tua. Kedudukan wanita pada pernikahan dini ialah orang yang ditunjuk, dipilih, serta dinikahi, dengan tidak berhak buat melakukan penolakan maupun pertimbangan. Hak wanita sedari lahir telah diarahkan sama orang tuanya, terlebih lagi pada dunia pendidikan wanita dipandang tak begitu penting. Maka mayoritas wanita tak berhak atas indenpendensi apapun. Stereotip warga wanita kedudukannya dibawah pria. Maka dibutuhkan reformasi budaya melalui advokasi tentang gender, perubahan

---

<sup>1</sup> Terimakasih kepada BPPT dan LPDP BPI (Beasiswa Pendidikan Indonesia) yang sudah menjadi penyandang dana/sponsor pada riset ini. Sehingga riset ini terlaksanan secara lancar baik dari segi pembiayaan dan motivasi dalam menyelesaikan

pola pikir dan pemberdayaan ekonomi keluarga yang juga sejalan dengan program pencegahan pernikahan dini di Indonesia.

**Kata Kunci:** Kontemplasi; Pernikahan Dini; Agama; Negara; adat

### **Abstract**

The argument of this study is that the Madurese Abhakalan culture tends to *dharran*. It has an impact on the injustice of women and ignores the value of human equality. This research uses empirical legal methods. Conflict theory, social change, and Islamic methodology, particularly *al-'urf*, *naq'an* and *dharran*. This research found that the Madurese Abhakalan culture required in the cultural system has good intentions. Nevertheless, the Abhakalan culture contributes to gender injustice and overlooks the importance of equality among individuals. Madurese early marriage culture has various procedures, namely arranged marriages conducted by parents. The woman's position in early marriage is that of a person who is appointed, chosen, and married, with no right to refuse or consider. The rights of woman from birth have been directed by their parents, especially in the world of education women are seen as not so important. Therefore, the majority of women are not entitled to any independence. The stereotype of the female citizen is lower than the male. Cultural reform is needed through gender advocacy, mindset change and family economic empowerment, which is also in line with Indonesia's early marriage prevention programme.

**Keywords:** Contemplation; Early Marriage; Religion; State; Customary

### **Introduction**

In Indonesia, the significance of marriage is deeply rooted in its rich tapestry of ethnicities and cultures. The sacred nature of marriage is enshrined in customary law, tightly woven into cultural practices and traditions. Each ethnic community in Indonesia adheres to distinct regulations, customs, and cultural norms, all aimed at ensuring that marriage is regarded as a societal, sacred, and revered ceremony (Salahuddin, 2005). This conceptualization is reflected in the customary marriage laws across Indonesia's diverse ethnic groups, encompassing spiritual elements tied to ancestral beliefs (local ethnic religions in Indonesia), social considerations, cultural festivities, and kinship systems (Sadat et al., 2023).

Social stratification forms social classes within society, often leading to injustice and triggering conflicts (Sumardi, L., & Hanum, 2019).

In the traditions of ethnic groups in Indonesia, the risk of violations in this area involves being excluded from the kinship system (Salahuddin, 2017).

In the indigenous population, marriage not only involves the husband and wife but also includes the family, both parents, and both parties to support the married life of the child towards a happy and lasting marriage. The culture of Abhakalan (early marriage) practiced by the Madurese community results in the infringement of women's independence to determine and choose their lives from an early age, as these women have been arranged for marriage since childhood.

The verses about gender equality (QS. al-Hujurat: 13) "Humanity, we created you from males and females and diversified you into the nations and tribes in order you may recognize one another. The most glorious among you, in the eyes of Allah, that the one who is the most righteous." The preceding passage explains the parity between women and men, encompassing both spiritual aspects, such as worship, and societal engagements, including matters related to professional careers. This verse entirely refutes the notion about the derogatory comparison between the two (Suhra, 2013).

Gender equality, known as gender equality, remains an interesting study to this day. With a long history of convincing the world that women have been discriminated against merely due to social and gender differences, In 1979, the UN or United Nation agreed a conference focusing on the eradicating all manifestations of the discrimination counter to women, as highlighted by Muhammad Taufik et al. (2022). The UN is dedicated to addressing issues related to equality in various domains such as education, the socialization of children, household responsibilities, gender-based violence, sexual health, and achieving a balance between work and family obligations (Fauzia, 2022). Although Indonesia ratified this conference in 1984 through Law No. 7/1984, effective socialization by the state has been lacking. According to Law Number 18 in 2014, It is asserted that every woman has the right to protection of basic rights and fair access to justice and well-being opportunities, which encompasses the right to receive adequate education. This law indicates that the government needs to protect women to ensure they have equal opportunities to men in achieving well-being (Azizah, 2019).

Previous studies on gender equality show evidence of gender equality between women and men, where ideally, they need to achieve a balance in education, political participation, and health to realize their full potential and rights. The equality of gender stands as a foundational principle within the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), sparking enduring transformations in patriarchal frameworks, as outlined by Dharani and Balamurugan (2023).

In reality, women encounter bias and discrimination across various domains, irrespective of their religious affiliations. Unfortunately, contemporary society still grapples with male dominance and chauvinism, as observed by Esquivel and Sweetman (2016). Women globally confront discrimination in both private and public spheres, whether through direct or indirect means, despite the widespread influence of modernity and globalization in human life. Despite these challenges, numerous efforts have been undertaken to address the issues affecting women globally, as noted by Unterhalter (2005).

Gender equality, a principle regulating equal treatment in marriage, manifests differently in Islamic practices compared to the customary systems of Indonesian ethnic groups. The clash and tension between Islamic law and customary law in the context of marriage in Indonesia are evident, as discussed by Hadigunawan et al. (2021).

Exploring Madurese culture through a focus on women reveals that the Madurese perceive women as individuals requiring supervision and protection, leading to early marriages (Yasak & Dewi, 2015). Additionally, gender roles within Madurese culture are evident in the art of batik making, where women engage in fabric painting while men handle the removal of wax from the fabric (Noer, 2012). Several research in the literature underscore how the roles, images, and positions of women are shaped by the broader cultural context, such as associating blue with men and pink with women (Hujatulu, 2015).

This forms the starting point for contemplating the patriarchal aspects of early Madurese marriage culture. Social changes, community mobility, education, socioeconomic status, and other factors play influential roles in shaping this ongoing dialogue (Taher, 2022).

In analyzing the contemplation of patriarchy in Madurese early marriage culture, there is a clarity case is the complexity and nuances that characterize this debate on the contemplation of patriarchy in Madurese early marriage culture. Many previous studies have discussed the Abhakalan culture of Madura Island, such as research by Anis Miswoni, where Abhakalan on Madura Island has become a hereditary culture that is continuously practiced to this day through various methods, namely matchmaking and manipulating the age of marriage (Miswoni, 2016). Ainur Mila Rofika and Iswari Hariastuti state that the age of child marriage is influenced by socio-cultural aspects. Social aspects that influence include the level of knowledge and education of children and parents, the economic situation of the family, and trust in religious figures or Kyai. Cultural aspects influencing child marriage include parental efforts in matchmaking, parental expectations to protect the lineage, the practice of magic, and the legal manipulation of age accepted by the community. Nikmah Suryandari and Irya Nur Holifah conducted a study on family communication as a strategy to deter early marriages in the village of *Pegantenan* in Madura. Within Pegantenan, three primary factors influencing early marriages are identified: cultural norms, economic conditions, and a limited awareness of reproductive health. Despite the generally elevated incidence of early marriages in Madura, certain communities within the Pegantenan village in Pamekasan, Madura, actively prevent early marriages by emphasizing and optimizing family communication (Suryandari & Holifah, 2022).

Iken Nafikadini states that Madurese women tend to feel forced, both when they are about to get married and after marriage. They feel pressured due to a high level of fear. They still cannot adapt to their status as wives, and their comfort and security are so low that they choose to continue living in their old environment (Nafikadini et al., 2021). Sudarso discusses the gender inequality circumstances faced by a lot of women in the Indonesian population, particularly in the coastal areas of East Java. The circumstances in this situation are intricately linked to the prevalence of a patriarchal culture as both a lifestyle and a set of ethical principles. Coastal women not only face cultural oppression stemming from the influence of patriarchal culture but also contend with structural challenges, as discussed by Sudarso et al. (2019). This research focuses on the contemplation of patriarchy in Madurese early marriage culture from the perspective of Islam.



To answer the research questions, the researcher uses an empirical legal method (Sadat et al., 2023). Data collected through literature reviews and in-depth interviews from scientific journals, articles, Islamic law books, and textbooks. Then, the data are analyzed by using a conflict theory approach, social changes, and Islamic methodology, particularly *al-'urf* (social tradition), *naf'an* (benefit), and *dharan* (harm).

## **Result and Discussion**

### **Gender Equality Concept**

The pursuit of gender equality can be traced back to the 17th century, gaining momentum after the Revolution of French in the year 1789. The term of 'equality' has its roots in the French word 'égalité' and has evolved into egalitarianism or equality, representing the "belief that the all individuals are equal, and deserve to gain similar opportunities and rights." at the latest of 18th century, the idea of gender equality gained prominence with the initial advocacy for women's rights in Western Europe. Figures like Olympe de Gouges, who advocated for the universal application of laws to both women and men, and Mary Wollstonecraft, the author of "A Vindication of the Rights of Women," played pivotal roles in shaping this concept (Stanton, 2020).

During the 21st century, global acknowledgment of the universal concept of gender equality was solidified through the efforts of intergovernmental organizations, particularly highlighted by the Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women in 1975, and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women or CEDAW in 1979 (Kurzman et al., 2019). While gender egalitarianism is not a novel idea, as elements of it are embedded in the Quran and the Prophet's Sunnah, the term itself may not be explicitly mentioned. Nevertheless, Islamic texts extensively discuss gender within a textual and contextual framework. The Quran and Sunnah acknowledge the relationship between women and men without explicitly using the term 'gender.' Instead, gender is given an abstract meaning, socially constructed between men and women, encompassing "roles, behaviors, activities, and characteristics considered appropriate by certain societies for women and men" (Ramli, 2012).

Various research differentiate between sex and gender, with the former utilized for comparing socio-cultural factors between women and men, while the latter pertains to comparing them based on biological anatomy. These terms are sometimes used interchangeably (Saiful et al., 2020). Conversely, Islam addresses gender as the coexistence of two equal partners, men and women, who complement each other. Despite disparities in biological and anatomical aspects, both genders are considered equal. Differences exist in natural identity, sexual urges, body delicacy, functions, reproductive implications, and hormones. Disparities in influencing others, responding to stimuli, levels of dependence, flexibility, willingness to surrender, concentration, and acceptance also prevail. These distinctions, however, do not establish the superiority of men due to masculinity or the inferiority of women due to femininity. In Islamic perspective, the term

of gender equality, which means "equal rights," is not universally agreed (Arafa & El-Ashry, 2017).

The concept of equality should not be confused with terms like sameness, similarity, or stereotypes. While Islam underscores the equality of all individuals, it acknowledges that they are not identical in terms of abilities, potentials, ambitions, wealth, and qualities. Therefore, the concept of gender equality is more easily understood as equity rather than sameness. The principles of gender equality, as highlighted in the Quran and various Hadiths of the Prophet, can be reached through economic, spiritual, and social aspects (Bayefsky, 2017).

Despite Islam being accused of gender bias and discrimination, especially by feminist groups, arguments often stem from misogynistic hadiths promoted by men in authority over religious narratives. For instance, Fatima Mernissi (1991) criticizes such narratives. Sisters in Islam (SIS) similarly question hadiths claimed to propagate gender bias. A misconception is that the differences between women and men in Islam constitute patriarchy. However, scholars argue that patriarchy is not inherently connected to Islam (A. Harris & Muhtar, 2019) and is instead a pre-Islamic tribal practice. The origins of patriarchal culture and the misogynistic practices are thought to trace back to other cultures, for instance Persia, Byzantium, and Greece but later became ingrained in the social practices of the Muslim community.

### **Gender Equality in Islamic Law.**

In Islam, there exists a belief in the absence of distinction between men and women, as both are considered to have equal rights, responsibilities, and roles. The Quran, conveying an egalitarian message, addresses various aspects that underscore the equality between women and men, besides to their overarching equality.

To begin with, the Quran asserts the equality of all individuals in the eyes of God, about gender, race, or skin color. It emphasizes that the diversity among humans is a manifestation of God's power and serves as a means for mutual understanding. Both women and men share the similar goal in life: to worship God and adhere to His commands. The Quran articulates that the only legitimate basis for distinguishing individuals is their piety and patience towards God. This sentiment is captured in the Quranic verse: "Humanity, we created you from males and females, and diversified you into nations and tribes in order you may recognize one another. Indeed, the most glorious among you, in the eyes of Allah, is the one who is the most righteous. Allah is indeed knowledgeable and well-acquainted" (Ta'a et al., 2018).

Several terms used in the Quran refer to all humans, encompassing both women and men, signifying the highest of equality level as human beings. The Quran contains over 830 instances of the word 'human' in various forms (Elshahat et al., 2019). Examples include the terms '*al-Ins*' (human) in surah (*al-Dhāriyāt*, 51: 56), '*khalīfah*' (vicegerent) in surah (*al-Baqarah*, 2: 30; *al-An'ām*, 6: 165), '*al-Insān*' (human) in surah (*al-Aḥzāb*, 33: 72; *al-Ḥijr*, 15: 26; *al-Raḥmān*, 55: 3; *al-Mu'minūn*, 23: 12), and the term '*al-Nās*' (people) in more than two hundred verses, all emphasizing the equality of all humans regardless



of gender. Furthermore, the Quran employs expressions such as '*al-Bashr*' and '*bani ādam*' when referring to humanity. (Solehah Yaacob & Baharuddin Yaacob, 2006).

### **Naf'an, Dharran, Islam, State, and the Culture of Early Marriage in Madura**

The examination of the introduction of Islam in Madura is intricately connected to the broader history of Islam in the Indonesian archipelago. Islam's presence in Madura is an integral part of the historical narrative of Islam in the archipelago, extending from historical times to the current era. The process of Islamization in the archipelago, facilitated through cultural conduits, has significantly contributed to the integration of Islam into various cultural foundations within the Indonesian population's diverse contexts (Asni, 2017). The Islamic law institutionalization has also allowed for the incorporation of various local wisdom values, serving as considerations in Islamic legal frameworks. Examining the relationship between the local wisdom values and the teachings of sacred texts requires methodologies that result in the development of Islamic approaches, notably through concepts such as *al-'urf* (social tradition), *naf'an* (benefit), and *dharran* (harm).

Long-standing cultural practices, when deemed beneficial in alignment with Islam, can be taken into account when formulating Islamic law. Acculturation, a concept that encapsulates the lengthy process of combining and sometimes surpassing both Islamic and local wisdom values, reflects the way communities, groups, and individuals's life and interact with their existing culture. Moreover, the emergence of resistance against new teachings should be understood as the part of people's attachment to various longstanding values (local wisdom). Simultaneously, it serves as a process of learning to comprehend recent values (Islam). In such scenarios, it is inappropriate to assert a sense of 'defeat' or 'victory' between Islam and local culture (Widiana, 2016). This aligns with the principle of "preserving the old that brings benefits and accommodating the new that is more beneficial."

This guiding principle promotes the Islamic research to adopt an approach that embraces the values of local wisdom alongside pure Islamic teachings. This principle has led to the emergence of the concept of "Islam Nusantara" within the context of Indonesia's varied and multi-religious community. Religion, state, and local cultures are considered as the sources of positive values that should be respected and not questioned or contested, as both are believed to encompass goodness. The archipelago's cultural and ethnic diversity has endowed Indonesia with a rich cultural tapestry, influencing the expression of Islam in the region.

Within this context, the Madurese ethnic group stands out as one of the largest ethnic groups in East Java (Kosim, 2012). Comprising Bangkalan Regency and Sumenep Regency, the Madurese people have, since ancient times, integrated the Sharia system (religion), state, and culture into a unified set of values observed during various stages of the marriage process (Atem, 2022). These value systems, rooted in religion, state, and culture, serve as guiding references in the implementation of marriage traditions among the Madurese.

Many research studies question the norms contained in Abhakalan culture in terms of conformity with religious and state norms, especially in Abhakalan culture (early marriage). In Abhakalan, there are various processes commonly undergone by the people, namely manipulating age and matchmaking traditions. In addition, the role of women is still considered unimportant until the education of female children is not taken into account. In Abhakalan, women are only selected, appointed, and married without the opinions and decisions of the women involved. Marriage is done according to the parents' will, and parents do not give any rights to their children, so all aspects decided by parents must be obeyed by their children.

Therefore, research on Abhakalan culture (early marriage) becomes important based on several considerations. *Naf'an* in Abhakalan culture (early marriage) is, first, a form of preserving the local wisdom of Madurese society and a form of preventing adultery. Second, in Islam, the limit of age for marriage is when they are *aqil* (mentally mature) and *baligh* (have reached puberty). A woman or man who has not reached the age of 19, yet they are mentally mature and has reached puberty, it is legally valid.

*Dharran* in Abhakalan culture (early marriage) is, first, the conflict of religious and state norms in the impact of the implementation of Abhakalan culture (early marriage). The conflict of religious norms from the aspect of *al-'urf* (social tradition) with consideration of *naf'an* (benefit) and *dharran* (harm). Second, the conflict of state norms regarding the limit of age for marriage in the law of marriage. The method to find answers to these norm conflicts is by using the Islamic methodology approach with *al-'urf* in terms of *naf'an* and *dharran*, referring to the Quran and hadiths as the main sources. This allows for arguing in formulating alternative approaches to find a common ground between the question of whether Abhakalan culture (early marriage) is still relevant to be maintained or abandoned.

The limits of tolerance and common ground between Islamic law, the state, and local wisdom are *naf'an* and *dharran*. In the view of Islamic law, if something causes more *naf'an* (harm) than *dharran* (benefit), it must be abandoned.

**Table 1: Interview Result about *dharran* Abhakalan culture.**

No	Name	Impact of <i>dharran</i>
1	Mr. Ali and Mrs. Siti	"The impact felt by Ali and Siti is the confusion in creating their child's birth certificate. When I wanted to go for Umrah, I needed a marriage certificate. At that time, our marriage was not official because we were still young" (Ali and Mrs. Siti, n.d.).
2	Mr. Narwi and Mrs. Roqiah	"The influence felt by Roqiah after marrying at an early age includes constant conflicts because Roqiah refuses to fulfill her duties as a homemaker, such as cooking, washing, cleaning the house, and performing various other tasks. They don't have a marriage certificate

		because the marriage was conducted in secret" (Narwi and Mrs. Roqiah, n.d.).
3	Mr. Kasem and Mrs. Nipah	"The impact felt by this couple after marriage is severe economic difficulty, forcing them to migrate to another city to seek a livelihood for the family. They have many children (eight children, consisting of five girls and three boys)" (Kasem and Mrs. Nipah, n.d.).
4	Mr. Matturi and Mrs. Aisyah	"The impact felt by the couple Aisyah and Matturi is only various conflicts caused by differences in opinions and having many children (12 children, but only eight are alive, including three girls and five boys)" (Matturi and Mrs. Aisyah, n.d.).

In the verse Al-An'ām [6]:17 Allah *Subhanahu wa Ta'ala* says:

قَدِيرٌ شَيْءٍ كُلِّ عَلَى فَهُوَ بِخَيْرٍ يَعْلَمُكُمْ وَإِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا لَهُ كَاشِفٌ فَلَا يَضُرُّ اللَّهَ يُمْسِكُكُمْ وَإِنْ

"If Allah imposes hardship upon you, no one can remove it except Him; and if He bestows good upon you, He is over all things competent." The word "*Bidhurri*" in that verse has a meaning "mudharat" which indicates that Allah can impose adversity that will not be removed except by Allah who removes it. The terminology "mudharat" encompasses everything that is distressing, painful, and frightening (Taqdim and Dalam Tafsir, "Dalam Al-Qur'an," n.d., 182–93). According to social tradition (*al-'urf*), the culture of Abhakalan (early marriage) can be interpreted as changeable, provided that the community reforms the Abhakalan culture and accepts social changes in accordance with norms (Suwito et al., 2023). In terms of Religion and State, As per the Marriage Law, the permissible age for marriage is set at 19 years for both men and women. It is advised against proceeding with marriage if an individual, whether male or female, falls below the stipulated legal age (Jasmaniar et al., 2021).

Local wisdom finds its relevance with Islam when the implementation of culture does not contradict various principles of Sharia. In this situation, the approach of local wisdom to the Abhakalan culture (early marriage) seeks to embrace human thought outcomes associated with worldly life, while the theological approach consistently aligns with the benefits in both the present life and the afterlife.

## Factors of Abhakalan Culture in Madura

### Traditional Factors (Culture)

Traditional factors are one of the core reasons why the Madurese people engage in early marriages. The people of Madura consider it normal for marriages to take place at a young age, even in childhood or adolescence. This practice has been carried out by grandmothers, great-grandmothers, mothers, and passed down to their grandchildren to

uphold the ancestral traditions that preceded them. The culture of marrying off children at an early age is deeply rooted, making it challenging to eradicate a tradition that has become part of Madurese culture. Some parents in Madura believe that girls should ideally get married shortly after their first menstruation, approximately between the ages of 12 to 15 (A. Mudjab, 2004).

Supami stated, "If the age limit has been exceeded, and marriage has not been carried out, neighbors will mock using words like 'tak paju lakeh' (unmarriageable woman). Certainly, some parents will feel ashamed if their child does not get married. Abhakalan is one of the cultural aspects preserved by the Madurese people, and by marrying off their children, it means they have preserved the cultural customs of their environment and respect the values of local traditions" (Suparmi, n.d.).

Therefore, some parents immediately arrange the marriage of their children at a young age, fearing the negative opinions about their unmarried children that are deeply rooted in the lives of the Madurese people until now. Even individuals categorized as late for marriage, above the age of 20, will be a subject of discussion among the local residents, and it can be considered a disgrace to their family. It is not uncommon for some parents to feel ashamed if their matured children have not found a partner because they view it as something that significantly lowers the parents' status in comparison to other community members—a situation where their children enter adulthood but have not yet married.

The people of Madura remain very strong in implementing customs to carry out religious teachings, so customs that have grown strongly in the community become a dominant motivation for life. Similarly, in conducting marriages, traditional and cultural elements still play in a significant role, both in regulating the timing of marriage and in carrying out the marriage itself. Abhakalan in Madura occurs through customary and cultural processes that have been established over generations. In this situation, parents have the right to determine a suitable match for their children.

### **Educational Factors**

The lack of parental education significantly influences their behavior, pushing them to hastily arrange marriages for their children. The majority of parents believe that girls do not need to pursue education to the highest level because they will eventually work only as homemakers whose space is limited to the kitchen, bed, and well expressing the sentiment of grandparents when advising their grandchildren who will continue their education to higher levels. This perspective fails to recognize that a low level of education for individuals can foster simple thought patterns, leading them to neglect contemplating the future for marriage. If a child discontinues schooling, parents hurriedly arrange marriages for them.

Mr. Sya'I provides an opinion that ideally, marriage should take place between the ages of 20 to 25. Based on his viewpoint, individuals are considered ready for marriage at this age, especially as they have completed their high school education. Furthermore, the age limit set by the law is deemed insufficient because typically, the

ages of 16 to 19 are when children have just completed junior high school education, where their thinking is still relatively unstable and unprepared for the challenges and issues that come with family life.

*"I don't have a problem with marriages conducted by young people before they reach 19 years old age, as stipulated by the law. However, if someone chooses to do so, I won't intervene. It's their right along with their families. Moreover, there is no prohibition in Islam, so if both families agree to the marriage of their children, why not? But personally, I won't give permission for my child to get married at a young age. I will marry my son and daughter when they have successfully completed their bachelor's education. I, along with my wife, got married when we were in the second year of junior high school. I hope that my children will complete their education up to university"* (Syafi'i, n.d.).

According to Mr. Syafi'i, Abhakalan (early marriage) is often practiced by those who have graduated from junior high school. For them, marriage is an alternative way to continue their lives. After marriage, they typically migrate to seek livelihoods outside of Madura, whether as construction workers, satay vendors, or in other jobs, to meet their family's needs.

Education, undoubtedly, is a significant factor that profoundly influences the way of life of a population. The higher the level of education an individual attains, the higher their status and dignity within the community.

**Table 2: Findings regarding the early marriages and the low of educational attainment in Madura.**

No	Researcher (Year)	Research Location	Findings
1	Fawaid, Hadi (2015)	Bangkes village, Kadur Subdistrici, Pamekasan Regency	"A notable factor contributing to early marriages is the limited educational attainment. The degree of education plays a substantial role in shaping individual behaviors and thought processes, influencing attitudes and decision-making. Insufficient education levels in individuals tend to foster simplistic thought patterns, hindering them from considering the long-term implications of marriage (Fawaid, F., & Hadi, 2015).
2	Mahfudin, (2016)	Waqi'ah Village of Dapenda, Batang-Batang Subdistrict, Sumenep Regency	"The Village of Dapenda exhibits a generally modest educational level, with no individuals observed pursuing higher education. The early onset of marriage is identified as a contributing



---

			factor to restricted educational opportunities. Economic constraints within families are a primary reason for the inadequate level of education, as insufficient financial resources pose a barrier to furthering one's educational pursuits (Mahfudin, A. & Wa'qiah, 2016).
3	Susilo (2017)	Brata Tinggi Village, Tlanakan Subdistrict, Pamekasan Regency	"The findings of the research indicate that the research village is characterized by a high rate of school dropouts and a low level of education among its residents. The majority of the subjects engage in farming, utilizing a profit-sharing arrangement as they cultivate on land owned by others (Susilo, 2017).

---

### **Parental Factor (Arranged Marriage)**

In rural communities, a culture that almost robs a girl of the freedom to choose her husband is still enforced. Generally, the child is chosen to marry someone the parents like, and due to the circumstances in the community where the girl was raised, she is not allowed to resist the wishes of her parents or guardians. Marriages of this kind often occur and can lead to disappointment for the child regarding their parents' decisions.

In Madura, arranged marriages are one of the causes of early marriages (Abhakalan). Parents often want their children to marry their relatives or friends, to maintain family ties (business and so on). Moreover, there are cases where a child who has just been born is already promised to a relative or friend to be matched with their child in the future. There is even a practice called "nikah ngodeh," where marriages are predestined, and the arrangement is determined by the birth of the baby. So, if there are two babies, a girl and a boy, born at the same time, the parents of the baby boy will immediately propose to the parents of the baby girl to be their future in-law.

The impact of patriarchal culture demands that children always obey their parents' decisions, especially the father. If the child goes against their fate, they are considered unlucky. For example, if the child is already an adult and has feelings for someone else, it means that they do not like their intended partner or the choice made by their parents. Typically, parents seek the help of religious figures to seek assistance or perform rituals to pray for their child to accept the chosen partner. To prevent such situations, parents must quickly arrange marriages for their children, as young adults are more easily influenced.

### **Economic Factor**

Both low and high rates of early marriage are influenced by the economic capabilities of families, especially parents. Therefore, it is not surprising that early marriages are commonly found in various rural areas that are economically disadvantaged. As a result, most parents advise and support their children to get married early, even if they are not yet of a sufficient age. Families living below the poverty line often pressure parents to quickly arrange marriages for their children to ease the financial burden.

If they do not arrange marriages, parents may be unable to afford their children's education due to a lack of funding. Therefore, when a man, whether young or old, comes to propose to a girl, most parents immediately accept the proposal and set a date for the wedding. Families living in poverty experience additional pressure, prompting them to marry off their daughters to men or families perceived as financially stable. Public opinion, especially among parents, has begun to change over time.

As we understand, early marriage has implications for the future sustainability of family life. The impacts of early marriage are classified into two parts: positive effects that support marital continuity and negative effects, which are the adverse consequences resulting from such early marriages.

### **Impact of the Abhakalan (early marriage) Culture in Madura**

In this research, based on interviews with informants who have practiced Abhakalan, the perceived consequences for couples engaging in early marriage are as follows:

1. Persistent conflicts arising from unfair distribution of responsibilities.
2. Neglect of financial responsibilities by husbands and wives becoming housewives.
3. Early pregnancies and miscarriages.
4. Unhealthy polygamy (polygamy without the first wife's consent and conducted secretly).
5. Having many children, as it is believed that more children bring more blessings.
6. Economic difficulties for couples practicing Abhakalan, often living with parents or in-laws and experiencing financial shortages (Mbah Mahhot and Mbah Nasurah, n.d.).

### **Cultural Reform of Abhakalan in Madura**

We often encounter behaviors of people that are not in line with the regulations set by the government. One example is the common practice in Madura of marrying off their children at a young age. Although this practice does not necessarily conflict with Islamic teachings, as Abhakalan is allowed, the lack of formal registration with the Religious Affairs Office (KUA) is considered a negative cultural habit that has become commonplace and a new tradition. According to Islamic teachings, a secret marriage is valid, but from the legal perspective of the state, it is not recognized without official

registration at the KUA. A legal marriage under the law is one that is valid according to religious principles and is officially registered with the KUA (Maknun et al., 2022).

A social change approach acts as a tool to reform the local wisdom of the Abhakalan culture that has been passed down through generations in Madura. This approach aims to change the local wisdom of the Abhakalan culture, which is not in line with national and religious norms in marriage. The social change approach involves various activities, including:

### **Advocacy on Gender**

Reforming the Abhakalan culture in Madura can be done by providing gender advocacy to parents. This activity aims to provide knowledge and understanding of gender to parents who are mostly bound by the culture of arranging marriages for their children without considering the children's wishes (Murni et al., 2022). This activity can be carried out by the local government by enacting Regional Regulations on gender advocacy, with implementation carried out by the KUA in each sub-district and assisted by traditional leaders (Kyai) (Faridi, 2021). When gender advocacy becomes a program in Madura society, the changing mindset of the community about the Abhakalan culture in Madura will gradually disappear. This is because there will be a change in views and attitudes towards the implementation of the Abhakalan culture in Madura.

### **Changing Mindsets**

Changing the mindset of the community is a crucial tool in the social change of Madura society in viewing the Abhakalan culture. This change is not separate from the understanding of Madura society about gender equality and economic empowerment within the family. With increasing knowledge about the benefits and harms of the Abhakalan culture, they will consider whether to continue this cultural practice. Eventually, social change regarding this culture will naturally disappear from Madura society.

### **Family Economic Empowerment**

Certainly, in the reform of the Abhakalan culture in Madura, the community's understanding of how to manage family finances well is also required (Asman, 2021). This is similar to the gender advocacy program. If the local government includes family economic empowerment activities as one of the programs in the enactment of Regional Regulations, this program will undoubtedly change the mindset of Madura society towards the Abhakalan culture. Eventually, the Abhakalan culture in Madura will naturally disappear, as per social change theory.

## Conclusion

This research concludes that the Abhakalan culture (early marriage) has values of *naf'an* (benefits) and *dharran* (harms/mudharat) in the following categories: first, as a form of preserving the local wisdom of Madura society and as a means of preventing adultery. Second, in Islam, the marriage age limit for women and men is when they are *aqil* (mentally mature) and *baligh* (have reached puberty). A woman or man who is under 19 years old but is mentally mature and has reached puberty is considered legally valid.

The value of *Dharran* in the Abhakalan culture (early marriage) is, first, there is a conflict between religious and state norms in the implementation of the Abhakalan culture (early marriage). This results in injustice towards women and neglects the value of equality among humans. In Madura's early marriage culture, various processes are found, including arranged marriages conducted by parents. The position of women in early marriage is to be individuals who are appointed, chosen, and married without the right to reject or consider. (Pribadi, 2020) Women have been focused on by their parents, especially in the field of education, which is considered less important. As a result, the majority of women have no independence. The societal stereotype places women beneath men. (Ridwan, 2018) The Abhakalan culture (early marriage) also clashes with the Marriage Law about the marriage age limit.

Considering the values of *naf'an* and *dharran* in Madura's Abhakalan culture, there are more values of *dharran* than *naf'an*. In Islamic law, as outlined in the Quran and Sunnah, the prevention of harm takes precedence when it arises. Therefore, cultural reform of Madura's Abhakalan is needed through several programs: gender advocacy, changing mindsets, and economic empowerment of Madura society. The concept of the next research will evaluate the cultural reform from this study.

## References

- a. Harris, K. M., & Muhtar, A. (2019). Konsep Kesetaraan Gender Menurut Perspektif Islam Dan Barat. *Jurnal Akidah & Pemikiran Islam*, 21(2), 33–74. <https://doi.org/10.22452/Afkar.Vol21no2.2>
- A. Mudjab. (2004). *Menikahlah Engkau Menjadi Kaya*. Mitra Pustaka.
- Ali Dan Ibu Siti. (N.D.). *Wawancara Warga Madura Bangkalan*.
- Arafa, M., & El-Ashry, A. (2017). Gender Equality In The Arab And Muslim World. In *Gender Equality In A Global Perspective* (Pp. 54–76). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315639505-3>
- Asman, A. (2021). Dinamika Usia Dewasa Dan Relevansinya Terhadap Batas Usia Perkawinan Di Indonesia: Perspektif Yuridis-Normatif. *Jil: Journal Of Islamic Law*, 2(1), 119–138. <https://doi.org/10.24260/Jil.V2i1.66>

- 25 Asni. (2017). Kearifan Lokal Dan Hukum Islam Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Al-Adl*, 10(2), 54–69. [Http://Ejournal.Iainkendari.Ac.Id/Al-Adl/Article/View/699](http://Ejournal.Iainkendari.Ac.Id/Al-Adl/Article/View/699)
- 15 Atem. (2022). Konflik Etnik Madura Dan Melayu Sambas: Tinjauan Konflik Kekerasan Johan Galtung. *Journal Ilmu Sosial, Politik Dan Pemerintahan*, 11(2), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.37304/Jispar.V11i2.5304>
- 7 Azizah, N. (2019). Peran European Women's Transnational Advocacy Networks (Tans) Dalam Mengkonstruksi Regime Kesetaraan Gender Di Uni Eropa. *Indonesian Journal Of International Relations*, 3(1), 52–79. <https://doi.org/10.32787/Ijir.V3i1.87>
- 13 Bayefsky, A. F. (2017). The Principle Of Equality Or non-Discrimination In International Law. In *Equality And Non-Discrimination Under International Law* (Pp. 71–104). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315094410-6>
- 2 Dharani, M. K., & Balamurugan, J. (2023). *Single Mothers ' Perspectives On Social Welfare Programs For Women In Tamil Nadu*. 1–17.
- 24 Esquivel, V., & Sweetman, C. (2016). Gender And The Sustainable Development Goals. *Gender & Development*, 24(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13552074.2016.1153318>
- 26 Faridi, M. (2021). Etnolinguistik Falsafah Hidup Masyarakat Madura. *Halimi: Journal Of Education*, 1(2), 106–118. [Http://Ejournal.Kopertais4.Or.Id/Madura/Index.Php/Halimi/Article/View/5167](http://Ejournal.Kopertais4.Or.Id/Madura/Index.Php/Halimi/Article/View/5167)
- 37 Fauzia, R. (2022). Sejarah Perjuangan Perempuan Indonesia Mengupayakan Kesetaraan Dalam Teori Feminisme. *Journal Of Comprehensive Science*, 1(4), 861–881.
- 19 Fawaid, F., & Hadi, M. H. A. (2015). Pelaksanaan Nikah Ngodheh (Studi Komparasi Hukum Islam Dengan Hukum Adat) Di Desa Bangkes Kecamatan Kadur Kabupaten Pamekasan Madura. *Pangung Hukum*, 1(2), 217–247.
- 40 Hadigunawan, N., Saidon, R., Razali, M., & ... (2021). Kafaah: Impak Perbezaan Sosial Terhadap Kesejahteraan Rumah Tangga: Kafaah: Impact Of Social Differences On Household Welfare. *Journal Of Fatwa ...*, 26(2), 311–322.



- 44  
<https://jfatwa.usim.edu.my/index.php/jfatwa/article/view/424>
- 1  
 Hasan, M. M. (2012). Feminism As Islamophobia: A Review Of Misogyny Charges Against Islam. *Intellectual Discourse*, 20(1), 55–78.
- 29  
 Hujatulu, J. (2015). Analisis Peran Perempuan Dalam Pertanian Di Kecamatan Rasau Jaya Kabupaten Kuburaya. *Jurnal Social Economic Of Agriculture*, 4(April), 5–24.
- 16  
 Jasmaniar, Muhdar, & Zulkifli, M. (2021). Batas Usia Kawin Dalam Kaitannya Dengan Permohonan Dispensasi Kawin Di Pengadilan Agama. *Indonesia Journal Of Criminal Law*, 3(2), 17–23.
- 3  
 Kasem Dan Ibu Nipah. (N.D.). Wawancara Warga Madura Bangkalan.
- 3  
 Kosim, M. (2012). Kyai Dan Blater (Elite Lokal Dalam Masyarakat Madura). *Karsa: The Journal Of Social And Islamic Culture*, 12(2), 149–160.
- 8  
 Kurzman, C., Dong, W., Gorman, B., Hwang, K., Ryberg, R., & Zaidi, B. (2019). Women's Assessments Of Gender Equality. *Socius: Sociological Research For A Dynamic World*, 5, 237802311987238. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2378023119872387>
- 28  
 Mahfudin, A. & Wa'qiah, K. (2016). Pernikahan Dini Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Keluarga Di Kabupaten Sumenep Jawa Timur. *Jurnal Hukum Keluarga Islam*, 1(1), 33–49.
- 20  
 Maknun, M. L., Nugroho, M. A., & Libriyanti, Y. (2022). Kontribusi Ulama Nusantara Terhadap Keilmuan Islam Di Indonesia; Studi Kasus Inventarisasi Manuskrip Ponpes Tremas Dan Tebuireng. *Muslim Heritage*, 7(1), 111–140. <https://doi.org/10.21154/muslimheritage.v7i1.3625>
- Matturi Dan Ibu Aisyah. (N.D.). Wawancara Warga Madura Pamekasaan.
- 23  
 Mbah Mahhot Dan Mbah Nasurah. (N.D.). Wawancara Pribadi (Salah Satu Orang Tua Yang Melakukan Perjudohan Terhadap Anaknya Saat Masih Dalam Kandungan Sekaligus Pelaku Pernikahan Sia Muda), Madura.
- 35  
 Miswoni, A. (2016). Stereotip Kesetaraan Gender Terhadap Budaya Pernikahan Dini Pada Masyarakat Madura. *Jurnal Pamator*, 9(1), 15–

18.

17 Muhammad Taufik, Suhartina, S., & Hasnani, H. (2022). Persepsi Masyarakat Terhadap Kesetaraan Gender Dalam Keluarga. *Sosiologia: Jurnal Agama Dan Masyarakat*, 1(1), 51–66. <https://doi.org/10.35905/Sosiologia.V1i1.3396>

10 Murni, L., Hz, E. D., & Diana, L. (2022). Penerapan Ilo Convention Nomor 111 Ke Dalam Undang-Undang Ketenagakerjaan Di Indonesia. *Pattimura Legal Journal*, 1(3), 189–200. <https://doi.org/10.47268/Pela.V1i3.6664>

41 Nafikadini, I., Insani, D. A., & Luthviatin, N. (2021). *Bagaimanakah Kesehatan Mental Remaja Etnis*. 5(1), 45–55.

Narwi Dan Ibu Roqiah. (N.D.). *Wawancara Warga Madura Pamekasan*.

31 No, V., Setiyawan, D., & Rahmad, N. (2022). *Amnesti : Jurnal Hukum Jkp Concept In Minister Of Labor Regulations Number 4 Of 2022 In Ilo Perspective And Justice In Law*. 4(2), 144–155.

12 Noer, K. U. (2012). Land, Marriage And Social Exclusion: The Case Of Madurese Exile Widow. *Procedia - Social And Behavioral Sciences*, 65, 180–185. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Sbspro.2012.11.108>

5 Pribadi, Y. (2020). Islam Madura: Sebuah Studi Konstruktivisme-Strukturalis Tentang Relasi Islam Pesantren Dan Islam Kampung Di Sumenep Madura, By Mohammad Hefni. *Bijdragen Tot De Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde / Journal Of The Humanities And Social Sciences Of Southeast Asia*, 176(2–3), 429–431. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-17602009>

38 Ramli, M. A. (2012). Analisis Gender Dalam Hukum Islam. *Jurnal Fiqh*, 9(1), 137–162. <https://doi.org/10.22452/Fiqh.Vol9no1.7>

32 Ridwan, M. (2018). *Isce Journal Of Innovative Studies On Character And Education Literature Syi'ir Madura As A Legenskap Of Strengthening Characters In Elementary School*. 2(2), 332–339.

39 Sadat, A., Nur, M. T., Sadik, M., & Baharuddin, A. Z. (2023). Determination Of Auspicious Days In Wedding Traditions In Mandar, West Sulawesi: Perspective Of Islamic Law. *Samarah*, 7(3), 1422–1446. <https://doi.org/10.22373/Sjhg.V7i3.17864>

21 Saiful, T., Yaswirman, Yuslim, & Fendri, A. (2020). *Gender Equality*

*Perspective And Women Position In Islam*. 413(Icolgis 2019), 197–200. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200306.212>

4 Salahuddin, M. (2005). Mahkamah Syar'iyah Di Kesultanan Bima: Wujud Dialektika Hukum Antara Islam Dan Adat. *Ulumuna*, 9(1), 189. <https://doi.org/10.20414/Ujis.V9i1.451>

4 Salahuddin, M. (2017). Menuju Hukum Islam Yang Inklusif-Humanistik: Analisis Pemikiran Jasser Auda Tentang Maqāṣid Al- Sharī'Ah. *Ulumuna*, 16(1), 103–124. <https://doi.org/10.20414/Ujis.V16i1.191>

1 Solehah Yaacob & Baharuddin Yaacob. (2006). Penjelasan Al-Quran Tentang “Manusia” Kajian Tatabahasa Arab Dan Pentafsiran Terhadap Ayat-Ayat Yang Dipilih. *International Conference In Peradaban Melayu*, 139–166.

Stanton, M. E. (2020). Paradoxical Feminism: Attempts At Gender Equality In The French Revolution. *Young Historians Conference*, 1–22. <https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/YoungHistorians/2020/Papers/3/>

18 Sudarso, Keban, P. E., & Mas'udah, S. (2019). Gender, Religion And Patriarchy: The Educational Discrimination Of Coastal Madurese Women, East Java. *Journal Of International Women's Studies*, 20(9), 1–12.

34 Suhra, S. (2013). Kesetaraan Gender Dalam Perspektif Al-Qur'an Dan Implikasinya Terhadap Hukum Islam. *Jurnal al-Ulum*, 13(2), 373–394.

2 Sumardi, L., & Hanum, F. (2019). Social Mobility And New Form Of Social Stratification: Study In Sasak Tribe, Indonesia. *International Journal Of Scientific And Technology Research*, 8(10), 708–712.

Suparmi. (N.D.). *Wawancara Warga Bangkalan*.

3 Suryandari, N., & Holifah, I. N. (2022). Family Communication As A Prevention Effort Early Marriage In Pegantenan Village, Madura. *Nyimak: Journal Of Communication*, 6(1), 41. <https://doi.org/10.31000/Nyimak.V5i2.5069>

30 Susilo, S. (2017). Makna Pernikahan Dini Bagi Orang Tua Masyarakat Pengemis Di Dusun Pelangaran, Brata Tinggi, Kecamatan Tlanakan, Kabupaten Pamekasan, Madura. *Universitas Negeri Medan*, 68–75.

- <sup>2</sup> Suwito, Setiyawan, D., Muhtar, M. H., & Ahmad. (2023). Contemplating The Morality Of Law Enforcement In Indonesia. *Journal Of Law And Sustainable Development*, 11(10), E1261. <https://doi.org/10.55908/Sdgs.V11i10.1261>
- <sup>1</sup> Syafi'i. (N.D.). *Wawancara Guru Sma Di Madura*.
- <sup>1</sup> Ta'a, A., Abed, Q. A., & Ahmad, M. (2018). Al-Quran Ontology Based On Knowledge Themes. *Journal Of Fundamental And Applied Sciences*, 9(5s), 800. <https://doi.org/10.4314/Jfas.V9i5s.57>
- <sup>22</sup> Taher, S. L. (2022). Hubungan Antara Budaya, Pengetahuan Dan Sosial Ekonomi Dengan Pernikahan Dini. *Indonesia Journal Of Midwifery Sciences*, 1(3), 100–110. <https://doi.org/10.53801/Ijms.V1i3.46>
- Taqdim, K., & Tafsir, D. (N.D.). *Dalam Al-Qur ' An*. 182–193.
- <sup>27</sup> Unterhalter, E. (2005). Global Inequality, Capabilities, Social Justice: The Millennium Development Goal For Gender Equality In Education 25, 111-112. *International Journal Of Educational Development*, 25(6), 111–118.
- <sup>14</sup> Widiana, N. (2016). Pergumulan Islam Dengan Budaya Lokal Studi Kasus Masyarakat Samin Di Dusun Jepang Bojonegoro. *Jurnal Theologia*, 26(2), 198–215. <https://doi.org/10.21580/Teo.2015.26.2.428>
- <sup>36</sup> Yasak, E. M., & Dewi, S. I. (2015). *Budaya Pernikahan Dini Terhadap Kesenjangan Gender Masyarakat Madura*. 4(3), 426–431.

### Affiliation and Email

<sup>1</sup> Muhammadiyah University Gombong of Kebumen

Email: <sup>1</sup> [denisetyawan@unimugo.ac.id](mailto:denisetyawan@unimugo.ac.id)

# jurnal scopus deni gender (1)-6.docx

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

19%

SIMILARITY INDEX

19%

INTERNET SOURCES

8%

PUBLICATIONS

12%

STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

1

[oarep.usim.edu.my](http://oarep.usim.edu.my)

Internet Source

3%

2

[ojs.journalsdg.org](http://ojs.journalsdg.org)

Internet Source

1%

3

[journal.uinjkt.ac.id](http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id)

Internet Source

1%

4

[mail.ulumuna.or.id](http://mail.ulumuna.or.id)

Internet Source

1%

5

[resiprokal.unram.ac.id](http://resiprokal.unram.ac.id)

Internet Source

1%

6

[repository.stainmajene.ac.id](http://repository.stainmajene.ac.id)

Internet Source

1%

7

[journal.aihii.or.id](http://journal.aihii.or.id)

Internet Source

<1%

8

Submitted to Emmanuel College

Student Paper

<1%

9

[ejournal.unitomo.ac.id](http://ejournal.unitomo.ac.id)

Internet Source

<1%

10

[ojs3.unpatti.ac.id](http://ojs3.unpatti.ac.id)

Internet Source

<1%



11	<a href="http://pusdiklattekniskemenag.e-journal.id">pusdiklattekniskemenag.e-journal.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
12	<a href="http://ouci.dntb.gov.ua">ouci.dntb.gov.ua</a> Internet Source	<1 %
13	Submitted to Monash University Student Paper	<1 %
14	<a href="http://jurnalalqalam.or.id">jurnalalqalam.or.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
15	<a href="http://e-journal.upr.ac.id">e-journal.upr.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
16	<a href="http://ejournal.uin-malang.ac.id">ejournal.uin-malang.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
17	<a href="http://ejurnal.iainpare.ac.id">ejurnal.iainpare.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
18	<a href="http://journal.unipdu.ac.id:8080">journal.unipdu.ac.id:8080</a> Internet Source	<1 %
19	<a href="http://repository.unair.ac.id">repository.unair.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
20	<a href="http://journal.uinsgd.ac.id">journal.uinsgd.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
21	<a href="http://jnus.lakpesdamsalatiga.or.id">jnus.lakpesdamsalatiga.or.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
22	<a href="http://publikasi.ildikti10.id">publikasi.ildikti10.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
23	<a href="http://repository.uinjkt.ac.id">repository.uinjkt.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %

24	<a href="http://core.ac.uk">core.ac.uk</a> Internet Source	<1 %
25	<a href="http://media.neliti.com">media.neliti.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
26	Submitted to Universitas Negeri Surabaya The State University of Surabaya Student Paper	<1 %
27	<a href="http://sro.sussex.ac.uk">sro.sussex.ac.uk</a> Internet Source	<1 %
28	Submitted to Westminster International University in Tashkent Student Paper	<1 %
29	<a href="http://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id">ejournal.undiksha.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
30	<a href="http://journal.iainlangsa.ac.id">journal.iainlangsa.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
31	<a href="http://jurnal.umpwr.ac.id">jurnal.umpwr.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
32	<a href="http://www.iscjournal.com">www.iscjournal.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
33	<a href="http://etheses.uin-malang.ac.id">etheses.uin-malang.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
34	<a href="http://kafaah.org">kafaah.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
35	<a href="http://proceeding.unmuhjember.ac.id">proceeding.unmuhjember.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %

36	<a href="http://www.scribd.com">www.scribd.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
37	<a href="http://www.ejournalwiraraja.com">www.ejournalwiraraja.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
38	<a href="http://fiqh.um.edu.my">fiqh.um.edu.my</a> Internet Source	<1 %
39	<a href="http://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id">jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
40	<a href="http://www.semanticscholar.org">www.semanticscholar.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
41	<a href="http://ojs.unik-kediri.ac.id">ojs.unik-kediri.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
42	<a href="http://e-journal.iainptk.ac.id">e-journal.iainptk.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
43	Goodhart, Michael. "Human Rights: Politics and Practice", Human Rights: Politics and Practice, 2016 Publication	<1 %
44	<a href="http://hrmars.com">hrmars.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
45	<a href="http://jurnal.iainponorogo.ac.id">jurnal.iainponorogo.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %