STUDIA ISLAMIKA (ISSN 0215-0492; E-ISSN: 2355-6145) is an international journal published by the Center for the Study of Islam and Society (PPIM) Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University of Jakarta, INDONESIA. It specializes in Indonesian Islamic studies in particular, and Southeast Asian Islamic studies in general, and is intended to communicate original researches and current issues on the subject. This journal warmly welcomes contributions from scholars of related disciplines. All submitted papers are subject to double-blind review process.

STUDIA ISLAMIKA has been accredited by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education, Republic of Indonesia as an academic journal (Decree No. 32a/E/KPT/2017).

STUDIA ISLAMIKA has become a CrossRef Member since year 2014. Therefore, all articles published by STUDIA ISLAMIKA will have unique Digital Object Identifier (DOI) number.

STUDIA ISLAMIKA is indexed in Scopus since 30 May 2015.

Annual subscription rates from outside Indonesia, institution: US$ 75.00 and the cost of a single copy is US$ 25.00; individual: US$ 50.00 and the cost of a single copy is US$ 20.00. Rates do not include international postage and handling.

Please make all payment through bank transfer to: PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, Indonesia, account No. 101-00-0514550-1 (USD), Swift Code: bmriidja

Harga berlangganan di Indonesia untuk satu tahun, lembaga: Rp. 150.000,-, harga satu edisi Rp. 50.000,-; individu: Rp. 100.000,-, harga satu edisi Rp. 40.000,-. Harga belum termasuk ongkos kirim.

Pembayaran melalui PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, No. Rek: 128-00-0105080-3
## Table of Contents

### Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>205</td>
<td>Christopher Mark Joll &amp; Srawut Aree</td>
<td>Images of Makkah and the Hajj in South Thailand: An Ethnographic and Theological Exploration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>239</td>
<td>Syamsul Rijal</td>
<td>Revitalizing Hadhrami Authority: New Networks, Figures and Institutions among Ḥabā'īb in Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>273</td>
<td>Alfitri</td>
<td>Protecting Women from Domestic Violence: Islam, Family Law, and the State in Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>343</td>
<td>Abdul Wahid Hasyim</td>
<td>Al-Tariqah al-Naqshabandiyah al-Khālidiyah fi Cianjur, Jawa al-Gharbīyah: Taʿālimuhā wa tuqūsuḥā wa taṭawwurātuḥā</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Book Review**

385  *Wahyudi Akmaliah*
Mengartikulasikan Suara Alternatif
Muslim Asia Tenggara

**Document**

397  *Irfan Abubakar & Idris Hemay*
Pesantren Resilience:
The Path to Prevent Radicalism
and Violent Extremism
Abstract: This article explores the historical and contemporary importance of Makkah and the hajj for Malays in South Thailand. Our multi-disciplinary approach examines relevant historiographies, the insights of Islamic Studies scholars, and ethnographic data collected in Pattani’s provincial capital. We point out that in the outputs produced by literary networks located in Sumatra and the portion of Thai/Malay Peninsula once referred to as the Malay Sultanate of Pattani, references to Makkah were early to appear. Malays from Pattani may have primarily travelled to Makkah to perform the hajj, but following Pattani’s subjugation by Bangkok in the late 18th century, Makkah functioned as a refuge. Following a description of the prerequisites, preparations, and performances of the hajj in present-day Pattani, we identify and discuss motivations of fulfilment, forgiveness, and merit-making. We argue through our exploration of these historical, ethnographic, and theological factors that Makkah is much more than a site of pilgrimage, and that the performance of hajj is multi-faceted.

Keywords: Pattani, Makkah, Hajj, Pilgrimage, Merit-making, Soteriology.

Kata kunci: Pattani, Mekkah, Haji, Ziarah, Mendapatkan Pahala, Soteriologi.

ملخص: يستكشف هذا المقال الأهمية التاريخية والمعاصرة لمكة المكرمة والحج بالنسبة للملايوين في جنوب تايلاند. يقوم منهجنا متعدد التخصصات بفحص التاريخيات ذات الصلة، ورؤى الدراسات الإسلامية، والبيانات الإثنوغرافية التي تم جمعها في عاصمة محافظة باتاني. ونشير إلى أن النتائج التي أنتجها الشبكات المكتبية الموجودة في سومطرة وجزء من تايلاند / جزيرة ملايو سابقا باسم سلطنة الملايو بواتان، مراجع عن مكة المكرمة كانت موجودة منذ وقت مبكر. وقد سافر الملايوون الفتنانيون إلى مكة المكرمة لأداء فرضية الحج في المقام الأول. وبعد سقوط باتاني في يد بانكوك في أواخر القرن الثامن عشر، أصبحت مكة بمثابة ملجأ. واستنادا إلى المتطلبات الأساسية والاستعدادات وأداء الحج في باتاني الحالي، نحن نناقش دوافع إتباع الرغبات والرغبات والحصول على الثواب. وبالاعتماد على تبعتنا للبيانات التاريخية والإثنوغرافية واللاهوتية اكتشفنا أن مكة المكرمة أكبر بكثير من مجرد موقع للزيارة، وأن هناك دوافع أخرى وراء أداء الحج.

الكلمات المفتاحية: فتناني، مكة، الحج، الزارة، الحصول على الثواب، السلام.

DOI: 10.36712/sti.v27i2.10585 Studia Islamika, Vol. 27, No. 2, 2020
While visiting the province of Narathiwat in South Thailand in 2013, we visited a local museum established and maintained by a committed group of volunteers. After exchanging greetings and name cards, we were shown to a sala (Thai. shaded seating platform) at the rear of the museum, as an energetic underling scurried off to a local kedai kopi with orders for teh limau.¹ By the time our drinks arrived, the head of the museum mentioned that they had recently received a stash of traditional Jawi religious literature (referred to throughout Muslim Southeast Asia as kitab jawi) tied together with bright red thin plastic twine. He excused himself, returning less than a minute later with this pile, and invited us to have a look through them as we sipped our drinks. Someone unfolded a map of Makkah, which most agreed would have been used by local tok seh (PM [Pattani Malay] hajj guides) when performing the hajj was more of an ordeal than an adventure (see Fig. 1). On it, the names of places visited by pilgrims were written in Jawi. The Kabah (PM. Baitullah) dominates the disintegrating map that is rimmed by Arabic calligraphy.

Figure 1: Hajj Guide from South Thailand  
(photographed by CM Joll, Yingo, Narathiwat, October 2013)
Someone in the sala commented that the nearby port at the mouth of the Bangnara River remained an important place of departure until local Malays were required to travel to the Hijaz with Thai passports. Passengers already possessing these could be picked up at Bangnara until the harbour became too shallow for modern ships. Those applying for passports could complete application forms at local government offices, but these had to be personally picked up in Bangkok once processed. Most pilgrims took the train to Bangkok from one of the local train stations. Muhammad Arafat bin Mohamad (2013, 88) recounts that in the mid-1960s, the steam train took three days to reach the Hijaz capital. This was largely due to the train having to stop whenever it ran out of wood. Trees needed to be chopped down—as well as chopped up—before it could proceed. Upon reaching Bangkok, passports were picked up, and boats boarded at the Klong Teuy Wharf.

In this article, we explore the range of roles that Makkah has played in the religious life of South Thailand’s Malay Muslims both when this portion of the Siamese/Malay Peninsula was directly ruled by Malay monarchs, and in the first decade of the twenty-first century. What motivated subjects of local Rajas in Pattani, Jala, Legeh, and Raman, and modern day Hijaz citizens residing in Pattani’s provincial capital to make their way to Makkah?² We seek to answer these questions in ways that resists reinforcing reductionist assertions about why—both historically, and in the ethnographic present—local Muslims undertake the “longest journey” (Tagliacozzo 2013). How do we propose avoid a predictable and pedestrian analysis of themes about which much has been written? (Bianchi 2004, 2017; Delaney 1990; Katz 2004; Matheson and Milner 1984; McDonnell 1986; Mois and Buitelaar 2015; Peters 1994; Porter and Saif 2013; Roff 1975, 2003; Tagliacozzo 2013). We take a multi-disciplinary approach that brings into dialogue insights about the wider Southeast Asian ecumene made by historians of Muslim Southeast Asia, ethnographic vignettes collected during the first author’s 10 years in the municipality of Pattani, and relevant theological debates provided by Islamic Studies scholars.³ We begin by highlighting the historical importance of Makkah as a refuge for scholars, such as Shaykh Dāwud al-Faṭānī following the Siamese subjugation of the Malay Kingdom of Pattani, in 1786 (Bradley 2012).⁴ This is prefaced by a discussion of
manuscripts produced in Southeast Asian literary networks and what they reveal about the historic connections between Makkah, Pattani, and wider Muslim Southeast Asia.

Having established above that Makkah is much more than a destination for pilgrims, below we consider the multifaceted efficacy of the hajj. In other words, what are the range of worldly and spiritual benefits that motivates men and women from Pattani making their way to Makkah? Although we introduce and interrogate the themes of fulfilment, forgiveness, and merit-making separately, readers should not lose sight of this reality. We present an account of the prerequisites and preparations for hajj made by the first author’s ethnographic subjects in Pattani’s provincial capital, and its performance in the Hijaz. As it is not only individual pilgrims who seek fulfilment, but the deceased (through proxies), we explore local controversies about this practice. A similar approach is taken to the equally important role that the hajj plays in expiating sins. We interact with relevant theological controversies about whether—and under what conditions—forgiveness can be secured. A nuanced analysis of the motivation to make merit (for both individual pilgrims and the deceased) requires a combination of ethnographic vignettes and reminders about Islamic cosmology. Not only is Makkah a sacred space, but (like the month of Ramaḍān) the days during which the hajj is performed are holier than others. Rather than merit-making motivations being the result of close, and extended contacts between Muslims and Buddhists in South Thailand, we reveal that the ethnographic output of anthropologists working in the Middle East includes the Muslim economy of merit. In addition to local merit-making motivations possessing significant Islamic credentials, this function of the hajj illustrates the communal ethos embedded in Islamic soteriology in which the living assist the deceased (Joll 2011, 195–200).

**Makkah in Southeast Asian Muslim Literary Networks**

In her *Islam Translated* (2011), Ronit Ricci describes a range of networks existing across the Indian Ocean that forged connections between a wide range of individuals and communities. Historians of Southeast Asian Islam have highlighted the role of Muslim trading guilds and Sufi brotherhoods in Islam’s expansion to the region. However, she argues that expanding the units of analysis to literary networks answers questions about how ethnically and linguistically
diverse Muslims between South and Southeast Asia introduced, sustained, adopted, and adapted a “complex web of prior texts and new interpretations that were crucial to the establishment of both local and global Islamic identities”. These networks produced “stories, poems, genealogies, histories, and treatises on a broad range of topics” (Ricci 2011, 2). Tagliacozzo (2013, 84) notes Makkah was mentioned in texts produced by Malay literary networks from the late fourteenth century. These began with Hikayat Bayan Budiman (1371), Hikayat Raja Pasai (1390), Hikayat Muhammad Hanafiyyah (1450), Hikayat Air Hamzah (1600). While such an early awareness of pilgrimages is remarkable, other references to the Hijaz are rare until the early seventeenth century, before reappearing in ‘Aqā’id of al-Nasāfī (1590) and the poems of Hamzah Fansuri. The Hikayat Aceh (1625), which blends “Acehnese, Persian, Arabic, and Malay into one amalgam of elegant text”, contains numerous references to Hajis, a detail that contributed to Aceh gaining its reputation as Southeast Asia’s most important “verandah of Mecca” (Tagliacozzo 2013, 86). Tagliacozzo also notes specific references to Madinah about this time, and that regional “mechanics and dynamics of cross-culturalism” suggested passages to the Middle East having become safer, which in turn “increased the pace of contact between Muslims on both sides of the Indian Ocean” (Tagliacozzo 2013: 87).

In addition to Nūr al-Dīn al-Rānīrī’s Bustān al-Salāṭīn (1640) from the mid-1600s, other Malay manuscripts mentioning the hajj from this period include Cerita Kutai (1625), Hikayat Tanah Hitu (1650), Hikayat Ibrāhīm ibn Ādām (1650), Sejarah Melayu (1650), Hikayat Banjar dan Kota Waringin (1663), and Bab Tākzir (1680).

During the eighteenth century, texts concerned with pilgrimage were less common, but are contained in Cerita Asal Bangsa Jin dan Segala Dewa-Dewa (1700), and Hikayat Hang Tua (1700), and Hikayat Pattani (1730). For example, the Hikayat Pattani recounts that during the eleven-month reign of Alung Yunus in 1728, a number of visitors arrived in Pattani. The first was a certain Sayyid Abdullah of Trengganu, who was a “descendent of the prophet of God, and he originally came from Jerusalem.” The names of a number of Hajis are mentioned. In addition to Haji Yunus, who was “a Malay from Pattani”, Haji Abdurrahman was “[a] Javanese [who] on his way back from a pilgrimage to Mecca” had taken a wife in Pattani (Wyatt and Teeuw 1970, 200).
It was not until the mid-1700s that the pilgrimage to Makkah became “noticeable again in these religio-political documents”, such as Sūrat al-Anbiyā’ (1750) which apart from Hikayat Hang Tuah “mentions the pilgrimage and Mekkah more than any other Malay manuscript.” In the late 1700s, Risalah fi ’l-Tawhid (1760), Adat Raja-Raja Melayu (1779), and Misa Melayu (1780) maintain this “intellectual thread with […] regularity”. In the early nineteenth century, “religio-political texts bonding the Middle East and the Malay world began to be composed, annotated, and translated again at a furious pace”. Tagliacozzo (2013, 87) argues that this was a result of the Napoleonic Wars in Europe which meant that “the transit and travel of Muslim texts and Muslim men across the Indian Ocean […] became easier than before”. These was due to there being “less surveillance and supervision”, which permitted “religious and political tracts […] to circulate more freely”. Furthermore, developments in “shipping and navigation ensured that greater percentages of these cargoes […] reached their destinations than was previously possible.”

Literary networks are central to the approach to the Pattani historiography pursued by Francis Bradley (2014, 91), who focused on networks, human movement, and sociocultural values that accounts for [the] human agency, material circumstance, and local variation of Islamic practice. Building on the work of Mohammad Nor bin Ngah (1982), Virginia Matheson and M.B. Hooker (1988), Mohammad Zain Abd. Rahman (2002), and Azra (2004, 124–26), Bradley (2009) specifically examines how ‘ulamā’ from Pattani reconstructed a moral order after decades of devastating warfare which laid waste to social and political elites. He points out that following the first of a number of brutal Siamese campaigns that destroyed the power of the local market and monarchy in 1786, these ‘ulamā’ developed a “vast knowledge network” out of this “freshly displaced population” (Bradley 2014, 91). Pattani’s demise represented a “transformative denouement in a century-long process of shifting sociomoral values that ultimately produced a transregional community that linked Makkah with many parts of Islamic Southeast Asia.” Exiles sought an “explanation for their defeat and a means for rebuilding their fractured homeland”. The successful leaders who emerged such as Shaykh Dāwud ibn ‘Abdullāh ibn Idrīs al-Faṭānī (1740–1847), best known as Shaykh Dāwud al-Faṭānī, gathered in Makkah where they “forged a new vision of themselves as Muslims”
While Thai Historian David Wyatt noted that Tai states centred in Chiang Mai, and Vientiane re-oriented themselves toward Bangkok following their subjugation (Wyatt 1997, 443), Pattani “turned to Makkah and Islam on an unprecedented level” (Bradley 2016, 8). The Islamic scholarship produced in Makkah possessed:

[increasing value to members of the Pattani community at the turn of the nineteenth century and served as their most valuable social currency. The dispossessed and exiled, now bereft of a formal, political apparatus that might reconstitute them under a new banner, turned increasingly to Islamic teachings as their main source of cultural unity. Pattani’s Islamic leaders [...] rose to the fore as shepherds of a new moral order. Their success was based upon their ability to harness sources of moral power, for them largely new and empowering, and by grounding their claims in sacred knowledge possessing an esteemed intellectual genealogy linking them back to the Prophet Muhammad or some of the great scholars of Islam (Bradley 2014, 92).

Furthermore, these new leaders constructed “relationships with students and followers centred around the reproduction, extrapolation, and dissemination of particular forms of Islamic knowledge.” Refugees from Pattani reformulated themselves under an “Islamic reformist banner in opposition to Siam.” Bradley asks how this “politically marginalized”, and “displaced” community formed “cultural unities after their states were destroyed or seriously weakened”, and the importance of “cultural unities” in this particular form of Islamic revivalism. He specifically investigates relationships between “scholars, teachers, and students”, and texts—all of which permitted what he refers to at Makkah’s “Pattani School” to “disseminate knowledge into Southeast Asia at an unprecedented rate in the nineteenth century” (Bradley 2014, 93).

Thousands of Malay refugees from Pattani fled the Siamese between 1786 and 1839 (Bradley 2012). While some found sanctuary in neighboring Kelantan, Terengganu, Perak, and Kedah, a “privileged few” made the journey to Makkah where they reconstructed “newfound cultural unities, established pervasive discourses regarding Islamic practice, and transmitted these ideas to Southeast Asia via knowledge networks.” Pattani-based Malay historian Numan Hayimasae (2014) mentions that Shaykh Dâwud al-Faṭānī was not the ërst person from Pattani to have reached the Haramayn, and that he mixed with a group of Southeast Asian students. These included “Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ ‘Abd
Ahmad Fathy al-Fatani proposed that he arrived in Makkah in 1787, when he was 18 years old (al-Fatani 2009, 26). As such, most of these scholars would have functioned as his teachers (Hayimasae 2014, 491).

While refugees from Pattani arrived in Makkah with “at least a three-century tradition of Islamic belief and practice”, Bradley points out the lack of evidence for a “sustained scholarly tradition.” The timing of Shaykh Dāwud al-Forâţâni’s arrival at the turn of the nineteenth century also impacted the literature that he produced and disseminated. Makkah was undergoing several changes following the rise of the Hanbali “Wahhâbiyah” movement. Bradley provides a detailed analysis of this shift “during and after the Wahhâbiyah occupation of Makkah”. Specifically, prior to 1812, al-Forâţâni’s emphasis was on translating Shafî’i legal codes. These were “relatively short treatises on themed topics, such as the laws of marriage, inheritance, or mercantile transactions.” Following the defeat of the Wahhâbiyah, he “turned to more practical texts concerning the hajj, Friday prayers, and the building of mosques. By 1232/1817, his focus was on the “teachings of the great Sufi, al-Ghazâli.” This remained his focus for the next seventeen years, before returning to “an interest in legal texts, brought on by continued political problems for Pattani.”

What is the relevance of discussing the role of Makkah as refuge for refugees from Pattani, from the late 18th century? As we reveal below, the Makkah-based “Pattani School” led by Shaykh Dāwud al-Forâţâni, and after him Shaykh Wan Ahmed ibn Muhamamd Zayn Mustafa al-Forâţâni (1856–1908) (Shaykh Ahmad al-Forâţâni), need to be more widely appreciated for producing a stream of Islamic scholarship that contributed to local Islamic traditions—including those relating to the hajj, forgiveness, fulfilment, and merit dealt with below—which closely resemble those in other parts of the Muslim world.6

The Hajj in Present-Day Pattani: Prerequisites, Preparations, and Performances

Before exploring what motivates Muslims from present-day Pattani to make the pilgrimage to Makkah, we first need to deal with the range of pre-requisites and preparations undertaken by would-be pilgrims.
This is followed by a short summary of the most common performance of the hajj by local pilgrims.

Before Muslims in Pattani perform the hajj, they must make a number of logistical, financial and spiritual preparations. For most, the most formidable is the raising of the required 120,000 Thai Baht. While many of the improvements to Makkah’s infrastructure have made the hajj safer, they have also increased its cost. One elderly hajji who had performed the hajj more than five times made the following observations about the differences experienced between modern pilgrims and what Hajis and Hajahs endured in the early twentieth century:

It was more difficult for people to go on the hajj. It was also more dangerous. The trip took longer. However, although it only takes seven hours to fly there, and there are air-conditioned hotels in Mecca for pilgrims to stay in, there are also aspects of doing the hajj in the past that were easier than what they are now. For example, in the past, there weren't as many people during the hajj as there are now. Now, it is so crowded! These days it costs a lot more money. These days, it is not at all straightforward for people [in Pattani] to take time off work to perform the hajj.

Many informants commented that Muslims in Pattani financed their hajj through the sale of land, a decision only permissible if it did not cause any undue hardship to either the pilgrims or their families. All outstanding debts to individuals must also be repaid before leaving for Makkah. One interviewee related that the sister of another informant had paid a tiny 300 baht debt that she had incurred while studying at a Thai state secondary school 15 years earlier. The Islamic bank of Thailand (Th., Thanakhan Islam Haeng Prathet Thai) provides Islamic loans to applicants with a salary of more than 20,000 baht per month, the repayments for which are between 2,000 and 3,000 baht per month. Such loans are considered ḥalāl if one is able to make the repayments.

Some received partial or full sponsorships to perform the hajj. For instance, the owner of one of Pattani’s Islamic printing presses regularly sponsored members of his staff unable to finance themselves. He explained, “Islam teaches us that when someone is making a sedekoh for someone to perform the hajj, that person receives the same amount of merit that the person performing the hajj receives”. Others were sponsored by overseas Islamic foundations. Intriguingly, few that we were aware of fitted definitions of the poor and needy. Some recipients had worked in a range of Islamic foundations, or as vote canvassers (Th.
Images of Makkah and the Hajj in South Thailand  

Given the enormous social capital associated with the performance of the hajj, such sponsorships resembled a form of patronage. One interviewee, who had once worked as a vote canvasser, refused such a sponsorship, explaining:

I was informed that a wealthy Arab donor had been sick and made a *sedekoh* for some poor people to perform the hajj. As you know, this is very meritorious. Perhaps he also wanted to cleanse himself from some sin. So, he contacted a Muslim politician in Thailand, asking him to distribute his *sedekoh*. Someone came to me, asking me if I was interested. When I heard where the sponsorship came from, I turned it down as I thought that accepting it was not consistent with the wishes of the donor—I am not poor!

In addition to obtaining finances, “a call” (PM. *seru*, Th. *kham chern*) is considered by some to be essential before performing the hajj. Some cited a lack of call as their reason for delaying going to Makkah, claiming, “I haven’t been called yet” (PM. *tak sapa seru lagi*). The concept of a call is an important element of the *talbiyah*, repeated by pilgrims throughout the hajj. Although some insist on the necessity of the call, others disagreed, including someone we refer to as Bae (*Abang*) Heng, the son of Haji Hussein. Some people who say that they have not yet received a call are just making excuses! If we are a Muslims, we must follow the five *Rukon* of Islam—which includes the hajj. They have a responsibility. There is nothing about a *seru*. Many who postpone the hajj are ignorant of their responsibilities, afraid of the journey, or reluctant to see such a large amount of money spent.

Another person who rejected the need for a *seru* commented:

If we are a Muslim, we have undertaken to do all that is required of us by God. We do this irrespective of how we feel. I don’t miss a *fardu* prayer because I don’t feel like it! It is the same with *Ramadān*. If someone said to me, ‘I haven’t received a call’ (PM. *tak sapa seru*); I would say Allah has already called you (PM. *Allah seru doh!*).

Although the organization of the hajj in Thailand is less rigid than in Malaysia, the services of a *tok seh* (PM. hajj guide) are mandatory. Once a decision has been made to perform the hajj, a *tok seh* is contacted. In interviews that dealt with *tok seh*, these were almost always people who had been recommended by a trusted relative or friend. *Tok seh* are also connected with hajj companies who organize all transport, accommodation, and logistical details such as visas and immunizations.
While some contact hajj companies directly, none of the interviewees had done so. Ming and his wife Nung are Malay neighbours who made the pilgrimage to Makkah with a tok seh personally known to them. Although they trusted his honesty and paid the required sum directly to him without any official receipt, not everyone in Pattani had such a positive experience with their tok seh. When one neighbour returned from sending his nephew to the airport in Bangkok, he recounted the ordeal that this group of 40 pilgrims had experienced. While waiting at the international airport terminal as instructed by their tok seh, one of his assistants arrived with bad news. He explained that there had been problems with their tickets and visas and that they all must return to their hotel to await instructions. Furious, a nephew of this neighbour went immediately to the hajj company their tok seh worked for. There, he was informed that their tickets had not been issued as they were owed over 1,000,000 baht by their tok seh.

Before leaving for Makkah, feasts are held throughout Pattani for departing pilgrims, most of which are held on Fridays, Saturdays and Sundays. These typically commence in the morning with semaye hajat. After this, relatives, neighbours and friends visit throughout the day. Many of those visiting perform semaye hajat, make small sedekoh towards travel expenses and promise to pray for a successful pilgrimage. A number of requests are also made by those attending. Some request that the pilgrims make a du‘ā’ for them. Others ask that their greetings and peace (PM. kiring sale, Th. faak salam) be offered to the Prophet at his tomb in Madinah. After a feast was held before her departure a Malay Hajah explained:

People believe that if they attend a feast like this, they share in some way the blessing of the hajj. This is especially for people with little or no opportunity to perform the hajj themselves. They will also make requests, which we must be attentive to.

Most pilgrims attempt to also resolve all outstanding disagreements (PM. puku, Th. rueang). Some ask forgiveness (PM. mito’ ma’af, Th. kho thort) for wrong-doings. A number of Hajs and Hajahs interviewed recounted contacting people to whom money had been lent, but not repaid. A Thai Muslim neighbour related sending a message (through an intermediary) to someone owing him money that he planned to make the hajj. Soon afterwards, this loan was repaid. Clearing unresolved issues and debts in this manner is thought to assist pilgrims in making
a new start upon their return. As the following interviewee explained, there were a range of the challenges faced by would be pilgrims in the early twentieth century.

In the past, going on the hajj took between three or four months. Sometimes people were away for years. Others died. So, in the past, people said goodbye to their family and friends knowing that it was possible they would not see them again. This is why it is so important to be completely debt free when one leaves, and that there are no sins that you have committed to others—or have been committed to you that you have not cleared. Allah will forgive the sins committed against him, but it is our responsibility to clear these other sins that involve others.

On the day pilgrims leave Pattani, relatives gather to perform a sunnah prayer for travelling (Ar. ṣalat safar) before leaving for the nearest airport in Had Yai, located in the nearby Thai province of Songkhla. In the weeks leading up to the hajj, a constant stream of packed pick-up trucks drive in convoy to Had Yai. The number of cars at Had Yai airport is such that those of pilgrims are directed to a specially designated section of the airport car park to minimize disruption to other passengers.

The hajj has three forms: (1) qirān hajj (in which hajj and ‘umroh are all done in one iḥrām); (2) ifrād hajj, (where hajj is made without ‘umroh); and (3) tamattu’ hajj (where ‘umroh and hajj are performed on two iḥrāms). All Pattani residents interviewed had performed tamattu’ hajj. This was the only pilgrimage that the Prophet personally undertook and its two iḥrāms made it the easier for first-time pilgrims to perform. As is well known, iḥrām requires pilgrims to perform a full ablution (Ar. ghusl), abstain from all sexual activity, cut neither one’s hair or finger/toe nails, to utter the talbiyah, and to don the two iconic white unhemmed sheets made of towelling material (for men), or a plain white robe (for women).

The tamattu’ hajj commences with entering iḥrām to perform ‘umroh. ‘Umroh consists of the tawaf, the anti-clockwise circling of the Ka’bah seven times (waving at the black stone as it is passed); Sā’i, or the walking between the hills of Ṣafā’ and Marwah seven times;12 and the ritual haircutting (Ar. qaṣr), or head shaving (Ar. ḥalq). On the eighth of Dhū al-Ḥijjah, pilgrims travel from Makkah to Mina where the day is spent observing farḍu prayers. They stay the night there in the (air-conditioned) tents provided. On the ninth of Dhū al-Ḥijjah, pilgrims enter iḥrām, perform Ṣubuh, and then leave Mina for Arafat
where Muhammad preached his last sermon. There, pilgrims remain in a prayer vigil between noon and sunset, referred to as wuqaf. At sunset, they leave Arafah for Muzdalifah, where many spend the night out in the open. After Subuh on the 10th of Dhū al-Hijjah, wuqaf is again observed. After this, pebbles are collected for the stoning of the devil. Pilgrims travel to Mina and stone the devil (Ar. Ramy jamrah) represented by walls, which (before 2004) were pillars. For those who are either required to (through breaking ihram), or wish to do so as a voluntary sedekoh, a sacrifice (Ar. qurbān) is then made. This is followed by performing qaṣr or ḥalq one last time. Pilgrims then travel to Makkah where both the tawaf (tawaf ziyyah, or tawaf al-ifādah), and sa‘i for the hajj, are performed. Pilgrims are required to return to Mina before Subuh on the morning of the 11th to perform the stoning of all three devils (Ar. Ramy jimār) that commences after noon. Ramy jimār is then repeated on the 12th of Dhū al-Hijjah, after which pilgrims may return to Makkah to perform tawaf one last time. This completes the hajj. However, those who have not left Mina before sunset on the 12th are required to stay one further night. On the 13th of Dhū al-Hijjah, the stoning of the devils is repeated. The tawaf in Makkah is then performed, which completes the hajj.

Strategies for Fulfilment

Having provided details about the pre-requisites, preparations, and most common reason for performing the hajj from interviews with returned pilgrims in Pattani, the principal concern of the following section is to address the most important motivation for performing the hajj. Pilgrims might appreciate the multi-faceted role of the hajj, but it first and foremost fulfils one of the wājib pillars of Islam. Although the preceding section was based on the first author’s ethnographic data collected in Pattani between 2000 and 2010, this is the first scholarly work to bring this ethnographic data into dialogue with relevant theological material provided by Islamic Studies specialists. What do these contribute to our multidisciplinary inquiry into the hajj? We argue that by doing so, a fair and thorough discussion of some of the theological controversies surrounding the themes of fulfilment, forgiveness, and merit-making will be achieved. The most controversial issue that we deal with below is how the deceased fulfil this pillar of Islam through proxies (badal ḥajj).
It can be argued that the cost of the hajj makes this the most difficult pillar of Islam for Muslims in Pattani’s provincial capital to fulfil. Be that as it may, the daily discipline of performing wājib prayers, the annual rigors of Ramadan should not be downplayed. Interest in how Muslims fulfil this final pillar inextricably leads to an examination of both class and gender. For instance, Muslim women face a number of obstacles which Muslim men do not. The most restrictive is needing to be accompanied by a relative. Similarly, those possessing insufficient financial means accept that whatever feelings of disappointment they may struggle with, they will not be subject to punishment. These are some of the reasons for both the provisions that the hajj can be performed by proxy, and the popularity of strategies through which the poor—particularly poor women—become involved in the economy of merit. Central to these are an emphasis on performing both fard and sunnah prayers, a pious observance of the wājib Ramadan, and supererogatory fast, and regularly making sedekoh.

While only one performance of the hajj fulfils a Muslim’s individual obligations, many repeat the hajj. Most who do so are motivated by more than the desire to either experience intense devotion in Makkah again or receive considerable amounts of merit. Another important motivation for repeating the hajj is to fulfil this obligation for a parent who died without having had the opportunity to do it themselves. Regardless of sectarian affiliation, all in Pattani accept their responsibility to make merit for the deceased, although a range of assessments exist about the efficacy of transferring merit to anyone other than parents. Along with sedekoh jariyah, performances of the hajj by pious children (locally referred to as anak soleh, or righteous children) are unanimously accepted, provided that there was an expressed desire to perform the hajj themselves—which is always the case.

A Pathan neighbour whose family attended one of Pattani’s post-traditionalist mosques, who we have called Hakim, recounted that although no funeral feasts were arranged after his father was buried, two months later he performed the hajj for him. Hakim explains that when doing so, everything was done the same in the same way as though he had performed hajj himself. The only difference was his niyyah, which specified this being performed for his father. Like most, this hajj was funded by his father’s estate. It was his poor health—rather than lack of finances—that had prevented him personally fulfilling this obligation.
He added that performing hajj did not threaten the family's financial security.

What are the options for Muslims who are childless? Some request a close relative to perform the hajj by proxy. For instance, three years after performing the hajj himself, another informant aligned with a local reformist mosque recounted having returned to Makkah to repeat the hajj for his mother's sister. When he was reminded about the critical remarks he had made about merit-transference by anyone other than an anok soleh, he conceded the ambiguity before explaining his beliefs about the legitimacy of what he had undertaken:

“My mother’s sister (PM. mo’daro, SM. mak saudara) brought me up for many years. I was as close to her as my own mother. She died having not performed the hajj and I was keen to return her many kindnesses (PM. balas budi) she had shown me over many years. I paid for this myself and performed this with the niyah to dedicate the merit (pahalo) to her.

Less ideal are situations involving non-relatives funded from the deceased’s estate, most commonly referred to as wa’ upob hajj (Th. jaang khon tham hajj, PM. hiring someone to perform the hajj). One of the main reasons for the local popularity of badal hajj is that it is considerably less expensive than the full cost of the hajj. A Malay woman, whose father died when she was a child, explained that after working for a few years, she and her siblings had hired a tok seh, who was a close relative residing in Makkah. This was not only cheaper than hiring a tok seh from Pattani, but it was also less risky. She was under no illusions that unscrupulous tok seh sometimes accepted money without doing what was promised. Having accepted payments from more than one person, tok seh sub-contract his duties to others for a profit.

While it is often claimed that it is the Shafi’i school of jurisprudence that permits posthumous fulfilment of ritual obligation (Davidson and Gitlitz 2002, 261), this a widespread practice in Pattani. For instance, Vit Sisler’s innovative “netnography” of Muslim websites describes that with a “single click, believers from all over the world can feed the fasting inside Al-Masjid an-Nabawi during the month of Ramadan or pay the badal hajj.” Upon receiving this online payment, the badal hajj is be performed by a “student from the Islamic University of Madinah or Umm al-Qura University in Makkah, who will complete all the hajj rites and, at the same time, “benefit from the fee he receives by allowing him to maintain himself or his family.
whilst studying” (Sisler 2011, 1144–45). Interestingly, the Dutch colonial orientalist Christian Snouck Hurgronje (2007, 242) noted that during his residence in Makkah in the late nineteenth century, Southeast Asian pilgrims arrived in the Hijaz with several packets of money, “each with its own origin and place of destination.” This included the equivalent of 50–150 guilders, left by those who—for whatever reason—had “put off their pilgrimage till after death, to pay for deputies”, referred to as bèdèl hajji, or hajj through a proxy. This money is usually intended for “countryfolk known to them or else good friends”, who will be entrusted with the task of deputizing. Although definite instructions about the choice of bèdèl, are sometimes given, Hurgronje speculates about the desire among Mekkans for securing the job of bèdèl. To begin with, they “make the hajj in any case, and the bèdèl means merely a rich reward”. Should a shaykh gain control of “several bèdèls”, he typically “appoints in first line his male relatives as deputies and withdraws a percentage as commission.” The second line, are his “free servants with other bèdèls,” with the rest given to “hungry friends, keeping the half of the payment for himself.” In Makkah at the time he was writing, there was a “brisk demand for this easy way of earning money”, and that the unscrupulous illegally make the one hajj made per year do many bèdèls, and that “many sheikhs forget a certain number of the bèdèl entrusted to them” (Hurgronje 2007, 243).

The mixture of ethnographic and historical material introduced above, indicates that controversies surrounding the deceased fulfilling the wájib obligations to perform the hajj through proxy have been extensively documented. This is the first in a number of examples which emphasises the centrality of the hajj residing in more than the benefits received by individual pilgrims. Righteous children are inextricably connected to their parents who—as we describe below—automatically receive merit from the children, regardless of its size, and the wide range of righteous deeds, charitable donations, and ritual performances they perform. While no specific intention (Ar. níyah) is required for merit to operate in this way, for anyone else there has to be a clear intention.

Controversies concerning the Hajj and Forgiveness

Pilgrims might primarily be motivated by their desire to fulfil the fifth pillar of Islam either for themselves or the deceased, but the
hajj also represents a unique opportunity to be absolved of their sins. In contrast to the motivations of fulfilment (dealt with above), and merit-making (described below), forgiveness is something that only individuals physically travelling to Makkah can receive. All pilgrims from Pattani stated their aim of achieving hajj *mabrūp*, through which they return as pure in the sight of God as new-born babies. One man in an interview explained, “The issue of forgiveness is very important. When we have completed the hajj, our sins are forgiven. We are white. If we *tobat* (PM. repent) from a sin while on the hajj, we can be sure that we will be forgiven.” All who correctly perform the hajj with sincerity achieve hajj *mabrūp*, but only Allah knows a pilgrim’s actions and sincerity. Some interviewees responded with scepticism about whether anyone would spend over 120,000 baht without sincerity—locally referred to as *ikhalah* (from *ikhlāṣ*), with assertions that argued that had they not experienced “the hardships of life on earth”, they would not have appreciated the “glory of paradise.” In addition to this “positive view of human nature”, the Sunni certainty in salvation is also related to belief in the many references in the Qur’an that it is faith that ensures paradise. For Lange, this “salvific optimism” is enhanced by the ideas that “repentance and good actions wipe out sins”, punishments for Muslim sinners are “only temporary”, and all benefit from the “Prophet’s intercession (*shafā’ah*)” (Lange 2015, 171).

Nonetheless, these elements of Sunni soteriology have a long history of contestation. For instance, it was something that only the community of *mu’mīnūn* (Ar. believers) guided by the Prophet Muḥammad, his immediate successors, and martyrs could be confident about. The “enthusiastic conviction that all believing Muslims” would enter Paradise was revisited after the two disastrous civil wars (656–661 and 683–92). Ḥasan al-Baṣrī (d. 728), emphasized “individual awareness of sins”, over “communal electedness”, while the Mu’tazilites reasoned that punishment for grave sins is perpetual, and that grave sinners should not be considered as either believers, or unbelievers, but as “transgressors” (Ar. *fāsiq*). This position was described as “the status between the two statuses (*al-manzilah bayn al-manzilatayn*)”, typically cited Prophetic traditions such as “only those who say ‘I’ll be in hell’ are believers” while “those who say ‘I’ll be in paradise’ go to hell.” (Lange 2015, 171).

Most Islamic scholars argued that punishments in hell were recompense for “grave sins (*kabārîr*) to the exclusion of minor sins.
(ṣaghā’ir)”, a position based on interpretations of Quranic assertions such as “if you avoid the grave sins that are forbidden to you, We will acquit you of your evil deeds, and admit you by the gate of honor [into paradise]” (4:31) (Lange 2015, 172). Nevertheless, there was no agreement on both what was conceived as grave sins, and how many there were. Some Mu’tazilites “rejected the possibility” of distinctions between minor and grave sins”, while in other theological schools, “various definitions were traded, but [...] remained vague.” Lange describes that as the list of “hadiths about punishment in hell” grew, so did the list of “grave sins.” The “quantitative definitions of grave sins” led to the proliferation of ways to expiate them, had Allah not stated that “for every [sinful] act, there is an expiatory act (Ar. kaffāra).” A “casuistry of the kaffārāt” developed that “softened the damnatory impact of grave sins”. Some traditions expressed a kind of “carte blanche mentality” (Lange 2015, 174). This included the expiatory efficacy of performing the hajj. For example, “Whoever circumambulates this House [the Kaaba] seven times, prays two prostration cycles behind Abraham's Station and drinks from the water of Zamzam, his sins will be forgiven, however numerous they may be.” These (at times extravagant) promises, were met with regular disapproval. Ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī denied that grave sins could be expiated through the hajj, a view that Lange notes has “plunged people into despair.” Theologians argued that the kaffārāt, like all good deeds (ḥasanāt) only atoned for minor—not major—sins. The only efficient mechanism to make amends for grave sins—with the exception of polytheism—was repentance (Ar. tawbah). Answering questions about the fate of unrepentant grave sinners leads to the “heart of Islamic soteriology” (Lange 2015, 176). The Mu’tazilites held that “unrepentant Muslim sinners would be punished with perpetual hellfire”, although their punishment would be lighter than the suffering of unbelievers. A compromise emerged in the tenth century that:

God is free to either punish whomever He likes from among the believing grave sinners with hell-fire and then let them enter paradise, or to pardon them and let them enter paradise [immediately], without punishing them (Lange 2015, 176).

Katz documents some strong—even hyperbolic—statements concerning the ritual efficacy of hajj in the literature.17 Traditions concerning its virtues (Ar. fāḍā’il) indicate that “rather than merely
representing an indiscriminate exaltation of the power of the ritual.” These confirm central concerns with what Katz describes as the “core Islamic themes of sin and salvation”. That the purging of sins represents a “constant and pervasive theme” is supported by the belief, based on the Qur’an, that regardless of the “specific action in question, it is stated to effect the forgiveness of sins.” As demonstrated by the following examples, the magnitude of the promised expiation is “usually vast”. For instance, all sins committed between ‘umrah will be expiated by them, and there is “no reward but paradise” for a sinless/accepted hajj. An accepted (Ar. *mabrūran*) hajj expiates the sins of a year. Believers are called upon to perform the hajj and the ‘umrah consecutively, as these “eliminate poverty and sins as the bellows eliminate impurities from iron, gold and silver.” Anyone who “meets the dawn one day in *ihram*, reciting the *talbiyah* continuously until dusk, is promised that when it “goes down with his sins and he becomes again as he was when his mother gave birth to him [i.e., without sin].” Pilgrims performing the *tawaf* do not “put down one foot and lift the other but that through it, God removes a sin from him and credits him with a good deed.” Furthermore, anyone performing this *tawaf* fifty times will “come out as he was when his mother gave birth to him.” Those doing so seven times, but also “prays two *naka’at* behind the *maqam*, and drinks the water of Zamzam”, will be forgiven sins—“however numerous they may be.” On the topic of travelling between Arafah and Marwah, this is “equivalent to [freeing] seventy slaves.” When stoning the devil, for every pebble thrown, a major/mortal sin is forgiven (Katz 2004, 103–4).

Katz notes that the Hanafi scholar ‘Alī al-Qari’ (d. 1606) regarded such Hadith about the expiation of sins through the hajj as problematic. He specifically questions whether the hajj automatically expiates both major sins, and those involving “injustices against other human beings.” The expiatory power of the hajj might be comprehensive, but the most reliable Hadith explicitly states that only a hajj that is *mabrūran* will be rewarded with Paradise. As no one can be 100% confident of the acceptability of a pilgrim’s performance, the “result is not automatic.” ‘Alī al-Qari’ therefore regards promises of extravagant rewards as “typical of the genre of paraenetic Hadith” that should be regarded as a “hortatory exaggeration(s)”, rather than “rigorous theological statement(s)”. The wider theological principle with which all Hadith should be interpreted, is that the forgiveness of sin is “subject to the
divine will (taht almasht'a).” In summary, claims based on the Hadith about the certainty of forgiveness from the mere performance of the hajj, are “remote from the method of the scholars, distant from the rules of the jurists, and a source of great insolence for the foolish.” Maliki scholar Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr (d. 1070), argued that the unintended consequences of claims that rituals automatically expiate sins, included the redundancies in commandments to repent (Katz 2004, 105).

Katz’s detailed analysis extends to the role of the Ka’bah, and Islamic traditions concerning the Prophet Adam. Both the foundation of the Ka’bah and inauguration of rites included in the hajj were connected with resolving problems about alienation from Allah following Adam’s expulsion from paradise. Adam was directed by Allah to build the Ka’bah as an “earthly replica of the heavenly sanctuary”. He then circumambulates as “[t]he angels circle the divine Throne.” Adam is identified as “the first person to make the pilgrimage”, whose actions are “represented as constituting and designating the individual rites of the hajj. For instance, Adam stopped at ‘Arafah. Eve had set out from Jedda to seek him, and they met at ‘Arafah on the day of Arafah (hence its name). When they set out for Mina, Adam instructed Eva to make a wish. As she chose forgiveness and mercy, the spot become “[k]nown as Mina, and their sin was forgiven and their repentance accepted” (Katz 2004, 110). The clear focus on these traditions are that the performance of these as a “means to divine forgiveness, and thus as a solution to the problem of sin”. Katz continues:

The circumambulation of the Throne is the means by which the angels seek divine forgiveness after questioning God’s intent to create Adam, and the circumambulation of the Ka’bah (earthly counterpart of the Throne) and the performance of the hajj are the means by which Adam seeks forgiveness after his expulsion from paradise. The association with Adam thus draws the rites of the hajj firmly into the cosmic drama of sin and redemption. This drama is concretized in the Black Stone itself, which is consistently stated to be a stone from paradise which began radiantly white and was progressively blackened by the sins of humankind. (Katz 2004, 112).

In contrast to issues of fulfilment and details related to merit-making (discussed below), our discussion of the role that the hajj plays in the expiation of sins has highlighted that there are some things that individual Muslims remain personally responsible for. Notwithstanding the range of ways that the living assist the deceased, the mixture of
ethnographic anecdotes and theological material provided by Islamic Studies specialists have enriched our multi-disciplinary exploration of the multifaceted efficacy of the hajj.

**Makkah and Merit-making**

Having described the hajj fulfilling Islam's fifth pillar—for both pilgrims and the deceased by proxy—and presenting pilgrims with the opportunities to achieve forgiveness, this section explores the local importance of the hajj in the Muslim economy of merit. Although details of sacred space in Makkah have already been dealt with, a discussion of Islamic conceptions of sacred temporality are necessary. Fadwa El Guindi refers to unique notions of time and space in Islam in her *By Noon Prayer: The Rhythm of Islam* (2008). These should not be overlooked by anthropologists seeking to describe the feeling, pulse, and fluidity that furnish Muslims with “serenity, vitality, and strength.” She describes the interweaving of “space and time in a specific rhythm embedded in the very essence of the culture” (Guindi 2008, xiii). For example, anyone unconvinced about the importance of feeling and experiencing Islam through the interweaving rhythm of time and space should invite Muslims living in non-Muslim countries to elaborate on what they miss most. These are likely to include observations of days without any calls to pause and pray, and the lack of interest in either the sun or the moon. For all its trials, many also miss the dramatic changes in daily rhythms during the fasting month of Ramadan.\(^{18}\)

El Guindi (2008, 105–6) points out that this has not always been the case. Semitic peoples followed a “lunisolar” year derived from the “revolution of the sun, and its months from the revolution of the moon. This meant that feast and fast days were regulated by lunar computation, while at the same time keeping their places within the year. Both calendars were therefore kept, and correspondence sought between them. At least two centuries before the *hijrah*, people referred to as the *al-Nasa’a* (Ar. intercalators) “intercalated 7 in 19 lunar years”. Involving as it did the control of sacred months, intercalation was rejected by Islam. During Muhammad’s “[f]arewell pilgrimage”, Sura 9:37 was alluded to which states, “[i]ntercalations [are] only an increase of infidelity, by which the infidels were led astray (people), admitting it one year and prohibiting it in another.” As the Islamic lunar calendar is eleven days shorter than the
solar calendar, festivals cannot be synchronized to the seasons. Following the abandonment of intercalation, months receded from their original place (Guindi 2008, 108).

Figure 2: Gregorian and Hijrah calendars compared
(Based on Breuilly, et al. 1997)

The significance of Ramaḍān in Muslim traditions is that it was during this month that the Prophet Muhammad received his first revelation of the Quran. Not only are both the hajj, and Ramaḍān pillars of Islam wājib, but provisions are provided for not completing them if a believer has a legitimate reason. Those not completing the fast can do so before Niṣf Sha'bān, approximately two weeks before the next fast month commences. Ramaḍān is widely referred to among Thai-speaking Muslims as the most excellent month (Th. duen prasert, duen di lert). This is related to dramatic changes in how any and all meritorious deeds are rewarded. Andre Möller (2005, 41) refers to this phenomenon as the Ramaḍān scale of merit. Ramadan might be the holiest month of the year, but some days in Ramaḍān are holier than others, such as the fifteenth day of the month and the final ten days, referred to as ʿītikāf (Ar. retreat). During the latter, many spend the entire night in local mosques making extra duʿā’, readings of the Quran and praying in the hope that these coincide with the night of power (Ar. laylat al-qadr, Th. kuen prasert).19
While Ramadan highlights the importance of temporality in Islam, the hajj is performed at prescribed times in Islam’s scared spatial center. In addition to fulfilling a *wājib* pillar of Islam (for both pilgrims and the deceased), and securing forgiveness, Muslims in Pattani are also motivated by the masses of merit (*phonlabun, bun*, PM. *pahalo*, Ar. *thawāb*) they will make. The efficacy of performing any and all meritorious acts—good deeds, acts of charity, recitations of the Quran, and supererogatory prayers—between Makkah, Mina, and Arafat from the eight and twelfth of Dhā al-Ḥijjah brings into focus the spatial and temporal aspects of Islamic cosmology.

All the *hajis* and *hajahs* in Pattani interviewed shared details of their five days in and out of *ihram*. Most cited worshipping in Makkah’s Masjid Al-Ḥarām, or inside the *Kawase al-Haram* (PM.), or *khet al-Haram* (Th.) as highlights of their pilgrimage. One *haji* explained what might be referred to as Makkah multiplications of merit by stating, “If I pray at home, I get one mark of merit. If I pray in a mosque, I get 27 marks of merit. If I pray at the Al-Aqsa mosque in Jerusalem, I get 25,000 marks of merit. If I pray in Madinah, I get 50,000 marks of merit. If I pray in Makkah, I receive 100,000 marks of merit!”

The desire to obtain as much merit as possible while in Makkah is illustrated by the following comments about the hajj’s innovative practices (PM. *bid’ah*):

People do *bid’ah* to increase the merit from the hajj. They think, “If I do this, it will increase my *pahalo*. Oh! If I do this, this will also help”. This is something that some *tok seh* also encourage. There are others, however, who fear that instead of getting more *pahalo* from these innovative practices, their *pahalo* will be less. We believe that the hajj that is rewarded with the most *pahalo* is that which follows the *sunnah* of the Prophet. If we do this, there will be no *doso* which will eat away at the *pahalo* merit.

While ‘*umrah* is an element of *Tamattu’* hajj, it also refers to the lesser pilgrimage which Muslims may perform at any time at the centre of Islam’s sacred geography. At “off-peak” times, ‘*umrah* takes as little as one hour to complete. As such, some from Pattani have performed ‘*umrah* while in the Middle East on business. Others travel to Makkah if they are motivated by the merit received through its prescribed ritual elements, as all meritorious deeds and rituals performance are multiplied there. That said, it is important to point out that the lesser pilgrimage is also undertaken by Muslims during a time of crisis, or when seeking guidance. Others view this as preparation for the hajj.
One respondent related he could not afford the hajj, but *umrah* was a quarter the price. On account of the Ramadan scale of merit described above, this is the most popular month to perform *umrah* as those doing so receive as much merit as they would from the hajj. For example, 100,000 marks of merit received from one *fardu* prayer in the Al-Ḥarām mosque is further magnified during Ramadan. The following frank statement was from a neighbour who had recently returned from his second Ramadan in Makkah, when asked about whether merit-generation was his primary motivation:

Why do you think that I go to Makkah every year? It is because I will get lots of merit! When you fast the month of Ramadan in Makkah, you get lots of merit! Oh heaps! Over *i'tikāf* there is no room in any of the hotels. In addition, at *tawwāb* the grand mosque in Makkah is completely full. If we pray in one of three mosques—Al-Haram in Makkah, the Prophet’s mosque in Madinah, and the Mosque Al-Aqṣā in Jerusalem—we will get more merit than any other place in the world. This is clearly stated in the Quran and hadith. In my opinion, it is worth the money (Th. *khum*). Remember the hajj is *wājib* if you have the money. You can perform it more than one time. But I had done the hajj already. But if I spend Ramadan in Makkah, I’ll get lots of merit. While I am there, however, I’ll also perform *umrah*. You get the same amount of merit from the performance of the *umrah* in the month of Ramadān, the hajj, and performing the fast month in Makkah—they are all the same. We can perform *umrah* as many times as we like.

As anyone familiar with ethnographies of Islam produced by anthropologists working in Southeast Asia and the wider Muslim world will be aware, many of the details and disputes surrounding the economy of merit in Pattani described above, have been described elsewhere. Although most were specifically interested in the role of divine recompense through acts of charity, they also discussed empirical data that corroborates what we have described above.

For instance, one of Amira Mittermaier’s Egyptian informants shared concerns about calculative approaches to charity, which was her specific interest. Many have become “calculating machines” when expecting divine rewards for donations and charitable deeds, more than motivations such as partaking in the parallel economy of *barakah*, blessings, abundance, and overflow.” Mittermaier recorded concern that while people helped others for the sake of helping, for many “every date or sip of water offered to those breaking fast in Ramadan becomes a point, an investment.” Despite the over-emphasis on *thawāb* being
viewed as deeply materialist or capitalist, this calculative logic has not entirely replaced the parallel economy of barakah. Rather, they “coexist and continuously inflect each other”. Both economic theologies have long histories in Islamic traditions. For instance, the Quran is “steeped in commercial terminology”. These two strands of Islam are associated with “Wahhabism”, and “Sufism.” The former originated in Bedouin societies and among merchants where Islam was first revealed, while the latter emerged in agricultural societies. When the Prophet Muhammad preached to merchants, he employed the “language of trade”, such as the performance of ablutions gaining a quantifiable number of points. She notes that Islamic traditions dealt with numbers “from the very beginning.” For instance, Judgment Day literally translates as the “Day of Calculation”, and is associated with “images of a scale” (Mittermaier 2019, 281):

The five daily prayers require keeping track of units (rak’as); performing dhikr involves elaborate counting for which prayer beads are often used; and the numerical zakāh rules require careful calculation. The Quran and Hadith (traditions attributed to the Prophet Muhammad) are full of numbers. A concern with numbers and precision has a long history in the Islamic tradition irrespective of capitalism and its neoliberal forms, and calculation is not restricted to these forms of economy (Mittermaier 2014, 278).

Notwithstanding the concept of thawāb representing one element of Islamic culture and religion, Islam was adopted in “different forms in agricultural societies” in which one can “throw some seeds on the ground, and rain comes, and the seeds grow.” Agricultural versions of Islam that developed in places such as Egypt gave rise to an appreciation of “giving, love, plenty, and barakah.” Mittermaier notes that problematic elements of the agriculture metaphor include the absence of labor in the equation, which reinforces the “stereotypical image of Bedouin societies”. Some scholars viewed Wahhabi versions of Islam as relying on concepts of “trade, counting, and thawāb”, with Sufism emphasizing “generosity, hospitality, and barakah.” (Mittermaier 2014, 286).

Nonetheless, within the economy of thawāb, “one good deed does not necessarily equal one point”. Rather, “Savvy believers” can take advantage of “complex calculations and remind each other of how to maximize their rewards.” Rewards are multiplied by “paying attention to the context in which particular actions are performed.” Hadiths are
cited that emphasize that “[p]raying in a congregation is seventy-seven times superior to praying alone and giving alms in Ramadan is seventy times more meritorious than giving at any other time” (Mittermaier 2019). The value of other actions relates to what they are equal to. As we have already noted, performing the minor pilgrimage (‘umrah) during Ramadan is equal to performing the hajj, and that the former is approximately a quarter the price. This leads Katz to describe the “mathematics of divine reward” as “magically elastic, and their meaning lies in the wondrous and beneficent incommensurability of meagre human actions and bounteous divine reward, rather than in any numerical equivalency” (Katz 2007, 211).

Conclusion

In this article, we used a multidisciplinary approach to explore the historical importance of Makkah, and what motivates Malays from the modern Thai province of Pattani to perform the hajj. While primarily motivated by our desire to avoid analysing themes about which much has been written, we were also anxious to leverage our combined fieldwork experience and specialty in Islamic Studies. We have discussed the role that Makkah historically played as a place of refuge for subjects of Malay Rajas fleeing Siam military and political expansion in the late eighteenth century. By drawing attention to how early manuscripts produced by literary networks in Southeast Asia mentioned Makkah, we were able to challenge outdated assessments that the Indian Ocean connected—rather than separated—Muslim Southeast Asian from the Hijaz that grew through the combined effects of Western colonial expansion and developments in sailing and steam technologies. Attention to these processes has much to contribute in explaining how closely both assessments of—and controversies concerning—the efficacy of the hajj resembles those in the wider Muslim world. Despite its geographical distance from Makkah, Muslims in this portion of the Thai/Malay Peninsula were brought closer through the combined effects of output by literary networks associated with Shaykh Dāwud al-Ṭātānī and steam technology.

We have argued that the efficacy of the hajj is both multifaceted and inter-related. Muslims from present-day Pattani might be motivated by more than the tropes of fulfilment, forgiveness, and merit, but these are the themes our mixture of ethnographic data, historiographical and
theological literature have brought into focus. In addition to identifying the range of efficacious activities, our multi-disciplinary approach also highlighted common controversies. We have argued that forgiveness is the only blessing of the hajj that individual pilgrims enjoy. Muslims from Pattani undertook this long journey for a range of reasons. Some performed the hajj as a proxy for the deceased. Similarly, it was not only the individual pilgrims who benefited from the multiplied merit made at any time in Makkah, during the holy month of Ramadan, or during the (much shorter) hajj. Righteous children (PM. Anok salleh) perceive themselves as being inextricably connected to their deceased parents, who automatically receive any and all merit generated by them—regardless of their size, and how they were generated. This aspect of the hajj brings into focus about the deeply communal nature of Islamic soteriology present in the wider Muslim World.
Endnotes

1. The abbreviations for the vernacular terms cited in this paper are as follows: Arabic (Ar.); PM. (Pattani Malay); Pr. (Persian); Th. (Thai); Standard Malay (SM.).

2. At the outset it is important to clarify that “Pattani” denotes both the province of present-day Thailand, and its provincial capital, while the toponym “Patani” specifically refers to one of the Malay Sultanates that existed before the nineteenth century when a series of Siamese administrative reforms transformed the political geography into the provinces of Satun, Songkhla, Pattani, Yala, and Narathiwat.

3. Joll resided in Pattani between mid-2000, and late-2010. In addition to slow, long-term participant observation, approximately 80 interviews were conducted with a range of informants he had developed sufficient rapport with. All interviewees resided within the municipal boundaries of this provincial capital.

4. In both the interest of focus, and due to limited space, it will not be possible here to explore the important role that Makkah has played in the activities of a range of Malay ethno-nationalist leaders and organisations since World War II. Readers interested in accounts of Tengku Mahmud Mahyidin contacts with Makkah during World War II should refer to Pitsuwan (1985, 95), and Wilson (1989, 376). Those wishing to explore Makkah as one of the Pattani United liberation Organisation (PULO) could begin with the following: Farouk (1984, 242, 249), Liow (2006, 30), Porath (2010, 591–92).

5. The limits of space mean that only the briefest of reference will be made to ‘umrah, the supererogatory “lesser” pilgrimage. Pilgrims from present-day Pattani perform this for a range of reasons, but we specifically explore differences and points of similarity between ‘umrah and the hajj. For more on ‘umrah in Pattani (see Joll 2011, 76–80, 84, 169–160).

6. Bradley’s conceptual contribution has been developed by the following scholars (Yahprung 2014 (Muhammad Ilyas Yahprung 2014)).

7. Approximately $4,000 USD.

8. Hua khamaen (Th. vote canvasser) perform a number of tasks for political parties before an election, and vary in seniority, but (as the title suggests) most fundamentally their primary task is to persuade locals to vote for their candidate. Although this might involve unethical practices such as vote-buying, this is not necessarily the case. For a discussion of hua khamaen in Thai political culture see Askew (2006, 185–207).

9. The Talbiyah: “Labbayk allāhumma labbayk. Labbayk lā sharīka laka labbayk. Inna al-ḥamda, wa al-ni’mata, laka wa al-mulk, lā sharīka laka”. This translates to: “Here I am O Allah (in response to your call), here I am. Here I am, you have no partner. Here I am. Verily all praise, grace and sovereignty belong to You. You have no partner”.

10. Rather than using the real names of those we have interviewed, we employed pseudonyms to assure confidentiality.


12. This symbolizes Hagar’s search for water for Ishmael that led to the discovery of the Zam Zam well.

13. Coinciding with the sacrifice made by pilgrims in Mina on the 10th of Dhū al-Hijjah is the celebration of the second annual Muslim festival of Hari Rayo hajji (PM.) (Ar. ‘Id al-adḥā).


15. This practice was mentioned by Patya (1974, 225).
16. The term netnography refers to qualitative research based on a range of open-source online data see Kozinets (2010).

17. For a list of the primary sources cited by Lange, see (2004 103) footnote 21

18. The best ethnographies of Ramadan are Buitelaar (1993) and Möller (2005).

19. Sarah Tobin (2016, 28) notes that the Prophet Muhammad having specified the night on which the first verses of the Quran were revealed, traditions assert that this is the 27th night of Ramaḍān. Interpretations of the Quran 97:3 claim that “Everything that happens” carries the “same power as if it were done 83.3 times”. In other words, “one prayer equals 83.3 prayers, one hour in the mosque equals 83.3 hours, and completing a reading of the Quran is the same as having done it 83.3 times”.

20. As stated above, all informants performed ʻtamattu’ ʻumrah in which ʻumrah and hajj are performed on two ihrams. In qira‘ ʻumrah, the hajj and ʻumrah are all done in one ihram, while in iftād hajj, the hajj is made without ʻumrah.

21. These “calculative approaches” to charity, in the “economy of thawāb or divine rewards” are also mentioned by Schielke (2012, 139) who argues that concerns for the “fine details of maximizing reward” that “privileges profit as a paradigmatic motivation and outcome of action”.

Bibliography


McDonnell, Mary Byrne. 1986. *The Conduct of Hajj from Malaysia and Its Socio-


Ngah, Mohamed Nor bin. 1982. Kitab Jawi: Islamic Thought of the Malay Muslim Scholars. Singapore: ISEAS.


Christopher Mark Joll, Muslim Studies Centre, Institute of Islamic Studies, Chulalongkorn University, Thailand; Religious Studies Program, School of Social and Cultural Studies, Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand. Email: cmjoll@gmail.com.

Srawut Aree, Muslim Studies Centre, Institute of Asian Studies, Chulalongkorn University, Thailand. Email: tfarida@hotmail.com.
Guidelines

Submission of Articles

Studia Islamika, published three times a year since 1994, is a bilingual (English and Arabic), peer-reviewed journal, and specializes in Indonesian Islamic studies in particular and Southeast Asian Islamic studies in general. The aim is to provide readers with a better understanding of Indonesia and Southeast Asia’s Muslim history and present developments through the publication of articles, research reports, and book reviews.

The journal invites scholars and experts working in all disciplines in the humanities and social sciences pertaining to Islam or Muslim societies. Articles should be original, research-based, unpublished and not under review for possible publication in other journals. All submitted papers are subject to review of the editors, editorial board, and blind reviewers. Submissions that violate our guidelines on formatting or length will be rejected without review.

Articles should be written in American English between approximately 10,000-15,000 words including text, all tables and figures, notes, references, and appendices intended for publication. All submission must include 150 words abstract and 5 keywords. Quotations, passages, and words in local or foreign languages should
be translated into English. *Studia Islamika* accepts only electronic submissions. All manuscripts should be sent in Ms. Word to: http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika.

All notes must appear in the text as citations. A citation usually requires only the last name of the author(s), year of publication, and (sometimes) page numbers. For example: (Hefner 2009a, 45; Geertz 1966, 114). Explanatory footnotes may be included but should not be used for simple citations. All works cited must appear in the reference list at the end of the article. In matter of bibliographical style, *Studia Islamika* follows the American Political Science Association (APSA) manual style, such as below:


Arabic romanization should be written as follows:

Letters: 'b, t, th, j, h, kb, d, db, r, z, sh, s, d, t, z, 'gh, f, q, l, m, n, b, w, y. Short vowels: a, i, u. long vowels: á, í, ú. Diphthongs: aw, ay. Tā marbūtā: t. Article: al-. For detail information on Arabic Romanization, please refer the transliteration system of the Library of Congress (LC) Guidelines.
Editorial Office:
STUDIA ISLAMIKA, Gedung Pusat Pengkajian Islam dan Masyarakat (PPIM) UIN Jakarta,
Phone: (62-21) 7423543, 7499272, Fax: (62-21) 7408633;
E-mail: studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id
Website: http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika

实训学术期刊（ISSN 0215-0492; E-ISSN: 2355-6145）

国际伊斯兰研究学会(PPIM)在印度尼西亚组建的中心，旨在进行伊斯兰教在印度尼西亚南方和东南亚的研究，旨在推进伊斯兰教的本土化和现代性。同时，它也鼓励学者们发表关于伊斯兰教的研究成果。

订阅价格：

国外订阅价：$52（订阅一次），$57（单期）

国内订阅价：$2（订阅一次），$5（单期）

订阅价不含邮寄费。

账号信息：

国外（美元）：PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, Indonesia
账号No. 101-00-0514550-1 (USD).

国内（卢比）：PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, Indonesia
账号No Rek: 128-00-0105080-3 (Rp).

订阅价不含邮寄费。

期刊被CrossRef和Scopus收录。


外文来源：

Editorial Office:
STUDIA ISLAMIKA, Gedung Pusat Pengkajian Islam dan Masyarakat (PPIM) UIN Jakarta,
Phone: (62-21) 7423543, 7499272, Fax: (62-21) 7408633;
E-mail: studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id
Website: http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika

מקהלת מדעית בינלאומית (ISSN 0215-0492; E-ISSN: 2355-6145)

מרכז לביקורת פוזיציון (PPIM) של אוניברסיטת אל ביאס באג'やה, אינדונזיה, המרכז ללימודים伊斯兰 ול委会伊斯兰社会。

ивания מדעית בינלאומית: פורום שרי האסלאם וקהילה (PPIM) של אוניברסיטת אל ביאס באג'やה, אינדונזיה, המרכז ללימודים伊斯兰 ול委会伊斯兰社会.

מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בין伊斯兰 מדעית בינלאומית: פורום שרי האסלאם וקהילה (PPIM) של אוניברסיטת אל ביאס באג'やה, אינדונזיה, המרכז ללימודים伊斯兰 ול委会伊斯兰 society.

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $52 (ฉบับ אחד), $57 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

/non included postage.

帐号资讯：

خارج إندونيسيا (دولار أمريكي)：
PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, Indonesia
账号No. 101-00-0514550-1 (USD).

داخل إندونيسيا (روبية)：
PPIM, Bank Mandiri KCP Tangerang Graha Karnos, Indonesia
No Rek: 128-00-0105080-3 (Rp).

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $52 (ฉบับ אחד), $57 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

비용 האшение שנה מחקרי מדע伊斯兰 בינלאומית: $2 (ฉบับ אחד), $5 (ฉบับ אחד)

/non included postage.
المجلة الإندونيسيّة للدراسات الإسلاميّة
السنة السابعة والعشرون، العدد 2020

رئيسي النشر:
أبرامتري آزرا

مدير النشر:
أومان فه الرحمان

منحة المحرر:
سيف مازال
جهري
ديبين شرمالدين
جاجات برغان الدين
فؤاد حلي
علي منصف
سيف الأم
داني دارماردي
جاجات جهيران
درو ناهد
إيوس نورنالانغي

مجلة النشر العربي:
محمد فرجي شهاب (جامعة شريف هداية الله الإسلامية الحكومية بجاكرتا)
مازيت نان فون لونسوين (جامعة أرني)
جوه أنار (جامعة واشنطن، سناتو ويس)
محمد حمادي حسن (جامعة الإسلامية العالمية – مالرية)
فكينا م. مكوري (جامعة أستراليا الحكومية كانبير)
إيدينين ك. ورباغا (جامعة كوبنهاجن، ألمانيا)
ورثور و. هيفينر (جامعة بوسطن)
ري ماي ميجيس (المركز القومي للبحث العلمي بفرنسا)
ر. ميكليل فينر (جامعة سيفاغارا الحكومية)
ميكانيك فينر (لاغان، جامعة فرشتين)
ميناكو ساكي (جامعة نيو ساوت وينتر)
ناثانييل ت. جاكي (أكاديمية البحث البريطاني)
شفراء المرزات (جامعة سوان كالجهاز الإسلامية الحكومية)

مساعد هيئة النشر:
تيسانيزو
محمد نداء فضلال
رغفا إمكا سافوزر
عبد الله مولاي

مراجع اللغة الإنجليزية:
بينس ج. فيدان
دايل فارنون
موسي بون

مراجع اللغة العربيّة:
توبياس أدي أساندي
أحمدي غمام

تصميم الغلاف:
س. بركا
سعودية إسلامياً
Images of Makkah and the Hajj in South Thailand: An Ethnographic and Theological Exploration

Christopher Mark Joll & Srawut Aree

Revitalizing Hadrami Authority: New Networks, Figures and Institutions among HJIUB in Indonesia

Syamud Rijal

Protecting Women from Domestic Violence: Islam, Family Law, and the State in Indonesia

Alfini

ISSN: 0215-0492

E-ISSN: 2355-6145